



MEETING: Committee of the Whole

DATE: Wednesday, January 29, 2020

Reference No. COW – 14/51

OPEN SESSION in S.H. Blake Memorial Auditorium at 5:02 p.m.

Committee of the Whole - Special Session (2020 Capital and Operating Budget)

Chair: Councillor M. Bentz

PRESENT:

Mayor B. Mauro
Councillor A. Aiello
Councillor M. Bentz
Councillor S. Ch'ng
Councillor A. Foulds
Councillor C. Fraser
Councillor B. Hamilton
Councillor R. Johnson
Councillor B. McKinnon
Councillor K. Oliver
Councillor A. Ruberto
Councillor Peng You

OFFICIALS:

Ms. K. Power, City Clerk
Mr. N. Gale, City Manager
Ms. P. Robinet, City Solicitor
Ms. L. Evans, General Manager – Corporate Services & Long Term Care
Ms. K. Marshall, General Manager – Infrastructure & Operations
Ms. K. Robertson, General Manager – Community Services
Mr. M. Smith, General Manager – Development & Emergency Services
Ms. M. Panizza, Director – Human Resources & Corporate Safety
Ms. D. Paris, Director – Finance
Ms. L. Paradis, Manager – Budgets & Long-Term Planning
Ms. K. Cannon, Director – Revenue
Mr. D. Crupi, Manager – Internal Audit & Continuous Improvement
Mr. D. Munshaw, Manager – Supply Management
Ms. K. Dixon, Director – Engineering & Operations
Ms. M. Warywoda, Director – Environment Division
Mr. C. Campbell, Manager – Central Support Division
Mr. C. Halvorsen, Manager – Parks & Open Spaces
Mr. B. Adams, Manager – Roads Section
Mr. J. Sherband, Manager – Solid Waste & Recycling Services
Ms. L. Prentice, Manager – Community & Cultural Development
Mr. J. DePeuter, Manager – Realty Services
Ms. C. Olsen, Coordinator – Thunder Bay Drug Strategy

DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

Councillor A. Ruberto declared a conflict of interest relative to all items concerning CEDC as his son is employed there.

CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

Confirmation of Agenda - Committee of the Whole - Reconvened Special Session - January 29, 2020

MOVED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto
SECONDED BY: Councillor Andrew Foulds

With respect to the January 29, 2020 Committee of the Whole – Reconvened Special Session meeting, we recommend that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.

CARRIED

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Unfinished business from the January 22, 2020 Committee of the Whole - Special Session meeting.

REPORTS OF MUNICIPAL OFFICERS

Proposed 2020 Capital and Operating Budget

Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services & Long Term Care - Financial Services) relative to the proposed 2020 Capital and Operating Budget, was printed in the January 14, 2020 Committee of the Whole - Special Session agenda.

Memorandum from Ms. L. Paradis, Manager – Budgets & Long-Term Planning, dated December 20, 2019 attaching detailed agendas for January 14, 16, 22 and 29, 2020 meetings, 2020 Budget Community Handbook, 2020 Budget Executive Summary, 2020 Tax Supported Operating and Capital Budget, and 2020 Rate Supported Operating & Capital Budget was distributed separately on Monday, December 23, 2019.

Memorandum from Ms. K. Dixon, Director of Engineering & Operations, dated January 23, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 – Response – Engineering & Operations, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

Memorandum from Mr. M. Smith, General Manager – Development & Emergency Services, dated January 24, 2020 relative to The Parkades, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

Memorandum from Ms. L. Paradis, Manager – Budgets & Long-Term Planning, dated January 23, 2020 relative to 2020 Budget Amendments to date, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

Memorandum from Ms. K. Dixon, Director of Engineering & Operations, dated January 24, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 – Commuter Cycling Projects, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

Memorandum from Ms. K. Dixon, Director of Engineering & Operations, dated January 24, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 – Marina Park Pedestrian Overpass, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

Letter from Mr. J. Comuzzi – Waterfront BIA, dated January 22, 2020 relative to Marina Park Pedestrian Overpass, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

Memorandum from Mr. C. Campbell, Manager – Central Support Division, dated January 24, 2020 relative to Eye on the Street – Program Comments, distributed separately on Tuesday, January 28, 2020.

Memorandum from Ms. M. Panizza, Director – Human Resources & Corporate Safety, dated January 27, 2020 relative to Current Vacancies, distributed separately on Tuesday, January 28, 2020.

Memorandum from Mr. G. Broere, Director – Asset Management, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Council Request for Information – Material Line Item Trend Analysis, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

Letter received from Mr. T. Hurtig, Manager – Marketing, Communications & Development - Thunder Bay Community Auditorium, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Additional Information Requested by City Council, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

Memorandum from Ms. A. Morrison, Manager Central Support – Community Services, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Request for Budget Detail for Children and Youth Area, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

Memorandum from Mr. B. Loroff, Manager – Transit Services, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Request for Information on Transit Fare Strategy and Operating Impact of Electronic Fare Management System, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

CAPITAL AND OPERATING BUDGET REVIEW

TAB 4 - CORPORATE SERVICES & LONG TERM CARE

GENERAL CORPORATE REVENUE AND EXPENDITURES

OVERALL BUDGET REVIEW AND DISCUSSION

Amending Motion - Paving of Sycamore Crescent

Memorandum from Councillor S. Ch'ng, dated January 13, 2020 containing a motion relative to paving of Sycamore Crescent, represented, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Cody Fraser

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services & Long-Term Care – Financial Services) we recommend that the paving of Sycamore Crescent at the cost of \$580,000 be included in the 2020 Capital budget.

LOST

Amending Motion - 2020 Community, Youth & Cultural Funding Program Budget

Memorandum from Ms. L. Prentice, Manager – Community & Cultural Development, dated January 17, 2020 containing a recommendation relative to amendment of 2020 Community, Youth & Cultural Funding Program Budget, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Andrew Foulds
SECONDED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services and Long Term Care – Financial Services) Proposed 2020 Operating and Capital Budget we recommend that the tax supported budget be amended to provide a Community, Youth & Cultural Funding Program Operating Grant to the Lakehead Social Planning Council by adding \$30,000 gross and net;

AND THAT the Grant Review Team's 2021 Operating Grant recommendations not exceed \$170,000.

Amending Motion - 2020 Community, Youth & Cultural Funding Program Budget (2)

MOVED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson
SECONDED BY: Councillor Peng You

THAT the motion relative to the 2020 Community, Youth & Cultural Funding Program Budget be amended by adding the following paragraph:

"AND THAT the source of funding be the stabilization reserve fund."

LOST

Original Amending Motion - 2020 Community, Youth & Cultural Funding Program Budget

MOVED BY: Councillor Andrew Foulds
SECONDED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services and Long Term Care – Financial Services) Proposed 2020 Operating and Capital Budget we recommend that the tax supported budget be amended to provide a Community, Youth & Cultural Funding Program Operating Grant to the Lakehead Social Planning Council by adding \$30,000 gross and net;

AND THAT the Grant Review Team’s 2021 Operating Grant recommendations not exceed \$170,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Transit - Shields and Safety

Memorandum from Mayor B. Mauro, dated January 13, 2020 containing a motion relative to shields and associated safety equipment for transit buses, represented, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

Revised memorandum from Mayor B. Mauro, dated January 13, 2020 relative to shields and associated safety equipment for transit buses, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2019.

Memorandum from Ms. K. Robertson, General Manager – Community Services, dated January 14, 2020 relative to Operator Protective Shields – Conventional Buses, represented, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2019.

MOVED BY: Mayor Bill Mauro
SECONDED BY: Councillor Brian McKinnon

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services & Long-Term Care – Financial Services) we recommend, subsequent to the completion of the 6 month pilot project that would begin on or about March 30, 2020 or as soon as data is available that the Transit Division report back to City Council on or before July 27, 2020 with respect to the outcome of the pilot project relative to the installation of shields and associated safety equipment for transit buses;

AND THAT consideration be given at that time to moving this project forward in the 2020 budget year;

AND THAT if grant funding is not received, costs will be allocated from MTO Transit Capital Fund – \$143,164, Obligatory Dedicated gas tax (PGT) – \$200,000 and \$160,836 from the Capital Transit Reserve Fund.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Evergreen United Request for Funding

At the December 16, 2019 Committee of the Whole meeting, a resolution relative to the above noted was deferred to the 2020 Budget process.

Memorandum from Councillor S. Ch'ng, dated December 4, 2019 relative to Permission to allow deputation: Evergreen – A United Neighbourhood Funding Request for Evergreen Programing 2020, re-presented, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

Memorandum from Ms. K. Power, City Clerk, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Evergreen United Request for Funding, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto

With respect to the decrease in funding to Evergreen as a result of the discontinued Community Social Reinvestment Program from TBDSSB, we recommend that funding of \$20,000 be committed to Evergreen within the 2020 Proposed Budget;

AND THAT these dollars be in addition to funding approved by the Community, Youth and Cultural Funding Program;

AND THAT the \$20,000 of funding be allocated from the stabilization reserve fund;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

Amending Motion - Evergreen United Request for Funding (2)

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Cody Fraser

THAT the motion relative to Evergreen United Request for Funding be amended by replacing the third paragraph with the following:

“AND THAT the \$20,000 of funding be added to the 2020 Operating Budget for Community, Youth and Cultural Funding Program;”

CARRIED

Amended Amending Motion - Evergreen United Request for Funding

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto

With respect to the decrease in funding to Evergreen as a result of the discontinued Community Social Reinvestment Program from TBDSSB, we recommend that funding of \$20,000 be committed to Evergreen within the 2020 Proposed Budget;

AND THAT these dollars be in addition to funding approved by the Community, Youth and Cultural Funding Program;

AND THAT the \$20,000 of funding be added to the 2020 Operating Budget for Community, Youth and Cultural Funding Program;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Capital Projects

Memorandum from Ms. K. Dixon, Director of Engineering & Operations, dated January 27, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 – Capital Projects, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Brian McKinnon
SECONDED BY: Mayor Bill Mauro

With respect to the memorandum from Ms. K. Dixon, Director of Engineering & Operations, dated January 27, 2020, we recommend that \$1,106,000 be held in the Infrastructure & Operations Capital budget until Administration reports back relative to the Boulevard Lake Dam Rehabilitation Project and other associated work on or before March 2, 2020 Committee of the Whole meeting.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Budget 2020 - Vacancies

Memorandum from Mayor B. Mauro, dated January 29, 2020 containing a motion relative to the above-noted. Distributed separately on Monday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Mayor Bill Mauro
SECONDED BY: Councillor Brian McKinnon

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services & Long-Term Care – Financial Services) we recommend that hiring for all vacant positions in the City of Thunder Bay be suspended until receipt of the Phase 2 Program and Services Review;

AND THAT the City Manager be tasked with approval of any necessary hires and consider for each hire whether the position:

is required to achieve client to service ratios (i.e. Day Nurseries Act);
is required to ensure the City is compliant with other statutory or regulatory requirements;
is necessary to maintain CTB mandated operations service levels (i.e. emergency services, Pioneer Ridge, transit, etc);
receives 100% funding from external sources;
if left vacant would expose the City to significant potential loss or liability; and
is suitable for employees requiring temporary or permanent accommodation.

AND THAT the City Manager report back to City Council on the savings realized as a result of this course of action on or before June 29, 2020.

CARRIED

At the request of the Chair, Councillor A. Foulds assumed the Chair at 8:03 p.m.

Amending Motion - Transit Mechanics - 2 FTEs

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget – (Community Services - Fleet Services Division), we recommend that the proposed expansion of 2 FTE’s in Community Services (Transit mechanics) be eliminated in the 2020 budget;

AND THAT \$19,800 allocated to this expansion in the 2020 budget be reallocated to capital renewal and/or maintenance of city infrastructure.

Deferral Motion - Transit Mechanics - 2 FTEs

MOVED BY: Councillor Brian McKinnon
SECONDED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

THAT the amending motion relative to Transit Mechanics – 2 FTEs be deferred to the February 10, 2020 City Council meeting.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Parks - 1.1 FTEs

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget – (Infrastructure and Operations – Parks and Open Spaces), we recommend that the proposed expansion of 1.1 FTEs in Infrastructure and Operations (Parks) be eliminated in the 2020 budget;

AND THAT Administration be directed to report back to Council on or before April 30, 2020 with recommendations on how service levels in lesser used Parks can be altered to accommodate this reduction;

AND THAT \$59,600 allocated to this expansion be reallocated to renewal and/or maintenance of city infrastructure;

AND THAT administration report back on or before March 2, 2020 relative to projects that can be captured by these funds.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Roads - 0.7 FTE

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget – (Infrastructure and Operations), we recommend that the proposed expansion of 0.7 FTE in Infrastructure and Operations (Roads) be eliminated and that Administration be directed to report back to Council prior to budget ratification on net impacts on service levels city wide;

AND THAT \$40,100 allocated to this expansion be reallocated to renewal and/or maintenance of city infrastructure;

AND THAT administration report back on or before March 2, 2020 relative to projects that can be captured by these funds.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Travel and Training Budget

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that the proposed 2020 Travel and Training Budget totaling \$1 046 900 (as per the January 20, 2020 memo from L. Paradis, Manager, Budgets & Long Term Planning) be reduced by \$50, 000;

AND THAT these funds be reallocated to capital renewal and/or maintenance of city infrastructure;

AND THAT administration report back on or before March 2, 2020 relative to projects that can be captured by these funds.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Whalen Building

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget – (Community Services – Asset Management Division), we recommend that the proposed 2020 reserve fund contribution of \$351,600 allocated to the Whalen Building be reduced by \$50,000 and that these funds be reallocated to capital renewal and/or maintenance of public use assets owned by the City;

AND THAT administration report back on or before March 2, 2020 relative to projects that can be captured by these funds;

AND THAT Administration be directed to report back to Council on or before October 5, 2020 regarding options for potential divestment of the Whalen Office Building.

Amending Motion - Whalen Building (2)

MOVED BY: Mayor Bill Mauro
SECONDED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

THAT the motion relative to Whalen Building be amended by changing the reduction amount from \$50,000 to \$100,000.

CARRIED

Amended Amending Motion - Whalen Building

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget – (Community Services – Asset Management Division), we recommend that the proposed 2020 reserve fund contribution of \$351,600 allocated to the Whalen Building be reduced by \$100,000 and that these funds be reallocated to capital renewal and/or maintenance of public use assets owned by the City;

AND THAT administration report back on or before March 2, 2020 relative to projects that can be captured by these funds;

AND THAT Administration be directed to report back to Council on or before October 5, 2020 regarding options for potential divestment of the Whalen Office Building.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Thunder Bay Public Library

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget we recommend that the capital budget of \$731,600 for the Thunder Bay Public Library be reduced by \$50,000;

AND THAT \$50,000 be reallocated to the Community, Youth and Cultural Funding Program.

LOST

Amending Motion - Sister Cities

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

In accordance with the Phase 1 Program and Services Review, that the proposed 2020 budget for the Sister Cities committee be reduced by \$25,000;

AND THAT City Council cancel the existing program and refer the operation and oversight of this work to the Community Economic Development Commission for their consideration.

Amending Motion - Sister Cities (2)

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz

THAT the motion relative to Sister Cities be amended by adding the following paragraph after paragraph one:

“AND THAT the \$25,000 be used to fund the Community, Youth & Cultural Funding Program.”

LOST

Original Amending Motion - Sister Cities

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

In accordance with the Phase 1 Program and Services Review, that the proposed 2020 budget for the Sister Cities committee be reduced by \$25,000;

AND THAT City Council cancel the existing program and refer the operation and oversight of this work to the Community Economic Development Commission for their consideration.

LOST

Amending Motion - Annual Retirement Honorariums and Corporate Pins

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that in accordance with the Program and Services Review, Phase One findings, that costs associated with Honorariums relative to the annual Retirements be reduced by \$13,000;

AND THAT Line 25 - Eliminate Corporate Pin program (recognition of 10, 20, 30, 40) years services) at a cost of \$4,000 for long service pins in the list of reductions provided by Mr. N. Gale be approved;

AND THAT these funds be reallocated to the Community Services Department – Recreation & Culture - Community, Youth and Cultural Funding Program.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Committee Expenses - Meals

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Committee Expenses budget allocated to City Council, we recommend that Administration be directed to examine ways to reduce meal costs including scheduling meetings outside of meal times where possible, decreasing the volume of food ordered, simplifying menus and seeking efficiencies to reduce the \$32,000 meals budget;

AND THAT Administration report back to Council with options and recommendations on or before May 25, 2020.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options

Memorandum from Mr. N. Gale, City Manager, dated January 24, 2020 relative to 2020 Budget Revision Options, distributed separately on Tuesday, January 28, 2020.

Memorandum from Councillor M. Bentz, dated January 29, 2020 relative to Budget 2020 motions for consideration, distributed separately on Wednesday, January 29, 2020.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendations from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020 for a total reduction of \$644,100:

Schedule 1: 1, 4, 5, 8, 11, 12, 13, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 23

1. City Manager & Development and Emergency Services Administrative reductions (telecom, postage, printing, mileage, advertising, parking, reports, resource material)

Reduction of \$68,300

4. City Manager City Council Reduction - Councillor Budgets

Reduction of \$6,000

5. City Manager Corporate Strategic Services - Civic Pride Program would not be renewed

Reduction of \$50,000

8. Corporate Services & Long Term Care - General Corporate Expenditures Reduction of MPAC fees

Reduction of \$15,700

11. Corporate Services & Long Term Care - Long Term Care Wages budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals

Reduction \$25,000

12. Development and Emergency Services - Thunder Bay Fire Rescue Training Wages Budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals

Reduction \$85,000

13. Development and Emergency Services - Thunder Bay Fire Rescue Overtime - Budget adjusted to reflect anticipated needs in the near future

Reduction \$88,800

15. Development and Emergency Services - Thunder Bay Fire Rescue Benefits

Reduction \$75,000

16. Development and Emergency Services - SNEMS Oxygen - Recent changes to protocols have reduced oxygen use

Reduction \$25,000

17. Development and Emergency Services - SNEMS Medications - Recent changes to purchase arrangements have reduced cost

Reduction \$10,000

18. Development and Emergency Services - SNEMS Propane - Budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals

Reduction \$9,000

19. Community Services Recreation, Culture and Municipal Child Care - Adjust tax supported Municipal Child Care budget - Budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals

Reduction \$50,000

23. Outside Board CEDC Elimination of marketing and advertising/travel expansion

Reduction \$36,300

Schedule 2: 24

24. Corporate - Reduce 1.0 Management position through attrition

Reduction \$100,000

It was requested that each item be voted on separately.

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 1. Administrative Reductions

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz

SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

City Manager & Development and Emergency Services Administrative reduction of \$68,300 (telecom, postage, printing, mileage, advertising, parking, reports, resource material).

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 4. Reduction - Councillor Budgets

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz

SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24:

Schedule 1:

City Council – Councillor’s Budgets, reduction of \$6000.

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 4. Reduction - Councillor Budgets (2)

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch’ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton

THAT the motion relative to Reduction - Councillor Budgets be amended by replacing “reduction of \$6000” with “reduction of \$5000 from At Large Councillors’ budgets”.

LOST

Original Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 4. Reduction - Councillor Budgets

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration’s 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

City Council – Councillor’s Budgets, reduction of \$6000.

CARRIED

11:00 p.m. Resolution

During discussion of the above noted item, the following resolution was passed:

MOVED BY: Councillor Kristen Oliver
SECONDED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz

THAT the hour being 11:00 p.m., we continue with the business at hand.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 5. Civic Pride Program

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

City Manager - Corporate Strategic Services - Civic Pride Program not be renewed, reduction of \$50,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 8, 11, 12, 18 and 19

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendations from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

- 8. MPAC fees, reduction of \$15,700;
- 11. Long Term Care Wages budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals, reduction \$25,000;
- 12. Thunder Bay Fire Rescue Training Wages budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals, reduction of \$85,000;
- 18. SNEMS Propane - budget adjustment to reflect recent actuals, reduction of \$9000;
- 19. Recreation, Culture and Municipal Child Care - adjust tax supported Municipal Child Care budget to reflect recent actuals, reduction of \$50,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 13. Thunder Bay Fire Rescue Overtime Budget

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

Thunder Bay Fire Rescue Overtime - Budget adjusted to reflect anticipated needs in the near future, reduction of \$88,800.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 15. Thunder Bay Fire Rescue Benefits

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

Thunder Bay Fire Rescue Benefits, reduction \$75,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 16. SNEMS Oxygen

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

SNEMS Oxygen - recent changes to protocols have reduced oxygen use, reduction of \$25,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 17. SNEMS Medications

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

SNEMS Medications - recent changes to purchase arrangements have reduced cost, reduction of \$10,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 23. CEDC Marketing and Advertising/Travel

Councillor A. Ruberto declared a conflict of interest relative to the above noted as his son works for CEDC.

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

CEDC Elimination of marketing and advertising/travel expansion, reduction of \$36,300.

LOST

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 24. Reduce 1.0 Management Position Through Attrition

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

Reduce 1.0 Management position through attrition, reduction of \$100,000.

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 24. Reduce 1.0 Management Position Through Attrition (2)

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Cody Fraser

THAT the amending motion relative to 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 24. Reduce 1.0 Management Position Through Attrition, be amended by adding the following paragraph:

“AND THAT the \$100,000 be put into the General Capital Reserve Fund.”

LOST

Original Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 24. Reduce 1.0 Management Position Through Attrition

MOVED BY: Councillor Mark Bentz
SECONDED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 2:

Reduce 1.0 Management position through attrition, reduction of \$100,000.

CARRIED

At 11:45 p.m. Councillor M. Bentz resumed the Chair.

Amending Motion - Fuel Farm

MOVED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson
SECONDED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng

With Respect to the budget allocated to the upgrade of the fuel farm, we recommend that the funds allocated to this project be held until the outcome of the Program and Service Review on or before June 22, 2020;

AND THAT Administration report back on the feasibility of moving to one central fuel farm.

Amending Motion - Fuel Farm (2)

MOVED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton
SECONDED BY: Councillor Cody Fraser

THAT the amending motion relative to Fuel Farm be amended by deleting the following paragraph:

“AND THAT Administration report back on the feasibility of moving to one central fuel farm.”

CARRIED

Amended Amending Motion - Fuel Farm

MOVED BY: Councillor Rebecca Johnson
SECONDED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch’ng

With Respect to the budget allocated to the upgrade of the fuel farm, we recommend that the funds allocated to this project be held until the outcome of the Program and Service Review on or before June 22, 2020.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - MyTBay

MOVED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto
SECONDED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

With respect to the proposed Operation and Capital Budget we recommend that \$32,000 for costs associated with MyTBay be removed from the budget.

Deferral Motion - MyTBay

MOVED BY: Councillor Cody Fraser
SECONDED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch’ng

THAT the amending motion relative to MyTBay be deferred to the February 10, 2020 City Council meeting.

CARRIED

12:00 a.m. Resolution

During discussion of the above noted item, the following resolution was passed:

MOVED BY: Councillor Kristen Oliver
SECONDED BY: Councillor Peng You

THAT the hour being 12:00 a.m., we continue with the business at hand.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 2. Legal services reorganization

MOVED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton
SECONDED BY: Councillor Kristen Oliver

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

Legal services reorganization, reduction of \$190,000 for 0.7 FTE, reduction in legal external fees and insurance claims.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - Increase to the General Capital Reserve Fund for Approved Infrastructure Projects in 2020

Memorandum from Councillor S. Ch'ng, dated January 13, 2020 containing a motion relative to increasing to the General Capital Reserve Fund for approved infrastructure projects in 2020, represented, distributed separately on Monday, January 27, 2020.

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services & Long-Term Care – Financial Services) we recommend that \$515,000 be added to the General Capital Reserve Fund in 2020;

AND THAT Administration report back with additional recommended tax supported infrastructure projects for 2020 using these funds.

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services & Long-Term Care – Financial Services) we recommend that \$515,000 be added to the General Capital Reserve Fund in 2020;

AND THAT Administration report back with additional recommended tax supported infrastructure projects for 2020 using these funds.

Amending Motion - Increase to the General Capital Reserve Fund for Approved Infrastructure Projects in 2020 (2)

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Cody Fraser

THAT the motion relative to Increase to the General Capital Reserve Fund for Approved Infrastructure Projects in 2020 be amended by changing the amount from \$515,000 to \$265,300.

LOST

Original Amending Motion - Increase to the General Capital Reserve Fund for Approved Infrastructure Projects in 2020

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services & Long-Term Care – Financial Services) we recommend that \$515,000 be added to the General Capital Reserve Fund in 2020;

AND THAT Administration report back with additional recommended tax supported infrastructure projects for 2020 using these funds.

LOST

Review of 2020 Remaining Budget Revisions Options

MOVED BY: Mayor Bill Mauro
SECONDED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

With respect to the 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020, we recommend that City Council proceed with review of the remaining items on the list.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 6. Accessibility Advisory Committee

MOVED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton
SECONDED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

Reduce contribution to Municipal Accessibility Advisory Committee to reflect actuals, reduction of \$4,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 7. 2020 Municipal Benchmarking Network Canada Membership Fee

MOVED BY: Mayor Bill Mauro
SECONDED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

Remove 2020 Municipal Benchmarking Network Canada membership fee, reduction of \$18,900.

LOST

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 9 and 10 Long Term Care

MOVED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton
SECONDED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

9. Reduce 0.33 FTE – Part Time Meals on Wheels Assistant, Jasper Place, reduction of \$16,700;

10. Reduce 0.33 FTE – Casual Administrative Assistant, Jasper Place, reduction of \$22,300.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 14. Thunder Bay Fire Rescue MTC Radio and Repair

MOVED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton

SECONDED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

Reduce Thunder Bay Fire Rescue budget by \$15,000 for MTC radio and repair.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 20. Community, Youth and Culture Program and 21. Street/Event Development Grant funding

MOVED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello

SECONDED BY: Councillor Peng You

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

20. Reduction of Community, Youth and Culture Program funding – Project Grants, reduction of \$10,000;

21. Reduction of Street/Event Development Grant funding, reduction of \$10,000.

LOST

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 22. Youth/Teen Programs

MOVED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello
SECONDED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 1:

Reduction of Youth/Teen Program, building rental budget, reduction of \$15,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 28. Incident Reporting

MOVED BY: Councillor Peng You
SECONDED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 2:

Reduce incident reporting, reduction of \$10,000.

Deferral Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 28. Incident Reporting

MOVED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton
SECONDED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng

That the motion relative to Incident Reporting be deferred to the February 10, 2020 City Council meeting.

CARRIED

1:00 a.m. Resolution

During discussion of the above noted item, the following resolution was passed:

MOVED BY: Councillor Kristen Oliver
SECONDED BY: Councillor Peng You

THAT the hour being 1:00 a.m., we continue with the business at hand.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 31. Transit Wage Adjustment

MOVED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello
SECONDED BY: Councillor Brian Hamilton

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 2:

Adjust Transit compensation budget to align with actual expenditures, reduction of \$76,700.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 33. Rat Education Program

MOVED BY: Councillor Albert Aiello
SECONDED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto

With Respect to the Proposed 2020 Operating Budget, we recommend that City Council accept the following recommendation from Administration's 2020 Budget Revisions Options memorandum from Mr. Norm Gale dated January 24, 2020:

Schedule 2:

Eliminate rat education program, reduction of \$5,000.

CARRIED

Amending Motion - 2020 Budget Revisions Options - 38. Eye on the Street

MOVED BY: Councillor Aldo Ruberto
SECONDED BY: Councillor Peng You

With respect to the Eye on the Street Program, we recommend that Administration hold on any capital purchases aside from critical repairs until such time that a report on the future of this program can be received by Council on or before March 2, 2020.

CARRIED

Budget Report No. R 1/2020 Amended Resolution

Amended 2019 Budget Resolution

MOVED BY: Councillor Shelby Ch'ng
SECONDED BY: Councillor Cody Fraser

With respect to Report No. R 1/2020 (Corporate Services and Long Term Care - Financial Services), please find below an amended resolution detailing the amendments as approved by Committee of the Whole at the January 29, 2020 Special Committee of the Whole meeting.

AND THAT the 2020 General Municipal Tax Supported Operating Budget be approved at \$306,856,000 gross and \$236,530,800 net;

AND THAT the following Business Improvement Area levies be approved:

1. Waterfront District B.I.A. \$81,500
2. Victoria Avenue B.I.A. \$60,000;

AND THAT the 2020 General Municipal Tax Supported Capital Budget be approved at \$46,640,800 gross with financing as follows:

Capital Financed by the Tax Levy (before EIRP and Debenture)	14,055,400	
Enhanced Infrastructure Renewal Program (EIRP)	8,440,600	
Less Debenture Debt	<u>(7,284,400)</u>	
Net Capital Financed by the Tax Levy		\$15,211,600
Debenture Debt		\$7,284,400
Reserve & Reserve Funds:		
Capital Transit	295,900	
CIT	457,900	
Clean Green and Beautiful	320,000	
Corporate Energy Innovation	45,000	
Dedicated Gas Tax (Obligatory)	958,600	

EMS Facility	20,000	
EMS Vehicle & Equipment	915,000	
Federal Gas Tax (Obligatory)	6,547,100	
Fifty-Five Plus Centre Endowment	150,000	
Fuel Farm	20,000	
Ontario Community Infrastructure Fund (OCIF)	5,490,000	
Recreation Trails	39,500	
Renew Thunder Bay	400,000	
Whalen Building	<u>200,000</u>	\$15,859,000
Subsidy:		
Disaster Mitigation & Adaptation Funding	400,000	
Investing in Canada Infrastructure Program (ICIP) - Transit Stream	<u>6,328,000</u>	\$6,728,000
Other Sources:		
Recoveries and fees	1,429,000	
Other	<u>128,800</u>	<u>\$1,557,800</u>
Total 2020 Gross Tax Supported Capital Budget		<u>\$46,640,800</u>

AND THAT contributions to Capital reserve funds supported by the tax levy be approved at \$1,266,500;

AND THAT the 2020 Solid Waste (Landfill and Waste Diversion/Recycling) Operating Budget be approved at \$6,464,100 gross expenditure and \$1,255,400 net income, with a contribution to the Landfill reserve fund to result in \$0 net profit;

AND THAT the 2020 Solid Waste (Landfill) Capital Budget be approved at \$3,025,000 gross, with financing from the Landfill reserve fund (\$425,000) and debenture debt (\$2,600,000);

AND THAT the 2020 Wastewater Operating Budget be approved at \$14,105,200 gross expenditure and \$5,726,600 net income, with a contribution to the Sewer Rate reserve fund to result in \$0 net profit;

AND THAT the 2020 Wastewater Capital Budget be approved at \$8,761,800 gross, with financing from the Sewer Rate reserve fund (\$4,015,300), debenture debt (\$3,932,500) and Disaster Mitigation & Adaptation grant funding (\$814,000);

AND THAT the 2020 Waterworks Operating Budget be approved at \$19,494,300 gross expenditure and \$6,498,100 net income, with a contribution to the Waterworks reserve fund to result in \$0 net profit;

AND THAT the 2020 Waterworks Capital Budget be approved at \$10,503,000 gross, with financing from the Waterworks reserve fund (\$6,303,000) and debenture debt (\$4,200,000);

AND THAT the 2020 Prince Arthur's Landing – Boater Services Operating Budget be approved at \$312,900 gross expenditure and \$90,000 net income, with a contribution to the Marina (Boater Services) reserve fund to result in \$0 net profit;

AND THAT the 2020 Prince Arthur's Landing – Boater Services Capital Budget be approved at \$60,000 gross, with the Marina (Boater Services) reserve fund as the source of financing;

AND THAT Administration request a one time \$500,000 dividend from Thunder Bay Hydro Corporation;

AND THAT the following User Fee increases and new fees be approved;

1. Recreation & Culture – various user fee changes resulting in an average 2.0% increase;
2. Transit – fee increases to cash fares and adult monthly passes and reductions to family day passes;
3. Long Term Care and Senior Services – increases to meal fees and Jasper tenant fees;
4. Licensing & Enforcement – various user fee changes including signs, administration, and animal services fees;
5. Planning – various user fee changes for application fees, committee of adjustment fees and mapping fees;
6. Realty – various user fees changes for administration fees, annual fees, application fees, temporary land user and assignment of leases and street and lane closing applications;
7. Superior North Emergency Medical Services – ambulance documentation fee increased to \$50 from \$42;
8. Fire – various user fee changes for reports, inspections and re-inspections, firework permits, fire prevention presentations, safety plans, air bottle refills, false alarms, etc.;
9. Engineering – increases to seasonal and annual heavy/oversize load permits by \$5.00 and loading zone installation permits by \$10.00;
10. Parks – various campground fees, cabin rentals and admissions to increase by approximately 3%;
11. Parking Authority – parkade monthly rates will increase from \$59/month to \$60/month and surface lot monthly rates will increase from \$52/month to \$53/month, effective June 2020;
12. Parking Authority – hourly rate at meters will increase from \$1.25/hour to \$1.50/hour and hourly rate at parkades will increase from \$1.00/hour to \$1.25/hour.
13. Solid Waste – tonnage charge for loads over 130kg will increase by 3% from \$76.95 to \$79.26/tonne;
14. Waterworks fixed and volumetric charges to increase by 4% effective April 1, 2020;
15. Other Waterworks and Wastewater charges related to consumption and services to be increased by 4% effective April 1, 2020;
16. Wastewater surcharge to remain at 90% of water fixed and volumetric charges;
17. Prince Arthur's Landing – Boater Services fees to increase by 5% effective April 1, 2020;

AND THAT the “Additional Financial Disclosure Requirements Pursuant to Ontario Regulation 284/09” be received for information purposes;

AND THAT any necessary By-laws be presented to Council for ratification including By-laws related to user fee changes.

CARRIED

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 1:53 a.m.