



# **AGENDA MATERIAL**

## **COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE**

**MEETING DATE:**                      **WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 9, 2020**

**LOCATION:**                              **S. H. BLAKE MEMORIAL AUDITORIUM**  
    **(Council Chambers)**

**TIME:**                                      **7:00 PM**



**MEETING:** Committee of the Whole

**DATE:** Wednesday, December 9, 2020      *Reference No. COW - 16/52*

---

**OPEN SESSION in S.H. Blake Memorial Auditorium at 7:00 p.m.**

Committee of the Whole - Special Session (Program and Service Review)

Chair: Councillor M. Bentz

***DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST***

***CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA***

Confirmation of Agenda - December 9, 2020 - Committee of the Whole (Special Session - Program and Service Review) **(Page 3)**

WITH RESPECT to the December 9, 2020 Committee of the Whole meeting, we recommend that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.

***REPORTS OF MUNICIPAL OFFICERS***

**City of Thunder Bay Program and Service Review – Implementation**

Report R 144/2020 (City Manager's Office) recommending that Administration's recommendations be approved for action as detailed in this report. **(Pages 4 – 21)**

Correspondence from Mr. J. O'Neill, dated November 22, 2020 requesting to provide a deputation relative to the above noted. **(Pages 22 – 23)**

WITH RESPECT to Report R 144/2020 (City Manager's Office) we recommend that Administration's recommendations (Attachment A and B) be approved for action as detailed in this Report;

AND THAT the Implementation Plan for the 2019-2022 Strategic Plan, One City, Growing Together, be updated to incorporate Administration's recommendations for implementation;

AND THAT Administration report back prior to Budget 2022 on recommendations identified for further review;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

***ADJOURNMENT***



---

**MEETING DATE**     12/09/2020 (mm/dd/yyyy)

---

**SUBJECT**             Confirmation of Agenda

---

***SUMMARY***

Confirmation of Agenda - December 9, 2020 - Committee of the Whole (Special Session - Program and Service Review)

***RECOMMENDATION***

WITH RESPECT to the December 9, 2020 Committee of the Whole meeting, we recommend that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.

# Corporate Report

<b>DEPARTMENT/ DIVISION</b>	City Manager's Office	<b>REPORT NO.</b>	R 144/2020
<b>DATE PREPARED</b>	11/30/2020	<b>FILE NO.</b>	
<b>MEETING DATE</b>	12/09/2020 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
<b>SUBJECT</b>	City of Thunder Bay Program and Service Review – Implementation		

## **RECOMMENDATION**

WITH RESPECT to Report R 144/2020 (City Manager's Office) we recommend that Administration's recommendations (Attachment A and B) be approved for action as detailed in this Report;

AND THAT the Implementation Plan for the 2019-2022 Strategic Plan, One City, Growing Together, be updated to incorporate Administration's recommendations for implementation;

AND THAT Administration report back prior to Budget 2022 on recommendations identified for further review;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

## **LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN**

The 2019-2022 Strategic Plan includes a strategic priority related to a Program and Service Review (PSR). The City engaged Grant Thornton to conduct the third-party independent review. The purpose of the review was to gain further understanding of specific services provided by the City and provide information for Council and Administration to make informed strategic choices regarding those services. Responding to pressures for greater efficiency and effectiveness in service delivery, improved performance and sustainability, the PSR identified current services and their delivery, potential changes to delivery methods, and/or service levels, and recommended opportunities for improvement or cost-effectiveness.

## **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

As directed by City Council, Administration has reviewed the Grant Thornton Phase Two Final Report on the PSR and is presenting its recommendations and rationale in the following categories: 1) Implement, 2) Consider for Further Review, and 3) No Further Action (Attachment A and B). The recommendations include areas that were not examined by Grant

Thornton. Some of the areas for implementation are already underway or starting at the direction of the City Manager.

Administration recommends that the Implementation Plan of the 2019-2022 Strategic Plan be updated to reflect recommendations accepted for implementation as identified in this Report. Further, the Implementation Plan should be updated as reviews are completed resulting in further recommendations for implementation.

Future progress reports will provide status updates on implementation of actions resulting from the PSR. Updates on recommendations identified for further review will be brought to Council for consideration prior to Budget 2022.

## ***DISCUSSION***

Grant Thornton was selected to provide professional consulting services (Request for Proposal 34/2019) for a City PSR in two phases.

Phase One of the review, as well as reviewing at a high level all 146 programs and services, recommended key areas to review in Phase Two.

On June 22, 2020, Grant Thornton provided its Phase Two (Final) Report representing its in-depth review of the key areas with analysis of viable models and options.

Council held a special meeting in September to discuss the recommendations from Grant Thornton and passed a resolution asking Administration to review the Grant Thornton report to make recommendations for implementation.

### **Administration's Response**

Attachment A presents, at a glance, Administration's recommendations in the following categories: 1) Implement, 2) Consider for Further Review, and 3) No Further Action.

Attachment B provides a detailed response to each recommendation. The recommendations include areas that were not examined by Grant Thornton. Where Administration recommends Implement this refers to implementation of next steps as outlined in Attachment B. Administration recommends No Further Action on some of Grant Thornton's recommendations because action was already taken, Grant Thornton and Administration recommended status quo, and – in a few instances – Administration did not support Grant Thornton's recommendations. Rationale is provided in Attachment B.

Future progress reports on the City's Strategic Plan, starting in June 2021, will provide status updates on implementation of actions resulting from the PSR. Updates on recommendations identified for further review will be brought to Council for consideration prior to Budget 2022.

### **Other Initiatives Underway**

As they are undergoing separate and distinct strategic planning at this time, both Superior North Emergency Medical Services and Thunder Bay Fire Rescue are not included in this report. Other reports will be brought for Council's consideration soon.

Other service level work underway includes Transit Business Plan and the Licensing and Enforcement By-law Review.

As well, the Executive Management Team is considering recommendations from the Phase One report that Grant Thornton identified as "vital to executing change": including a structure to support change management, project management capacity, and controls (timelines, quality and budget) for strategic projects – all supported by an excellent communication protocol.

Further, Grant Thornton recommended a better alignment of tactical and operational decision-making with the objectives of Council, achieving internal focused improvements such as Digital and Human Resource Strategies, and improved reporting on performance metrics. Performance metrics associated with the Strategic Plan were identified after Grant Thornton issued its Phase Two Report in June. Performance metrics were included in the Implementation Plan for the 2019-2022 Strategic Plan, which was presented to Committee of the Whole on October 26, 2020. The second update on the Strategic Plan at June 2021 will include more reporting on performance metrics.

Finally, during their organizational design review, Grant Thornton found that a few divisions in the corporation could see improvements to their *span of leadership*. Span of leadership is a ratio: the number of subordinates reporting to a single manager. Again, the executive management team is reviewing these findings and we will adjust accordingly when necessary and seek authorization from Council for changes if necessary.

### **CONSULTATION**

Grant Thornton's engagement process included surveys in both phases, public open houses at City Hall in Phase One, and information and updates on the Get Involved section of the City's website ([www.thunderbay.ca/getinvolved](http://www.thunderbay.ca/getinvolved)) in both phases.

Subject to approval of the recommended process, the updated Implementation Plan to the 2019-2022 Strategic Plan, One City, Growing Together, will identify priority actions that include public engagement as part of their development.

### **FINANCIAL IMPLICATION**

The cost of the Program and Service Review was \$256,536 and submission was made to the Ministry of Municipal Affairs and Housing Audit and Accountability Fund to seek reimbursement of eligible costs from the Province for municipal reviews. A total of \$230,314 was received on April 6, 2020, under the Fund.

The financial impacts, both costs and savings associated with implementation of the PSR will be documented in progress updates on the strategic plan and as part of the annual budget process.

Applications will be made for funding to support PSR implementation as opportunities arise.

## ***CONCLUSION***

It is concluded that Administration's recommendations on implementation (Attachment A and B) be approved for implementation. It is further concluded that the Implementation Plan for the 2019-2022 Strategic Plan, One City, Growing Together, be updated to incorporate the recommendations accepted for implementation.

## ***BACKGROUND***

On June 24, 2019, a resolution was passed at Committee of the Whole to award RFP 34/2019 – Professional Consulting Services: City Program and Services Review to Grant Thornton LLP, at a cost of \$256,536 plus HST.

On March 11, 2019 a motion was passed at Committee of the Whole and ratified by City Council that directed the City Manager to report back with options for various scopes on a proposed organizational review.

On January 14, 2019 Committee of the Whole received a City Services Profile to assist City Council in decision-making on the 2019 Budget and as a first phase to discussion about the type of program review Council may select.

On December 2, 2019, Committee of the Whole received Corporate Report No. R. 181/2019 providing the Grant Thornton Phase One Report as a First Report. That Corporate Report was presented for consideration at Committee of the Whole on December 16, 2019, and Grant Thornton was directed to proceed with the Phase Two review as outlined in the Interim Report.

On June 22, 2020, Committee of the Whole received Corporate Report No. R. 79/2020 providing the Grant Thornton Phase Two Report. Committee passed a motion establishing a special Committee of the Whole, which was held September 24, 2020, to consider the Grant Thornton recommendations. At that meeting, COW passed the following resolution:

With respect to the City of Thunder Bay's PSR - Phase 2 report received by Grant Thornton, we recommend that Administration be directed to provide a report that offers an assessment of the recommendations that provides information on the financial impacts, associated timelines and the greatest value to residents, and information about potential implementation opportunities in the following areas:

- IT Modernization
- Human Resources & Corporate Safety
- Enhanced customer service initiatives
- Operational efficiencies



- Community partnerships
- Facilities rationalization
- Minimizing competition with existing private sector and non-profit organizations
- Service level reductions/enhancements
- Enhanced revenue generating opportunities
- Cost recovery policies for municipal programs, services and facilities

AND THAT this report identify required costs and expected savings/efficiencies as well as the timelines associated with the implementation of the recommendations;

AND THAT this report be received in advance of the 2021 Budget;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

The last detailed Core Services Review conducted by the Corporation was undertaken in 1999 in response to financial challenges created by reductions in Provincial transfers. The consulting services for that review were provided internally by the former Management Studies section, which is no longer in place.

***REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:***

Attachment A – *At a Glance:* Administration's Response to Grant Thornton Phase Two Final Report

Attachment B – Administration's Detailed Response to City Program and Service Review, Phase 2 Final Report, Grant Thornton

***PREPARED BY: KAREN LEWIS, DIRECTOR, CORPORATE STRATEGIC SERVICES***

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)  Norm Gale, City Manager	DATE:  December 1, 2020
---	-------------------------------

***At a Glance:***

**Administration's Response to Grant Thornton Phase Two Final Report**

See Attachment B for detailed responses

Implement*	
3, 4, 26, 27, 28, 29, 34	Update and Formalize <b>Fleet</b> Practices
5(a), (b), and (e), 6 (a), (b), (c), (d)	Review Specific <b>Facilities</b> for Possible Cost Reductions ( Water Pollution and Control Plant, Bare Point water treatment plant, City Hall, Archives, Victoriaville, Baggage Building Arts Centre, Pagoda)
13, 38	Evaluate <b>Sister Cities</b>
10	Renew <b>Conservatory</b>
14,16	Create <b>Digital Strategy</b>
15	Develop More <b>IT Performance Metrics</b>
18, 19, 20, 21, 23, 42	Create <b>Human Resource Strategy</b>
22	Continue Building out <b>Corporate Safety</b>
24	Develop <b>Facility Strategic Masterplan</b>
31	Develop <b>Strategy for Recreation Revenues</b>
35	Improve <b>Roads Communication and Consultation</b>
36	Expand Recyclables to <b>Increase Diversion Rate</b>
43	Review <b>LTC Supervisor Workload</b>
New	Modernize <b>Phone Systems</b>
New	Optimize <b>Office Space</b>

\*Implement refers to implementation of next steps as outlined in Attachment B

Consider for Further Review	
1	Recommendation to Discontinue <b>Private Child Care</b>
2	<b>Pioneer Ridge</b> Alternative Model of Care
5 (c), (d)	Specific <b>Facilities</b> Identified for Possible Cost Saving Opportunities* *Mountdale Yard. Balmoral Police Station
7 (b), (c), (d)	<b>Facilities</b> Identified for Possible Sale or Closure* *Jumbo Gardens Community Centre, Vale Community Centre lease, Boulevard Lake Beach
8 (a), (c)	<b>Facilities</b> Identified for Possible Service Level Adjustments* *Canada Games Complex, Chippewa Park
9	Recommendation to Reduce <b>Outdoor Rinks</b>
11	Recommendation to Close <b>Golf Courses</b>
12	Business Case for <b>Automated Water Meter Readers</b>
41	<b>Service Delivery Models</b> for Operations
45	<b>Water and Sewer</b> Operational Costs

No Further Action **	
7 (a)	<b>Port Arthur Stadium</b>
8 (b)	<b>Muskeg Express</b> Hours of Operation Already Adjusted
13	Dissolve <b>Sister Cities Committee</b> and transfer work to staff
17	Continue with <b>Software Update Plan</b>
25	Continue <b>Daycare Services</b>
32	Keep <b>North and South Divisions</b> Separate
33	Maintain <b>Campgrounds</b>
37	<b>Water Membrane</b> Maintenance.
39	Maintain <b>Retiree's Banquet</b> .
40	Alternative delivery for <b>Jasper Place</b> Supportive Housing
44	Delivery Model for <b>Daycare</b>

**\*\*No further action because:**

- Action already taken: (8(b), 17, 25
- Status quo is recommended by Grant Thornton and Administration: 32, 33, 37, 39
- Administration does not support Grant Thornton's recommendation: 7(a), 13, 40, 44

## Administration's Detailed Response to City Program and Service Review, Phase 2 Final Report, Grant Thornton

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
1	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture/Child Care Centres	Consider discontinuing City involvement of the Private Child Care Program.	The City is operating Private Home Child Care (PHCC) at 28% of licensed capacity. The financial incentive for the City to continue to administer and operate private home child care will no longer exist as funding for PHCC is adjusted to current service levels. There may be alternative service provider(s).	Pending a recovery of municipal child care from COVID-19 restrictions, Council may consider directing Administration to provide formal notice to TBDSSAB to discontinue the City's administration and delivery of PHCC.	Report to Council Q1 2022; subject to Council direction, a minimum of 60 days advance notice to TBDSSAB required to terminate City's involvement.	Minimal impact to tax-supported municipal child care budget.	Municipal PHCC currently has agreements with seven licensed providers that can accommodate up to 42 children. PHCC allows for some flexible care options for families such as evening/overnight care but this is at the discretion of the provider.		X	
2	Corporate Services & Long Term Care/Pioneer Ridge	A business case should be developed to implement an alternative model of care (following a model of care and compassion as opposed to treating by diagnosis) for Pioneer Ridge with an outline of investment required, qualitative impact for service delivery (for both residents and staff) and savings that could be realized.	The alternative model of care has proven to have a positive impact on both residents and staff. In the interim of the business case, we recommend finding opportunities to improve staff morale by providing recognition, incentives and to create a positive work culture which can be supported by Human Resources.	Implementing new models of care that focus on the individual requirements of the residents and more on meeting social need versus only the medical needs is being implemented in several Homes across the province.  Pioneer Ridge Administrator is a member of the AdvantAge Ontario Board of Directors that strongly advocates for alternative models of care.  The Long Term Care Commission will likely address some of these areas and it is anticipated new direction related to this recommendation may evolve and further need for changes will be introduced.	2021 Research and choose model of care, i.e. Butterfly Model.  2022 Present business case including financial implications for Council consideration through annual budget process.  Implementation of new model of care is researched to take between 3-5 years.	Implementing a new model of care will require up front financial investments: consulting fees, training and education and possible environmental changes.  Estimated 2022 budget required \$80,000-\$100,000.	Adopting a person-centered care model has demonstrated measurable results that have increased the quality of life for residents and staff. Benefits found in the Long Term Care Homes that have adopted new models of care include higher level of staff gratification, increase in staff morale, decrease in absenteeism, higher recruitment and retention, fewer resident incidents and higher customer satisfaction which all result in decreased long-term costs.		X	
3	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Fleet Services	Encourage proper maintenance of fleet by other divisions.	Review and reinforce existing policies and follow up of fleet maintenance are needed. Existing technology should be used to track specific staff who used vehicle, requirements to properly care for vehicles, and maintenance performed. Improvements in accounting for and reporting negative financial variances related to poor vehicle performance will be undertaken.	Fleet Service will institute a practice of reporting to the relevant General Manager on negative financial variances related to poor vehicle performance. This information will inform follow up action.	Establishment of regular reporting to relevant General Manager by Q1 2021.	Based on 2020 information, anticipated \$50,000 savings to fleet maintenance budget.	Lower fleet maintenance budget.	X		
4	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Fleet Services	Reduce collision occurrence through encouraging more responsible use of fleet (proper training, communication of best practices for operating fleet, etc.).	Work and progress have been made in this area since 2017 due to enhanced training, improved incident reporting, investigation, and follow through on recommended actions including progressive discipline. Still work to be done to reduce/eliminate preventable accidents. Potential research project in partnership with Lakehead University Centre for Safe Driving to confirm root causes, best practice and evidence-based response, nurturing and rewarding defensive driving, consideration of internal demerit points for preventable accidents, additional investments to improve/evaluate driver training, re-training/ education programs and invest in information technologies, continued engagement of senior leaders.	Many activities are ongoing: incident reporting; investigation; follow up; operator training and re-training; bi-monthly Commercial Vehicle Operator's Registration (CVOR) Management Meetings; safety talks; bi-annual reports to Executive Management Team (EMT).  Council direction as part of 2021 budget process for a Transit Trainer position to bring enhanced focus to recommending, developing, implementing and administering all safety and training programs to ensure compliance with Ministry of Transportation regulations, Occupational Health and Safety Act and City of Thunder Bay (CTB)/Thunder Bay Transit Operating Procedures.	Ongoing	An increase of \$41,300 has been included in 2021 proposed operating budget to support Transit Trainer position.  Potential budget to support Lakehead University Centre for Safe Driving Research Project to be confirmed pending finalization of project scope.	Ensuring that the City can continue to operate fleet to support delivery of services to residents.	X		

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
5 (a)	Infrastructure & Operations	Determine if there is opportunity to reduce the cost of the highest cost non-revenue generating facilities even though they are core facilities for the City:  Water Pollution and Control Plant	Environment regularly reviews preventative maintenance and capital renew programs with a focus on reducing energy consumption and Green House Gas emissions.	Ongoing through annual capital renewal.	Ongoing	Savings identified are included in annual budget.	Cost effective water services.	X		
5 (b)	Infrastructure & Operations	Determine if there is opportunity to reduce the cost of the highest cost non-revenue generating facilities even though they are core facilities for the City:  Bare Point water treatment plant	Environment regularly reviews preventative maintenance and capital renew programs with a focus on reducing energy consumption and Green House Gas emissions.	Ongoing through annual capital renewal.	Ongoing	Savings identified are included in annual budget.	Cost effective waste water services.	X		
5 (c)	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Facilities Services	Determine if there is opportunity to reduce the cost of the highest cost non-revenue generating facilities even though they are core facilities for the City:  Mountdale Yard	Asset Management regularly reviews current and new technologies through energy audits and preventative maintenance programs in the majority of tax supported facilities. Enhancements are built into our capital renewal plans. Monitoring of energy usage, maintenance performed, and capital planning is managed through software for a fully integrated facility/energy management plan.  The opportunity to consolidate existing separate structures at Mountdale and Front and Egan Works Yards and build a single vehicle storage/ maintenance /operations garage for long term cost efficiency could be investigated in the long term.	Consolidation of Mountdale/Front and Egan Works Yards: research and development of business case.	10 to 15 Years Report to Council - Business Case - Consolidation of Mountdale/Front and Egan Works Yards. Timing aligns with the end of life of the existing infrastructure.	Feasibility Study - To be determined	Efficient and effective service at best cost.		X	
5 (d)	Thunder Bay Police Service	Determine if there is opportunity to reduce the cost of the highest cost non-revenue generating facilities even though they are core facilities for the City:  Balmoral Police Station	Asset Management regularly reviews current and new technologies through energy audits and preventative maintenance programs in the majority of tax supported facilities. Enhancements are built into our capital renewal plans. Monitoring of energy usage, maintenance performed, and capital planning is managed through software for a fully integrated facility/energy management plan.  Balmoral Police Station is a 24 hour 365 day operation resulting in higher facility costs.  Planning for renewal/replacement of the Balmoral Police Station is underway.	Report to Council on exploration of alternative options to support Police Services.	Report to Council Q4 2020. Planning for Replacement/Renewal Balmoral Police Station	2022 Budget Implications	Information will be provided by the Police Services Board.		X	
5 (e)	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Facilities Services	Determine if there is opportunity to reduce the cost of the highest cost non-revenue generating facilities even though they are core facilities for the City:  City Hall	Asset Management regularly reviews current and new technologies through energy audits and preventative maintenance programs in the majority of tax supported facilities. Enhancements are built into our capital renewal plans. Monitoring of energy usage, maintenance performed, and capital planning is managed through software for a fully integrated facility/energy management plan.  There is an opportunity to reduce operating costs at City Hall based on a second generation completed audit for the facility. These initiatives will provide minimal financial savings. City Hall costs are reflective of there higher level of maintenance, security and cleaning for the facility. City Hall costs also reflect the operations and maintenance of the Civic Square.	Continue implementation of projects based on second generation audit.	Ongoing implementation of projects based on second generation audit City Hall as per available capital envelope	Accounted for in existing capital budget envelope.	Efficient and effective service at best cost.	X		
6 (a)	Office of the City Clerk/Archives	Facilities that can be candidates for cost reduction:  Archives: Costs \$102,000/annually. May be an opportunity to review data storage requirements to reduce the need to physically store data.	Cost savings will not be realized as there is a requirement to have centralized support to meet legislative regulations under the Municipal Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act related to Freedom of Information requests. A digitization strategy will avoid future capital and operating costs.	Implement multi-year electronic records management project.	2021-2024	Investments may avoid future costs.	Hundreds of research requests are completed annually at the Harry Kirk Archives and Records Centre which is open to the public Monday to Friday 8:30 am – 4:30 pm. – public access is an important consideration.	X		

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
6 (b)	Development & Emergency Services/Realty Services	Facilities that can be candidates for cost reduction:  VictoriaVile Mall/VictoriaVile Civic Centre: Both Costs \$581,000/annually- Out of scope but there is currently a review underway to determine if the mall should be kept, demolished or repurposed.	In October, Council selected the demolition of VictoriaVile as its preferred option.	Neighbourhood planning, project financing, and detailed construction design.	Construction 2023.	\$11M project cost offset by avoided capital costs and annual operating deficit.	Large majority of respondents support the demolition of VictoriaVile.	X		
6 (c)	Community Services/ Recreation and Culture	Facilities that can be candidates for cost reduction:  Baggage Building Arts Centres costs \$92,000/annually- can the purpose of the building be further expanded to an art hub or be used as a creative space etc. to increase utilization.	The Baggage Building Arts Centre has served as an arts/creative hub. During fall 2020, an Expression of Interest (EOI) inviting proponents interested in being a Head Operator and/or wanting to deliver programs consistent with the facility's arts/cultural mandate was conducted due to vacancy of Head Operator role in spring 2020. Pending clarification of results of EOI City staff will continue to operate the facility, similar to a community centre, permitting registered, rental and user group activities on a cost recovery basis.	Work with specific respondents to Expression of Interest to clarify proposals in respect of "Head Operator" as per alignment with facility's mandate, organizational capacity.	Update to City Council on Future Operation of Baggage Building Arts Centre Q3 2021.	To be determined.	BBAC provides valued programming, exhibition, retail and office space for the local cultural sector. It provides access to these programs and services for residents & visitors as well as acting as an unofficial tourism hub at Prince Arthur's Landing.  Based on 2018 annual stats: • 15,200 participants/visitors • 175 artist members • 20 partner organizations in programming/events • Use of space by 20 groups • Direct employment for 13 individuals and 9 youth volunteers	X		
6 (d)	Community Economic Development Commission/ Tourism	Facilities that can be candidates for cost reduction:  Pagoda Building: Costs \$34,000/annually- potential to expand its purpose, build on it being a tourist landmark etc. or re-purposed for something in the winter.	The Pagoda is owned by the City and operated by the Community Economic Development Commission's Tourism Thunder Bay.	Tourism Thunder Bay plans an increase in programming and animation into 2021 with extended operation hours and season. Tourism Thunder Bay is investigating new programming partnerships with area partners and BIA*	Starting in 2021. Multi-year enhancements to programming and partnerships to follow.	To be determined	The Pagoda is Canada's oldest continuously operating tourist information bureau. Constructed in 1909, the Pagoda is a designated heritage property and a National Historic Site. The Pagoda is a wayfinding anchor in the downtown and location in the revitalized waterfront that supports wayfinding to a growing number of area retail, attraction, event and accommodation partners." Visitor Centre staff in the pagoda specifically influence approximately \$3,750 per day during summer months in consumer spending by referring visitors to area attractions, culinary, accommodations and retailers	X		
7 (a)	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture	Sell or close underutilized facilities. These include:  Sell Port Arthur Stadium	Currently leased by a key tenant.	Opportunities to assign greater responsibility for the maintenance and renewal of the facility could be explored after the tenant post 2022 given commitments made by external funders to support capital improvements completed to host the U17 World Baseball Championships and to allow tenant to recover from pandemic.	2023	To be determined.	Port Arthur Stadium is home to the Bordercats and a legacy facility.			X
7 (b)	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture	Sell or close underutilized facilities. These include:  Sell Jumbo Gardens Community Centre	Clients could be accommodated at other community centres and/or alternative community space. A second option would be to investigate whether a key tenant is willing to enter into a lease for the facility and/or support operation.	Explore interest in key tenant in entering into lease for facility and/or assume greater responsibility for support of facility.	Opportunities to assign responsibility in 2021	Closure or transfer of responsibility would result in net \$30,000 savings (facility expenditures) annually.	Jumbo Gardens participant visits in 2019 were approx. 6,780.		X	
7 (c)	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture	Sell or close underutilized facilities. These include:  End lease with Vale Community Centre	Recommend City not renew lease.	Not renew lease when it expires, October 2023.	Notice non-renewal of lease 2022.	Vale Community Centre: net savings \$44,900 (based on proposed 2021 budget) plus 2022-23 inflationary increments and future capital renewal expenses.	Vale participant visits in 2019 were 10,606. (City's needs can be addressed through nearby Kinsmen Youth Centre.)		X	

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
7 (d)	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture	Sell or close underutilized facilities. These include:  Close and potentially repurpose Boulevard Lake Beach	Explore pros/cons of continued supervision of Boulevard Lake Beach as opposed to 'Swim at your own Risk' approach.	Report to Council Q3 2021 regarding pros/cons of discontinuing supervision	Report to Council Q3 2021.	Savings of \$55,500 associated with discontinued beach supervision at Boulevard Lake Beach.	Average attendance 2017-2019 during July - August was 5,736. 76% of respondents to the 2019 City of Thunder Bay Client Service Satisfaction Survey were very satisfied or satisfied with indoor pools/beaches (decrease of 5% from 2017).		X	
8 (a)	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture	Given the Council's priorities of reducing costs and current performance of the following facilities, we recommend:  Reviewing utilization rates and profitability of areas within the Canada Games Complex (CGC) and reduce service delivery in underutilized areas of the complex.	During COVID-19, reduced hours might already be implemented.  Reducing service delivery could be through reduced hours of operation or eliminating/ repurposing underutilized areas in the facilities.  Large facilities like CGC need a deeper review of various services provided at these facilities, the number of visitors and the fees collected to see if changes in certain areas can be made that could reduce overall costs.  An Indoor Aquatics and Fitness/Wellness - Business/Marketing Plan will be developed, exploring alternate uses of under-utilized space, operating hours, potential investments to retain, expand client base and revenue generation.  Reducing service delivery could be through reduced hours of operation or eliminating/repurposing underutilized areas in the facilities.	Business/Marketing Plan to explore alternate uses of space, i.e. sport medicine tenant or similar.	Grant Thornton (GT) Recommendation: 3+ Years	The net cost, tax supported of the Canada Games Complex anticipated in 2020 approved budget was \$2.35M (46% cost recovery; \$20.80 per sq. ft.).  The net cost, tax supported of the Churchill Indoor Pool anticipated in 2020 approved budget was \$572,500 (25% cost recovery; \$52 per sq. ft.).  The net cost, tax supported of the Volunteer Pool and Community Centre anticipate in 2020 approved budget was \$671,000 (32% cost recovery; \$30.60 per sq. ft.)	91% of respondents to the 2019 City of Thunder Bay Client Service Satisfaction Survey were very satisfied or satisfied with the Canada Games Complex (increase of 2% over 2017)  Estimated annual visits to the Canada Games Complex in 2019 exceeded 450,000.  76% of respondents to the 2019 City of Thunder Bay Client Service Satisfaction Survey were very satisfied or satisfied with indoor pools/beaches (decrease of 5% from 2017).  Estimated annual visits to the Churchill Pool in 2019 were 45,000; to the Volunteer Pool and Community Centre 65,000.		X	
8 (b)	Infrastructure & Operations / Parks & Open Spaces (Separated from #8-Rec & Culture)	Given the Council's priorities of reducing costs and current performance of the following facilities, we recommend:  Reduce hours of operation of Muskeg Express to reduce loss.	Muskeg Express hours have already been reduced to feasible minimum.	No action required.	GT Recommendation: 3+ Years	Net Cost/Revenue of Program (2019 Actual):  Total Cost \$11,400 Revenue \$4,042 Net Revenue (\$7,358)	The Muskeg Express provides a recreational activity for the Community and visitors of Centennial Park. It serves as a tourist attraction.			X
8 (c)	Infrastructure & Operations / Parks & Open Spaces (Separated from #8-Rec & Culture)	Given the Council's priorities of reducing costs and current performance of the following facilities, we recommend:  Close underutilized areas of Chippewa. There may be opportunity to naturalize park land to reduce maintenance costs (which is a major driver of costs).	Consultation with Fort William First Nation (FWFN) should occur with changes in the Park.	Review opportunities to naturalize areas within Chippewa Park, including the former wildlife exhibit, review usage numbers for closure or repurposing of any of the facilities/services. Continue discussions with FWFN on changes in the Park.	GT Recommendation: 3+ Years	Chippewa Park Total Net Operating Cost: \$708,000	Chippewa Park offers an opportunity for physical and recreational activity. The greenspace can be utilized by all demographics and physical capabilities.  Services include the campground, cabins, pavilion, dock, rides, Sandy Beach, and a large greenspace.		X	
9	Infrastructure & Operations / Parks & Open Spaces	Thunder Bay has a large number of outdoor rinks compared to other municipalities. There is opportunity to reduce number of skating rinks by at least 21% or 8 skating rinks.	Parks & Open Spaces presented a rink rationalization report (R127/2020) to Council on November 2, 2020, recommending to continue with the program in 2021 with no change. The report utilized community feedback obtained during the winter of 2020.	Administration will report back on the rink policy and any recommended changes at the completion of the 2021/2022 winter season with implementation in the 2022/2023 season.	GT Recommendation: 1-3 Years  Report back to Council- March/April, 2022	Cost to Operate: \$710,000	Outdoor rinks provide the Community opportunities for physical and recreational activity. All members of the Community can utilize with no user fee. Rinks can be utilized by all demographics. Outdoor rinks positively impact the quality of life in Thunder Bay, 90% very satisfied or somewhat satisfied with outdoor winter rinks (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).		X	



No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
10	Infrastructure & Operations / Parks & Open Spaces	The current model is not sustainable and is a cash drain to the City (Total Conservatory costs are \$622,000 with expenses split 50/50 between Parks Operations and Conservatory expenses). Given Council's objective of reducing expenditure and the financial performance of the Conservatory we recommend considering closing and divesting the Conservatory.	A report was presented to Council on October 5, 2020. Administration was directed to move forward with the Greenhouse replacement and provide a report on the Conservatory display renewal by June, 2021.	Complete design and tender greenhouse construction and design of display area.	GT Recommendation: 3+ Years Display Renewal Report-June, 2021	Net Cost of Program (2019 Actual): \$613,918	The Conservatory offers direct services to the public including leisure opportunities and event bookings. Operational services include production, installation, and maintenance of the plants and flowers utilize in City planting beds and parklands. The Conservatory positively impacts the quality of life in Thunder Bay for residents and tourists, of all demographics and physical capabilities. Deputants at the September 28, 2020 Special Committee of the Whole on Program and Service Review advocated for investment in the Conservatory.	X		
11	Infrastructure & Operations / Parks & Open Spaces	Given the financial performance of the golf courses, we recommend closing both golf courses.	Should golf courses close maintenance costs would still be \$300,000/annually	Parks & Open Spaces will provide information to Council on the performance of Golf operations before the 2021 season.	GT Recommendation: 1-3 Years Report to Council on 2020 performance: Prior to 2021 Season	Net Cost of Program (2019 Actual): \$510,000  A significant improvement to the performance of the Golf program is expected in 2020 and will be reported to Council.	Golf courses provide the Community an opportunity for physical and recreational activity, and social engagement. During the COVID-19 pandemic, golf was one of the few recreational activities with the ability to be offered in a safe manner. 85% very satisfied or somewhat satisfied with City-owned golf courses (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).		X	
12	Infrastructure & Operations / Water & Waste Water	Consider moving to automated water meter readers to gain operational and financial efficiency. We recommend conducting a deep-dive financial analysis including gathering a more defined quote for costing.	Financial impacts are unknown at this time.	Funds would be incorporated into the 2022 budget for Council consideration, to carry out a business case review.  Administration would then seek direction from Council on how to proceed, and make any necessary changes to the financial plan in 2023.	GT Recommendation: 3+ Years Direction from Council: 2022 for Business Case Review	GT has estimated the capital investment cost to be \$11M + \$1M in ancillary costs which need to be confirmed through a Business Case review.	Automated meter reading improves customer service and water billing accuracy. Citizen satisfaction remains highest for essential services like drinking water quality - 69% very satisfied (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey). The Thunder Bay Chamber of Commerce advocated in its deputation on September 28, 2020, for digitization of City operations starting with customer facing services such as Water.		X	
13	City Manager's Office/ Office of the City Clerk/ Sister Cities	Dissolve the Sisters Cities Committee and appoint one person as the main contact and planner. Reduce travel costs by leveraging technology.	Travel costs for 2021 have already been removed as a result of the COVID-19 pandemic. Technology is being utilized to manage relationships with Sister Cities. Collapsing the Committee and appointing one staff to manage will require an increase in complement and will result in a small decrease in budget. At a minimum a part time staff would be required to complete the associated work. Translation costs may also increase due to a lack of support from liaisons who provide translation services at no cost. Travel and shared visits to each Sister City on a rotational basis is a requirement of the Sister Cities Program developed by Sister Cities International.	Should Council seek to undertake this recommendation a review of costs associated with staffing this position and sourcing associated costs for translation services would be required.	A review could be completed if directed by mid year 2021.	Current impact to 2021 budget is a decrease of \$19,000 for travel associated with Sister Cities. Cost for a part time staff is estimated to be \$35,000 for management of this program.	The Sister Cities Program provides great value to the community from an economic impact perspective and a cultural focus. Partnerships with the Lakehead School Board and Lakehead University have been beneficial to the International Students Programs. Benefit from an educational perspective was also realized by City Administration, stakeholders and partners attending delegation visits to Sister Cities. Pre-covid, delegation visits would result in economic impacts valuing \$15,000 - \$50,000 per visit.			X

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
14	Corporate Services & Long Term Care/ Corporate Information Technology (CIT) (and across all departments)	Overall, Information Technology (IT) should be considered a strategic pillar to service delivery and internal processes. As such CTB should consider technology to be a core function and area for inclusion for any project/process being planned or implemented.	Initiated IT projects should be tied to projected ROI and then actual ROI measured to see if IT is optimized.  IT should be a part of groups such as cross-functional project teams or planning committees to inform divisions of how technology can tie into their activities/objectives.  Potential investment might be needed for each division to hire or expand roles of dedicated superusers.	CIT needs to be viewed as a strategic area not operational. EMT to stress importance of IT and the need to look at technology projects for process improvements & efficiency.  CIT should be consulted on all technology projects and have input into feasibility of project prior to decision to proceed. ROI determination needs to be joint effort between IT and Departments.  Review of IT resources outside of CIT should take place. Duplication of effort, IT infrastructure and spending may exist (as noted in the PSR (page 30)).  Current staffing levels within CIT do not allow for departmental business process expertise for all areas. Consideration should be given to including IT Business Analysts within CIT. Each IT Business Analyst would focus on one or two departments and become familiar with their business processes and applications in use. This would allow for continuous improvements to business process through the effective use of technology to meet business unit objectives.	2021-2022	To be determined once recommended actions are identified.	Improved operational efficiencies and focused IT investment with clear ROI targets.	X		
15	Corporate Services and Long Term Care/ Corporate Information Technology	Develop more CIT performance metrics to demonstrate progress and success and communicate them with relevant internal leaders.	Metrics could be measuring turnaround time to process work orders, number of software installations, number of training seminars conducted, etc. CIT should be able to provide appropriate service level agreements and turnaround times. Moreover, they can project corresponding ROI and evidence what is the industry standard and defend their ROI projection.	CIT is developing an intranet page to highlight key performance and progress metrics including # of Help Desk calls, # of IT requests, # of projects being worked on & work plan highlights. Information on how items are prioritized, typical turnaround times for various types of requests and what CIT can do for corporate clients will also be included.	2020-2021	Costs will be managed within existing budget.	Efficient and effective service at best cost.	X		

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
16	Corporate Services & Long Term Care/ Corporate Information Technology	The City should develop a comprehensive digital strategy that is connected to the overall City strategic plan and its objectives. The digital strategy should encompass all aspects of information technology in the City including use of technology, data handling and data security, schedule for updates, best practices on how to choose technology software, when and where to involve the CIT team on general and division level projects. The parameters of where CIT can help divisions and which areas divisions need to resource themselves should be outlined.	Strategy could tie to business outcomes (automation, savings, productivity, less duplication which can be tied to ROI projections). The digital strategy should be defined clearly and communicated to all divisions to improve understanding of what each division is responsible for. The communication of the digital strategy should include how technology will be used to achieve the goals of the corporate strategic plan. This will allow for proper staffing and budgeting at the division level in other departments.  A standard methodology should be created for divisions for choosing vendors, purchasing software, implementation and ongoing maintenance with a clear understanding of what CIT's leading role should be in said vendor selection/implementation processes.  Communication of the importance of IT can empower the CIT team to become more proactively involved in organization decision-making and play a more active role in transforming how both internal and external services are more efficiently delivered e.g., how to incorporate Smart City initiatives within various divisions. Development of a strategy might require investment (for an external consultant if needed and implementation).	Development of a comprehensive digital strategy. Scope of work for Request For Proposal (RFP) for consultant to assist with the development is currently underway.  Work with the successful consulting firm & all Departments and stakeholders to develop the digital strategy.  Once approved and funded, proceed with projects identified within the City of Thunder Bay Digital Strategy.	2021	Estimated cost \$80,000 - \$100,000. Application to Provincial Audit and Accountability Fund Intake #2 (Digital Modernization) will be submitted.  Costs associated with projects that result from development of the digital strategy will be brought forward beginning in the 2022 Capital and Operating Budgets.	Improved & expanded access to Online City Services.  Improved operational efficiencies.  Improved customer service and satisfaction.  The Thunder Bay Chamber of Commerce advocated in its deputation on September 28, 2020, for digitization of City operations starting with customer-facing services including Building & Planning, Water, Tax Collections & Parking.	X		
17	Corporate Services & Long Term Care/ Corporate Information Technology	A comprehensive plan to address software updates with regards to performance and security is essential.	The plan should outline when scheduled updates occur and should be communicated with all departments. Information should be shared online such as the main Intranet page.	CIT has a comprehensive work plan that is developed each year. This yearly plan addresses the recommendation provided by GT. No other action recommended.	Ongoing.	Costs will be managed within existing budget.	Improved operational efficiencies and service.			X
18	City Manager's Officer/ Human Resources & Corporate Safety (HRCS)	The overall City strategy needs to include how people (attracting, retaining, training, etc.) fits in with the overall values and corporate objectives of service delivery.	Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division proposes to obtain external support to assist in the development of a strategic Human Resources Plan and a deep dive assessment of the recruitment process.	Include cost of consultant to facilitate development of strategic Human Resources Plan for Council consideration in the 2021 budget.	GT Recommendation: 1 - 3 Years	Consultant fees to facilitate the strategic Human Resources Plan and recruitment process assessment: \$50,000	Aligns Corporate strategic goals with human resource capability to carry out the strategy, aiming to improve employee engagement, satisfaction and retention.	X		
19	City Manager's Officer/ Human Resources & Corporate Safety (HRCS)	Increase Human Resource (HR) department involvement in the recruitment process to redirect frontline supervisor time to service delivery e.g., HR should screen candidates and provide supervisors a shortlist of candidates for interviews.	Following the outcome of a deep dive assessment of the recruitment process, an additional junior resource may be required to support the recruitment process, including the development of additional recruitment tools and collaboration with hiring supervisors.	Tied to Recommendation 42, assessment of recruitment process.	GT Recommendation: 1 - 3 Years	Tied to Recommendation 42.	Improved operational efficiencies and service.	X		
20	City Manager's Officer/ Human Resources & Corporate Safety (HRCS)	Consider integrating HR databases as there are several platforms where data is shared and stored that hold information about different parts of the recruitment process e.g., There are three systems that are separate: iCIMS, Request to Hire is an internal system from CIT and TB 40 internal database.	Integration opportunities will be explored with Corporate Information Technology, ensuring that data quality is maintained.	Approach Corporate Information Technology to explore integration of Human Resource databases, after digital strategy has been addressed.	GT Recommendation: 1 - 3 Years	To be determined	Improved operational efficiencies and service.	X		
21	City Manager's Officer/ Human Resources & Corporate Safety (HRCS)	Leverage technology especially during the selection process such as using online screening filters, video interviews, etc.	Human Resources will develop protocols and training for supervisors on the use of technology in the selection process. Expanded use of technology may result in efficiencies in the selection process.	Continue to work with supervisors to utilize technology during the selection process, and develop tools, protocols and training to support the process.	2020-2021	To be determined	Improved operational efficiencies and service.	X		
22	City Manager's Officer/ Human Resources & Corporate Safety (HRCS)	Continue building out Corporate Safety capability.	Continue to build out capacity of the Corporate Safety section to demonstrate the City's safety performance and support the City's commitment to develop, implement, maintain and continually improve a documented Safety Management System (SMS).	Include for Council consideration in the 2021 budget.	2021	Annual cost of approximately \$90,000.	Support the City's commitment to maintaining a safe workplace.	X		

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
23	Corporate Services & Long Term Care/Pioneer Ridge	Continue streamlining recruitment and collaborating with the HR team to support with HR activities.	Following the outcome of a deep dive assessment of the recruitment process, a dedicated resource should be considered for Homes for the Aged to manage HR duties and reduce HR responsibilities for supervisors. Changes to HR model within this division will require careful coordination given that it would be a decentralized model.	HR and Pioneer Ridge Management team to review options for change to HR model.	2021-22	To be determined following review of proposed change to HR model.	Stable and productive workforce which in turn produce quality care and services.	X		
24	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Facilities Services	Develop a strategic masterplan for all facilities (similar to the 2017 Rec & Culture Fit Together report).	ON Regulation 588/17 requires all municipalities to develop an Asset Management Plan, including a financing strategy, to inform decisions to make appropriate investments at the right time to maintain, renew and/or develop municipal infrastructure. The Asset Management Plan work plan contemplates a strategic review of corporate buildings in 2023 for completion in 2024.	Strategic review of corporate buildings as part of Asset Management Plan. Update condition assessments, identify lifecycle costing, identify lifecycle financial gap, finalize service levels or provisions of service for facility grouping, seek public input, report to Council confirming sustainable funding needs and service levels.	2021-2024	To be determined following strategic review of corporate buildings.	The Thunder Bay Chamber of Commerce advocated in its deputation on September 28, 2020, for a Strategic Plan for Facilities with a clear strategy for public owned buildings and facilities.	X		
25	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture/ Child Care Centres	The City should continue offering daycare services given the current strengths of the program. However, there needs to be a change from the status quo given the size of waitlist for child care and the lack of expansion plans.	A significant review of municipal child care operations, with the exception of Private Home Child Care, was undertaken between 2013-2017 resulting in minor improvements (status quo) as informed through consultation.	Council direction required regarding investigation into potential expanded role for City in child care system.	To be confirmed based on Council direction.	The 2020 approved tax supported budget for municipal child care is \$849,700.	As a result of consultations conducted Fall 2017 as part of the Task Force on City-operated Child Care, involving a minimum 173 respondents, 55% expressed preference for the option of having the City continue to operate group child care at the existing 4 locations (Report 184/2017).			X
26	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Fleet Services	Develop clear process with regards to fleet acquisition including defining criteria for fleet purchases.	Determine and implement the appropriate level of accountability for fleet expansion. Fleet acquisition above current fleet standard should be identified as expansion along with the associated operating and maintenance requirements as part of annual budget process.	Fleet Services will review and update fleet acquisition procedures to deal with the approval/reporting process for fleet that exceed the current standard.	Complete by Q2 2021.	Potential capital savings related to fleet acquisition/expansion.	Efficient and effective service at best cost.	X		
27	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Fleet Services	There is a policy for idling (two (2) minutes with some exceptions) but there is low enforcement and compliance. The City should make reducing idling a priority across all relevant divisions.	There are cost savings with reduced idling as well as reduced pollution. However, cost savings reflected in independent review are grossly overstated. Technology exists to reflect potential instances of idling that are not aligned with City's noise/environmental objectives. However, additional resources may be required to extend application of technology, identify/report instances of potential non-compliance, investigate, and conduct follow up action. Reprimand for confirmed infractions could include assignment of internal demerit points.	Review and update Fleet Services Combustion Engine Idling Procedure (AH-100-07).  Seek EMT direction on establishment of a pilot project that utilizes existing technologies and installations to be used to identify instances of potential non-compliance with the City's existing anti-idling policy. Report to EMT on results and recommendations for future implementation.	Complete by Q3 2021.	Pilot would determine supervisory time required for monitoring, investigation and follow-up. Subject to the success of the pilot, the cost to extend GPS technology to rest of fleet would be \$45,000 one time capital and \$41,000 annual operating.	Reduced greenhouse gas emissions; improve air quality; reduced fuel expense.	X		
28	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Fleet Services	There is a take home fleet policy but needs to be revamped to have stricter restrictions as well as tighter supervision. This is necessary to reduce liability and cost for the City.	Policy review and update required, ensuring proper accountability and reporting.	Policy review and update.	Complete by Q4 2021.	To be determined	Reduced liability and cost avoidance	X		
29	Community Services/ Asset Management/ Fleet Services	Take underutilized fleet out of the fleet pool. The Fleet division should continue to leverage data effectively to help understand fleet utilization and demand.	Formalize procedure.	Identify fleet that appear to be non-compliant. Seek management direction on support for retaining.	Complete by Q4 2021.	To be determined	Cost avoidance to the City	X		
30	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture	Create policy that outlines what optimal x% cost recovery, the minimum social benefit and economic impact should be for each facility.	Related to User Fee Review (See Recommendation 31).							
31	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture	Continue user fee review exercise and continue developing strategy for recreational advertising.	Treat advertising in City recreation facilities as a separate item. Review/development of user fee policy commenced in 2018.	Report to Council	Q3 2021	User fees currently account for 70% of all Recreation and Culture revenues.	87% very satisfied or somewhat satisfied with recreation facilities (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).	X		

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
32	Infrastructure & Operations / Parks & Open Spaces	Do not consolidate the North and South divisions given there are cost benefits to keeping them separated (quicker deployment of fleet with faster service delivery for a sprawling City and the large number of facilities/parks that need to be serviced).	See 5 (c) above.	No action required.						X
33	Infrastructure & Operations / Parks & Open Spaces	Maintain number of campgrounds as operations are profitable.	Maintain campgrounds.	No action required.	Not Applicable	The direct costs of the Campground program are profitable, in a non-COVID setting.  Net Revenue (2019 Actual): \$37,500	The Campgrounds offer the Community and Tourists an opportunity for recreational and leisure activities. The close proximity to City amenities is desirable.			X
34	Infrastructure & Operations / Roads	Develop an updated specific roads-fleet asset management program where the cost of fleet is close to budgeted costs.	Conduct review.	In consultation with Fleet Services, Roads will confirm that the appropriate equipment is available when required and work to coordinate off-hours maintenance to assist in reducing the overall pieces of fleet required.	GT Recommendation: 1-3 Years  Roads to Consult with Fleet: Q2-2021	Fleet allocation of costs to Roads (2019 Actual): \$2.684M	The Roads Division provides critical maintenance to road infrastructure, to prioritize the health and safety of the Community.	X		
35	Infrastructure & Operations / Roads	Improve communication with public about roads. The City should have more frequent and effective consultations with public to understand what the public's specific concerns are regarding roads.	Consultation will follow the City's Public Engagement Framework.	Roads will work with Communications to develop and deliver an enhanced communication plan for 2021. The plan will communicate Roads service levels through various platforms (i.e. social media post highlighting street sweeping operations).	GT Recommendation: < 1 Year  Communication Plan: Q4-2020	Minor advertising costs are expected.	Increasing communication to the Public will enhance the understanding of the services and procedures in place. 25% very satisfied or somewhat satisfied with street maintenance (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).	X		
36	Infrastructure & Operations / Solid Waste & Recycling Services	The City should investigate increasing the diversion rate as the current performance is very low compared to other municipalities.	Continue promotion of expanded #1 and #2 plastics recyclable collection. Significant regulatory changes are underway in this sector.	Administration will report back to Council prior to the 2021 Budget on options around further expansion of recyclables  Evaluate integration of curbside organics program to meet the provincial mandated deadline of 2025.  Continue to work on transitioning existing provincial waste diversion programs to the new full producer responsibility framework, including the Blue Box Program to meet its program transition timeline between 2023 and 2025.  Seek out new investment to increase diversion.	GT Recommendation: 1-3 Years  Integration of Organics Program Options: Q4 2021  Report back to Council on Recycling Program Expansion Options: Q1/Q2 2021  Blue Box Transition: 2024  Full Organics Implementation: 2025	In the current model, there is limited financial benefit to the Corporation when increasing diversion. The benefit may be realized in 2024 when the Producer will be responsible for costs.  A significant financial investment into an organics program will be required prior to 2025.	Residents will be able to divert more waste from disposal.  Diversion extends the lifespan of the existing Solid Waste & Recycling facility site. Diversion promotes environmental stewardship across the Community. 72% very satisfied or somewhat satisfied with recycling (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).	X		
37	Infrastructure & Operations / Water & Waste Water	Continue status quo of using contractors for water membrane maintenance.	Continue status quo.	No action required.	Not Applicable	Contracting membrane maintenance has proven to be more cost effective.	Cost effective system maintenance. Citizen satisfaction remains highest for essential services like drinking water quality - 69% very satisfied and 94% when combined with somewhat satisfied (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).			X
38	City Manager's Office/ Office of the City Clerk/ Sister Cities	Set performance measures to understand the value of interacting and partnering with all five (5) Sister Cities.	This work has begun with the Sister Cities Advisory Committee and is a primary focus of the 2021 work.	A report will come to council relative to recommendations and evaluation of the value of partnerships with all currently established Sister Cities.	Mid 2021 for a report to Council.	There is no cost for this work at this time; existing budget will cover any incremental costs. There is likely increased economic benefit from existing and new relationships with Sister Cities.	Sister Cities provides great value to the community from an economic impact perspective and a cultural focus. Partnerships with the Lakehead School Board and Lakehead University have been beneficial to the International Students Programs.	X		

No.	Lead Department	Grant Thornton Recommendation	Departmental Implementation Considerations/Comments	Next Steps	Timelines	Financial	Value to the Community	Implement	Further Review	No Further Action
39	City Manager's Office/ Human Resources & Corporate Safety	Maintain the retiree's banquet.	The banquet has been maintained and moved to a virtual format in 2020.	No action required.	Ongoing.	Not Applicable	Consistent with being an employer of choice.			X
40	Corporate Services & Long Term Care/ Pioneer Ridge/ Jasper Place	Alternative delivery models (private vs. public model) could be considered in the long term for Jasper Place Supportive Housing Program to tackle high demand. Because this is a highly regulated area, we recommend conducting a separate review into delivery models if the City was interested in exploring other models such as external service providers.	Explore alternative delivery models in the long term. Given the current pandemic and the fact that it is compulsory for the City to deliver some level of service, following the status quo of the current delivery model can work for the next three years. There may be additional investment provided by the province due to COVID-19 which could increase home capacity but also improve quality of care which could negate the need to switch to another model.	No action required.	No timeline required.	Not Applicable	At the current rate of growth, Ontario's senior population is increasing by over 100,000 people every year. By continuing to provide programs that meet the needs of seniors, the City of Thunder Bay demonstrates support for independent, healthy, active and engaged lives for this vulnerable population.			X
41	Infrastructure & Operations / Solid Waste & Recycling Services	Based on our analysis a hybrid service delivery model – In house and contracted service is a potential model that could work for the City. Consider transitioning to an alternate service delivery models in a phased manner. In order to determine if an alternate model required, the City should consider the results of the current review of the day to day operations that can identify bottlenecks, inefficient cost drivers and other operational inefficiencies such as staffing of City resources. This can confirm opportunities for alternative models.	Considerations for change management must be considered for the feasibility of any modifications to the delivery model.	Management will continue to work with the Solid Waste Collection staff on improving the efficiency of the operation.  Administration will conduct a feasibility study of moving to automated collection for waste and consider integration of the organics program which will be required in 2025.	GT Recommendation: 3+ Years  Work with Staff: Ongoing  Feasibility Study: Begin in 2021	To be determined.	Cost effective waste collection services. Citizen satisfaction 92% very satisfied and somewhat satisfied for garbage collection (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).		X	
42	City Manager's Office/ Human Resources & Corporate Safety	Conduct a deep-dive assessment of the recruitment process to determine opportunities for processes to be eliminated or consolidated to make recruitment more streamlined.	Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division proposes to obtain external support to assist in the development of a strategic HR Plan and a deep dive assessment of the recruitment process.	Include cost to conduct a recruitment process assessment for Council consideration in the 2021 budget.	GT Recommendation: 1 - 3 Years	Consultant fees to facilitate the recruitment process assessment and HR strategy \$50,000	Improved operational efficiencies and service to internal and external users.	X		
43	Corporate Services & Long Term Care/ Pioneer Ridge	Supervisor workload needs to be vetted.	Given Homes for the Aged is heavily regulated, a further review is required to determine if supervisors have a heavy workload and whether additional staff is required.	Determine the tasks and responsibilities of each supervisor related to Human Resource functions and administrative requirement. Benchmark with similar facilities.	2021-2022	To be determined once recommended actions are identified.	Improved operational efficiencies, staff work/life balance and service for long term care residents	X		
44	Community Services/ Recreation & Culture/ Child Care Centres	The current delivery model of daycare (does include the Private Home Child Care program(PHCC)) works as it provides good quality and affordable service A separate review into viability of transferring services to a private entity from the City is needed given the size of the budget and sensitivity of dealing with a vulnerable population. In looking at this, timing and review should consider social needs, fiscal prudence and operational excellence.	A significant review of municipal child care operations, with the exception of PHCC, was undertaken between 2013-2017 resulting in minor improvements (status quo) as informed through consultation with clients. The transfer of responsibility for licensed child care currently operated by the City would be a TBDSSAB responsibility. As per our service agreement with the TBDSSAB, the City would need to provide minimum 60 days advance notice to the TBDSSAB should Council direct the termination of the City's delivery of municipal child care. A new provider may incur restrictions in respect of their assumption of responsibility for existing programs.	Council direction required regarding City's involvement in delivery of child care; a decision regarding transfer of services to a private sector entity would be a decision of TBDSSAB and new provider may incur some restrictions.	Not applicable	Not applicable	Licensed capacity of municipal child care in centres: approximately 272 children. Private Home Child Care Licensed Capacity: 25 licenses (up to 150 children, depending on age)			X
45	Infrastructure & Operations / Water & Waste Water	Consider a focused Water and Sewer services review of operations for opportunities to reduce operational costs	A review will require external support.	Include cost for Council consideration to conduct a review in the 2023 budget. This review is recommended to follow the Automated Meter Review.	GT Recommendation: 1-3 Years  Review: 2023	Net Operating Costs (excluding financing charges) for Water & Wastewater programs (2019 Actual):\$28.7M.  Net Revenue for Water & Wastewater Programs (2019 Actual): \$55.6M.	Cost effective water and wastewater services. Citizen satisfaction remains highest for essential services like drinking water quality - 69% very satisfied and 94% when combined with somewhat satisfied (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).80% satisfied or somewhat satisfied with storm water drainage (2019 Citizen Satisfaction Survey).		X	

Hello,

Please note the following response to Speak to City Council has been submitted at Sunday November 22nd 2020 7:18 PM with reference number 2020-11-22-371.

- **Please state what agenda item you would like to speak about:**  
Services Review- City golf courses
- **What are you requesting from Council?**  
other:
- **If other:**  
Spoke with Dana Earle regarding a disposition with council on behalf of the potential closure of City golf services. Was informed to register here, to which she believed would be December 21st 2020.
- **Have you already been in contact with City Administration in regards to the subject matter of your deputation request?**  
Yes
- **If yes, what was the outcome?**  
Redirected to here, from Dana Earle. She anticipated December 21st, however this could change.
- **Please select the date of the meeting:**  
Committee of the Whole - Monday, December 21st
- **First name:**  
Jacob
- **Last name:**  
O'Neill
- **Email:**  
joneill3@lakeheadu.ca
- **Phone:**  
(807) 627-4179
- **Organization you represent: (optional)**  
Guild of societies and clubs at Golf Thunder Bay

- **Please note the names of the presenters that will be attending with you:**  
Jacob O'Neill; Mary Ann Tuomi