



Memorandum

Office of the City Clerk
Fax: 623-5468
Telephone: 625-2230

TO: Members of Council
FROM: Ms. K. Power, City Clerk
DATE: Tuesday, January 28, 2020
SUBJECT: **Additional Information – Committee of the Whole – Special Session (2020 Capital and Budget Meeting) January 29, 2020**

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE – SPECIAL SESSION

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION

1. Memorandum from Mr. N. Gale, City Manager, dated January 24, 2020 relative to 2020 Budget Revision Options.

*If you require an accessible version of the attached chart, please call the Office of the City Clerk at 625-2230.

2. Memorandum from Mr. C. Campbell, Manager – Central Support Division, dated January 24, 2020 relative to Eye on the Street – Program Comments.
3. Memorandum from Ms. M. Panizza, Director – Human Resources & Corporate Safety, dated January 27, 2020 relative to Current Vacancies.

/gs

MEMORANDUM

TO: Members of City Council
FROM: Norm Gale, City Manager
DATE: January 24, 2020
SUBJECT: 2020 Budget Revision Options

Further to Council's direction of January 14, 2020, this memo covers a list of options to reduce expenditures by \$2m (1%). The attached list is informed by these tenets:

- As much as practicable, reflect consideration of the phase one report on the program & services review;
- Can be reasonably achieved in 2020; and
- Include reductions in expenditure only, while excluding off-setting increased revenue, temporary reductions, capital spending, or drawing from reserves.

I advise Council that this list is:

- Presented with imperfect information due to timelines, e.g. in some cases labour relations and decommissioning implications are not perfectly understood;
- Inclusive of service level reductions, program alterations, and reduced staffing.

I approached several outside boards requesting that they contribute to the effort, and the responses are:

- Thunder Bay Police Services Board offered no reductions;
- Thunder Bay Public Library initially offered no reductions, but now will let me know if there are reductions on Monday, January 27, 2020. At that time, their decision will be communicated to Council;
- Thunder Bay Community Economic Development Commission withdrew its requested expansions (\$36,300); and
- Thunder Bay Community Auditorium was not asked to contribute because we are doing a joint review and due to annual deficits no real 2020 savings would be anticipated.

Though the program and service review flags other significant items for possible elimination, they are not included for consideration at this time as changes could not reasonably be achieved in 2020 and the review is ongoing. The Phase 2 report is expected in June 2020 and will identify options for future service level changes for Council's consideration.

The attached list is presented in three schedules to assist in Council's review:

Schedule One – Lower impact

This includes options based on updated year-end information, options with lower impact on public service and labour relations and that require little explanation.

Schedule Two – Medium impacts

Medium-level options include some service and labour relations impacts that require some explanation.

Schedule Three – Higher impacts

Options that impact public service, hours of service and labour relations.

City of Thunder Bay - 2020 Budget Revision Options

(000's)

SCH	Item #	Department	Division	Item	FTE	Impact/Risk (\$000)	Operating	Capital	RATE
1	1	City Manager & Development and Emergency Services		Administrative reductions (telecom, postage, printing, mileage, advertising, parking, reports, resource material)	-	Reduced flexibility	68.3		
1	2	City Manager	City Solicitor	Legal services reorganization	0.7	Reduction in legal external fees and insurance claims	190.0		
1	3	City Manager	City Council	Heritage Advisory Council - Travel/Sponsorship	-	A regional workshop with instructors from Heritage Resource Centre at UWO and Community Heritage Ontario would not be held. As well, a Heritage Advisory Committee member would be unable to attend the Ontario Heritage Conference with the Heritage Researcher. Sponsorship award would be discontinued.	2.7		
1	4	City Manager	City Council	Reduction - Councillor Budgets	-	Council budgets overall show a 5-year average consistently under budget. Suggestion to reduce each Councillor budget by \$500	6.0		
1	5	City Manager	Corporate Strategic Services	Civic Pride	-	5-year civic pride plan that culminated in 50th Anniversary activities would not be renewed.	50.0		
1	6	City Manager	City Clerk	Reduction- Committee budgets		Reduce contribution to Municipal Accessibility Advisory Committee to reflect actuals.	4.0		
1	7	Corporate Services & Long Term Care	Internal Audit & Continuous Improvement	2020 Municipal Benchmarking Network Canada Membership Fee	-	No longer part of the collaboration of Municipalities across Canada - staff time & work effort to gather data will be redirected to other priority projects.	18.9		
1	8	Corporate Services & Long Term Care	General Corporate Expenditures	Reduction of MPAC fees	-	Fee provided after proposed budget prepared	15.7		
1	9	Corporate Services & Long Term Care	Long Term Care	Part Time Meals on Wheels Assistant- Jasper Place	0.33	Vacant position- if eliminated coverage would be available from FT Admin Asst at Pioneer Ridge or Jasper.	16.7		
1	10	Corporate Services & Long Term Care	Long Term Care	Casual Administrative Assistant Position -Jasper Place	0.33	Vacant position- if eliminated coverage would be available from FT Admin Asst at Pioneer Ridge or Jasper.	22.3		
1	11	Corporate Services & Long Term Care	Long Term Care	Wages budget		Budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals.	25.0		
1	12	Development and Emergency Services	Thunder Bay Fire Rescue	Training Wages	-	Budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals.	85.0		
1	13	Development and Emergency Services	Thunder Bay Fire Rescue	Overtime	-	Budget adjusted to reflect anticipated needs in the near future.	88.8		
1	14	Development and Emergency Services	Thunder Bay Fire Rescue	Equip. Mtc. Radio and Repair	-	Budget will have to be increased over time as new radio warranty expires and infrastructure ages.	15.0		
1	15	Development and Emergency Services	Thunder Bay Fire Rescue	Benefits	-	Budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals.	75.0		
1	16	Development and Emergency Services	SNEMS	Oxygen	-	Recent changes to protocols have reduced oxygen use.	25.0		
1	17	Development and Emergency Services	SNEMS	Medications	-	Recent changes to purchase arrangements have reduced cost.	10.0		
1	18	Development and Emergency Services	SNEMS	Propane	-	Budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals.	9.0		
1	19	Community Services	Recreation, Culture and Municipal Child Care	Adjust tax supported Municipal Child Care budget	-	Budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals.	50.0		
1	20	Community Services	Corporate General Expenditure	Reduction of Community Youth and Culture Program funding - Project Grants	-	Program under-subscribed.	10.0		
1	21	Community Services	Community and Cultural Development	Reduction of Street/Event Development Grant funding	-	Program under-subscribed.	10.0		
1	22	Community Services	Recreation, Culture and Municipal Child Care	Reduction of Youth / Teens Program – building rental budget		Budget adjustment to reflect actuals.	15.0		
1	23	Outside Board	CEDC	Elimination of marketing and advertising/travel expansion	-		36.3		
TOTAL SCHEDULE 1 ITEMS (lower impact)					1.36		848.7	-	-

City of Thunder Bay - 2020 Budget Revision Options

(000's)

SCH	Item #	Department	Division	Item	FTE	Impact/Risk (\$000)	Operating	Capital	RATE
2	24	Corporate		Reduce 1.0 Management position through attrition	1.0	Reduced leadership capacity for units to be re-aligned	100.0		
2	25	City Manager	HRCS	Eliminate Corporate Pin program (recognition of 10, 20, 30, 40) years services)	-	May impact employee morale. Timing did not permit a formal survey. Informal survey commentary suggests that this may be the 'least' valued of employee recognition items.	4.0		
2	26	City Manager	City Council	Reduce Committee Food & Beverage Expenses		Savings are contingent on fewer meetings held over meal breaks.	7.0	-	
2	27	City Manager	Office of the City Clerk - Archives	Archives Summer Student	0.27	Hiring the summer student would be contingent upon successful Young Canada Works grants. If unsuccessful, capacity for projects will be reduced and staffing levels in summer for safety (minimum 2) would be at risk.	5.6		
2	28	City Manager	Corporate Strategic Services	Incident reporting	-	Reduce contribution to Incident Reporting to \$15.0 and refer to Anti-Racism & Respect Committee to consider adjustments to the program and/or partner contributions.	10.0		
2	29	City Manager	Corporate Strategic Services	Community based strategies	-	Reduce contribution to Food, Poverty Reduction and Age Friendly Strategies to \$25.0 each.	30.0		
2	30	City Manager	Corporate Strategic Services	Reduction to student hours for Crime Prevention Council and Drug Strategy	0.15	Shortening to 12 weeks will reduce benefits including community collaboration, events, clean up in areas such as South Core.	4.9		
2	31	Community Services	Transit	Accelerate Transit wage adjustment	-	Adjust Transit compensation budget to align with actual expenditures. Would reduce transfer to Transit Reserve Fund and potential to leverage external capital.	76.7		
2	32	Infrastructure & Operations	Parks	Convert Muskeg Express to static display	-	Savings are net of revenues. Any staff time saved on ride would be redeployed to provide interpretation services. Cost avoidance for any future work on equipment and rails.	4.8	-	
2	33	Infrastructure & Operations	Solid Waste	Rat Education		Cut program. Rely on Health Unit, existing materials and work done to date to ensure public is aware of risk and abatement measures.	5.0		
2	34	Infrastructure & Operations	Roads	Christmas Decorations	-	No decoration in the south core, Westfort business area and around city hall. Any decorations would be the responsibility of BIA or Business Associations. Does not impact Road Maintenance Objectives.	9.3		
TOTAL SCHEDULE 2 ITEMS (medium impact)					1.42		257.3	-	-

City of Thunder Bay - 2020 Budget Revision Options

(000's)

SCH	Item #	Department	Division	Item	FTE	Impact/Risk (\$000)	Operating	Capital	RATE
3	35	Infrastructure & Operations	Parks	Close 21 ha of parklands (10% of space maintained, excluding Chippewa, Centennial and Marina Park) This would be available to offset the cost of the Parks expansions in the 2020 budget.	1.0	Reduce by 2 staff in summer season. Consultation process required to identify areas and address anticipated resistance.	59.6	-	
3	36	Infrastructure & Operations	Parks	Chippewa Amusement Rides	1.5	Stop operating rides. Savings are direct costs for operators, net of budgeted revenues. Cost avoidance for future capital repairs. Direction will be required to address future operation of the Carousel.	2.7	50.0	
3	37	Infrastructure & Operations	Parks	Close Public Conservatory	1.5	Close exhibit area and turn down heat. Discontinue plant maintenance and divest as opportunities arise. Plants will be lost. Reduce staff hours currently dedicated to maintaining exhibit space, opening and closing the facility and help with public events. Savings include 50% of heating/facility costs for the complex and are net of current revenue and donation budgets. Balance of program will remain to grow, plant and maintain public gardens. Demolition costs would be required, but significant cost for rebuild and operation would be avoided.	157.2	-	
3	38	Infrastructure & Operations	CSD	Eye on the Street	-	Close down program. Impact on 2020 budget to be confirmed, but service contracts will require some payments to be made. <i>Police favour retaining the program. Further details will be provided in a memo from INOPS.</i>	133.8	48.8	
3	39	Infrastructure & Operations	Roads	Residential Road Plowing		Discontinue Residential Road Plowing on Sundays.	75.0	-	
3	40	Infrastructure & Operations	Roads	Residential Road Plowing		Discontinue Residential Road Plowing on Saturdays.	75.0	-	
3	41	Infrastructure & Operations	Roads	Residential Sidewalk Plowing		Discontinue Sidewalk Plowing on Sundays.	20.0		
3	42	Infrastructure & Operations	Roads	Residential Sidewalk Plowing		Discontinue Sidewalk Plowing on Saturdays.	20.0		
3	43	Infrastructure & Operations	Roads	Residential Lane Maintenance	0.2	Discontinue residential lane maintenance - residents in McKellar and Westfort would need to find alternatives to accessing properties from the rear. Does not impact Road Maintenance Objectives.	70.0		
3	44	Infrastructure & Operations	Roads	Downtown Sidewalk Cleaning	1.5	End the footpatroller program in the North and South cores. BIA's would have to address litter and waste bin collections on boulevards and sidewalks. Does not impact Road Maintenance Objectives.	162.5		
3	45	Community Services	Recreation, Culture and Municipal Child Care	Close John Jumbo Community Centre	-	Various community groups and City's Playgrounds Program will be negatively impacted. Demolition costs estimated at \$30.0 if not able to transfer ownership/lease to another group.	20.0	30.0	-
3	46	Boards	Various	City Manager request to Boards to identify savings		Unknown; pending responses.	100.0		
TOTAL SCHEDULE 3 ITEMS (higher impact)					5.7		895.8	68.8	-
Total FTE					8.48	TOTAL	2,001.8	68.8	-

Infrastructure & Operations

111 Syndicate Ave. S.
Thunder Bay, ON P7C 5K4
Phone 807-625-2266
Fax 807-625-3588

TO: Members of City Council

FROM: Charles Campbell, CPA, CGA, MPA
Manager, Central Support Division

DATE: January 24, 2020

SUBJECT: Eye on the Street – Program Comments

MEMORANDUM

This memo is in response to a request from council to have Administration provide an update on the Eye on the Street Program including alternatives and cancellation costs.

The Eye on the Street Program is a public surveillance program with cameras in the North and South core business areas. It was introduced in 2005 and has not had a major upgrade since initiation. Annual reports are provided to council on the program outcomes. The Eye program provides evidence and also triggers responses for both policing and medical issues. The proposed 2020 budget for the program includes an operating budget of \$133,800 and \$48,800 in capital in order to maintain and upgrade technology.

A review of existing agreements has been carried out. A little over 75% of the budget is for the monitoring and preparation of footage for police. The current agreement with the service provider (Apex Security) runs to October 2020. Any cuts prior to that date would have to be negotiated. Other costs for phone and data lines and supplies would only realize savings after closure. Existing camera infrastructure would need to be removed and decommissioned.

Alternatives to the Eye on the Street program may be available, although any involvement by the City will require that the system be in compliance with the Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act.

TBayTel is offering a private camera program for businesses, but their offering is in no way intended to replace the Eye. It will be available in a select portion of downtown Fort William. The cameras and recordings would be maintained in each individual participating business, not be part of a centralized operation.

When asked to comment on the Eye on the Street Program, the Thunder Bay Police response was:

We feel very strongly that the Eye on the Street program provides an important service in the area of public safety. Thunder Bay presents a number of challenges to police and other emergency responders given the geographic spread of the city which includes two urban cores. The TBPS has consistently turned to the Eye program during numerous investigations involving serious incidents. The quality of the present camera system does not meet the standards of quality that investigators expect. The current deployment of out dated camera technology seriously inhibits the program's full potential.

The tremendous innovations in surveillance technology since the program's original inception means that the Eye cameras can be efficiently renewed and the system can have even greater potential for future expansion to other areas of the city. The continuation of the Eye program also ensures that the management of the cameras and recorded images are in keeping with privacy expectations as set out by legislation and policy.

It is time to reinvest in the Eye on the Street program. The combination of live monitoring and advanced technology provides a real and leveraged approach to public safety for law enforcement and other emergency services.

A review of the hardware in the program was carried out in 2019 and a plan has been developed to modernize the existing system in consultation with TbayTel, our technical support provider. The cost of the replacement system is estimated at \$200,000. It is expected that the 2020 Capital envelope along with existing carry-forward funds would be sufficient to carry out the work with a few scope adjustments.

Sincerely,

Charles Campbell, CPA, CGA, MPA
Manager, Central Support Division



Memorandum

TO: Mayor & Council

FROM: Maureen Panizza, Director of Human Resources and Corporate Safety

DATE: January 27, 2020

SUBJECT: Current Vacancies

As requested during the January 14, 2020 budget meeting this memo provides information on the current number of vacancies.

As at January 24, 2020 there were 77 vacancies consisting of:

- 45 full-time vacancies and
- 32 casual, relief, part-time, temporary, vacancies

In addition to the above, the City also has postings open for extended periods (e.g. 6 months) to fill ongoing needs for relief staff in daycares, Pioneer Ridge (RPN's , PSW's), Jasper Place (Support Service Workers), Transit and in anticipation of summer relief for EMS.

These numbers do not include temporary vacancies to replace staff who are off work.

Thank you