

AGENDA MATERIAL

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

MEETING DATE: MONDAY, JUNE 14, 2021

LOCATION: S. H. BLAKE MEMORIAL AUDITORIUM (Council Chambers)

TIME: IMMEDIATELY FOLLOWING CITY COUNCIL (PUBLIC MEETING)



MEETING: Committee of the Whole

DATE: Monday June 14, 2021

Reference No. COW - 30/52

CLOSED SESSION in the McNaughton Room at 5:00 p.m.

Committee of the Whole - Closed Session Chair: Councillor A. Ruberto

OPEN SESSION in S.H. Blake Memorial Auditorium at 6:30 p.m.

Committee of the Whole - Planning Session Chair: Councillor A. Ruberto

DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

CONFIRMATION OF AGENDA

Confirmation of Agenda - June 14, 2021 - Committee of the Whole (Page 6)

With respect to the June 14, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting, we recommend that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.

PRESENTATIONS

PRO Kids Presentation

Memorandum from Ms. L. Prentice, Director – Recreation & Culture, dated May 20, 2021 requesting to provide a presentation relative to PRO Kids initiatives and how the service has adapted during the pandemic. (Pages 7-8)

DEPUTATIONS

Hydro One's Waasigan Transmission Line Project

Correspondence from Ms. E. Spitzer, Community Relations Advisor - Hydro One, dated May 12, 2021 requesting to provide a deputation relative to the above noted. (Pages 9 - 10)

REPORTS OF COMMITTEES

Parking Authority Board Minutes

Minutes of Meeting 04-2021 of the Parking Authority Board held on April 13, 2021, for information. (Pages 11 - 14)

Heritage Advisory Committee Minutes

Minutes of Meeting 04-2021 of the Heritage Advisory Committee held on April 22, 2021, for information. (Pages 15 - 20)

REPORTS OF MUNICIPAL OFFICERS

Amend Draft Plan of Subdivision - 3053/3125 20th Side Road

Report R 67/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Planning Services) recommending that the request by 1949339 Ontario Ltd. to extend draft plan approval (58T-17501) to June 30, 2024, be approved. (Pages 21 - 29)

WITH RESPECT to Report R 67/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Planning Services), we recommend draft plan approval (58T-17501) be extended to June 30, 2024, subject to the conditions outlined in Attachment "C" as it applies to Concession 3 NKR, Part of Lot 21 described as Parts 1 & 2 on RP 55R-7116 and Concession 3 NKR, South Part of Lot 2, 3053 and 3125 20th Side Road;

AND THAT any necessary By-laws be presented to City Council for ratification;

ALL as contained in Report No. R 67/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Planning Services), as submitted by the Development & Emergency Services Department.

New Emergency Vehicle Purchase

Report No. R 73/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Superior North EMS), recommending the purchase of five (5) new emergency vehicles be awarded to Crestline Coach Ltd. which submitted the successful proposal for the amount of \$796,883 plus HST. (Pages 30 - 32)

WITH RESPECT to Report R 73/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Superior North EMS), we recommend that the purchase of five new emergency vehicles be awarded to Crestline Coach Ltd. which submitted the successful proposal for the amount of \$796,883 plus HST;

AND THAT Crestline Coach Ltd. be the proponent to supply up to five more new emergency vehicles in 2022;

AND THAT the Manager-Supply Management be authorized to issue a purchase order to award this contract;

AND THAT the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to sign any necessary agreement related to the report;

AND THAT any necessary By-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

Work Plan for Superior North EMS 2021-2030 Master Plan

Report R 78/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Superior North EMS) recommending that the Superior North EMS 2021 to 2030 Master Plan (Attachment A) be accepted as a guiding document and that the work plan as attached, be approved. (Pages 33 - 132)

WITH RESPECT to Report R 78/2021 (Development & Emergency Services – Superior North EMS), we recommend that the Superior North EMS 2021 to 2030 Master Plan (Attachment A) be accepted as a guiding document;

AND THAT the work plan (Attachment B) be approved for Administration to follow;

AND THAT an update on progress on the work plan be presented not later than Q1 2022;

AND THAT Administration be authorized to proceed with negotiations with the Municipality of Shuniah:

AND THAT Administration begin implementing recommendations impacting service within the City of Thunder Bay with updates at key milestones.

AND THAT the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to execute all required documentation;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

Proposed Changes to Fireworks By-law

Report R 87/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Licensing & Enforcement) recommending a comprehensive update of the City's fireworks by-law as detailed in this Report. (Pages 133 - 137)

WITH RESPECT to Report R 87/2021 (Development & Emergency Services – Licensing & Enforcement), we recommend a comprehensive update of the City's fireworks by-law as outlined in this Report;

AND THAT the current by-law, as amended, be repealed and replaced and be presented to Council for ratification on or before October 31, 2021.

Multi-Use Indoor Sports Facility - Expression of Interest

Report R 85/2021 (Community Services) recommending a proposed Expression of Interest process to solicit proposals from the private sector and other organizations regarding potential facility

solutions for a proposed multi-use indoor sports (turf) facility in a manner that is consistent with the City's Supply Management By-law No. 113-2011 including proposed activities and timelines. (Pages 138 - 143)

WITH RESPECT to Report R 85/2021 (Community Services), we recommend that Council direct Administration to administer an Expression of Interest, as described in this report, inviting proposals from the private sector and other interested organizations for a Multi-use Indoor Sports Facility to respond to both short and long term needs, either at Chapples Park or other locations;

AND THAT Administration report back on the status and outcome of the Expression of Interest by November 30, 2021

AND THAT the report include recommendations or options for Council's consideration;

AND THAT any necessary By-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

2020 Employment Equity Report

Report R 77/2021 (City Manager's Office - Human Resources & Corporate Safety) recommending that City Council direct Administration, through the Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division, to continue to support and promote equal opportunities for employment through current and new initiatives as highlighted in the attached Employment Outreach and Retention Plan. (Pages 144 – 171)

WITH RESPECT to Report R 77/2021 (City Manager's Office - Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division), we recommend City Council direct Administration, through the Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division, to continue to support and promote equal opportunities for employment through current and new initiatives as highlighted in the attached Employment Outreach and Retention Plan;

AND THAT the Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division (HRCS) conduct an Employment Equity Survey in 2023, and report the result back to Committee of the Whole in the second quarter of 2024;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to Council for ratification.

Waterfront Trail Long Term Plan

Report R 75/2021 (Infrastructure & Operations - Engineering & Operations) providing an update on the waterfront trail long term plan, for information. (Pages 172 - 183)

Memorandum from Ms. K. Dixon, Director - Engineering & Operations, dated June 2, 2021 requesting to provide a presentation along with Mr. W. Schwar, Supervisor-Parks & Open Space Planning and Mr. G. Walter, Landscape Architect, relative to the above noted. (Page 184)

Waterfront Development Committee - Terms of Reference

Report R 90/2021 (Infrastructure & Operations) presenting the Terms of Reference for the Waterfront Development Committee, as appended to this Report as Attachment A, for information. (Pages 185 - 195)

Contract 9, 2021- Sewer and Watermain III

Report R 70/2021 (Infrastructure & Operations - Engineering & Operations) recommending that Contract 9, 2021 Sewer and Watermain III be awarded to Menei Brothers Contracting, who submitted the lowest tender in the amount of \$2,581,811.57 (inclusive of HST). (Pages 196 – 198)

WITH RESPECT to Report R 70/2021 (Infrastructure & Operations – Engineering & Operations), we recommend that Contract 9, 2021 - Sewer and Watermain III be awarded to Menei Brothers Contracting, which submitted the lowest tender in the amount of \$2,581,811.57 (inclusive of HST); it being noted that the amount shown is based on estimated quantities; final payment for this Contract will be based on measured quantities for the complete work;

AND THAT the General Manager of Infrastructure and Operations report significant variations in the Contract quantities to City Council;

AND THAT the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to sign all documentation related to this matter;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

Contract 12, 2021- Solid Waste and Recycling Facility-Phase II Leachate Collection System Extension

Report R 86/2021 (Infrastructure & Operations - Engineering) relative to the above noted. (Distributed Separately)

PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS

Report on the Feasibility of Selling the Parkades

Memorandum from Mr. J. DePeuter, Manager - Realty Services and Mr. J. Paske, Supervisor – Parking Authority, dated June 2, 2021 advising that the above noted report is being postponed to the July 26, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting. (Pages 200 - 201)

NEW BUSINESS

ADJOURNMENT



MEETING DATE 06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)

SUBJECT Confirmation of Agenda

SUMMARY

Confirmation of Agenda - June 14, 2021 - Committee of the Whole

RECOMMENDATION

With respect to the June 14, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting, we recommend that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.



MEETING DATE 06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)

SUBJECT PRO Kids Presentation

SUMMARY

Memorandum from Ms. L. Prentice, Director – Recreation & Culture, dated May 20, 2021 requesting to provide a presentation relative to PRO Kids initiatives and how the service has adapted during the pandemic.

ATTACHMENTS

1 L Prentice memo dated May 20 2021



Memorandum

то:	Krista Power City Clerk
FROM:	Leah Prentice Director – Recreation & Culture
DATE:	May 20, 2021
SUBJECT:	PRO Kids Presentation to Council – June 7, 2021 COW

Kathy Ball (Chair) and Joshua Swarengen of the PRO Kids Board of Directors respectfully request the opportunity to make a presentation at the June 7, 2021 meeting of Committee of the Whole.

The presentation will provide information to City Council regarding PRO Kids initiatives this June during Recreation and Parks Month and information about how the service has adapted during the pandemic.

A memorandum regarding Recreation & Parks Month will be brought forward by Recreation & Culture and Parks & Open Spaces to the June 7th Committee of the Whole meeting.

Thank you,

Leah Prentice Director – Recreation & Culture

cc: Kelly Robertson – General Manager - Community Services Paul Burke – Sport & Community Development Supervisor



MEETING DATE 06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)

SUBJECT Hydro One's Waasigan Transmission Line Project

SUMMARY

Correspondence from Ms. E. Spitzer, Community Relations Advisor - Hydro One, dated May 12, 2021 requesting to provide a deputation relative to the above noted.

ATTACHMENTS

1 E Spitzer correspondence dated May 12 2021

Hello,

Please note the following response to Speak to City Council has been submitted at Wednesday May 12th 2021 1:15 PM with reference number 2021-05-12-479.

- If you would like to speak to City Council about another topic not associated with an agenda item, please state topic here (if applicable): Hydro One's Waasigan Transmission Line project
- What are you requesting from Council? other:
- If other: We are requesting to provide a presentation of a project update on Hydro One's Waasigan Transmission line, which once built will bring more power to northwestern Ontario.
- Have you already been in contact with City Administration in regards to the subject matter of your deputation request? Yes
- If yes, what was the outcome? Krista Power advised to submit a deputation request
- Please select the date of the meeting: Committee of the Whole - Monday, June 7th
- First name: Emily
- Last name: Spitzer
- Email: emily.spitzer@hydroone.com
- **Phone:** (416) 587-3807
- Organization you represent: (optional) Hydro One
- Please note the names of the presenters that will be attending with you: Daniel Levitan, VP Stakeholder Relations, Steven Mantifel (Sr. Manager) & Stephanie Hodsoll (Advisor) Community Relations



MEETING DATE 06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)

SUBJECT Parking Authority Board Minutes

SUMMARY

Minutes of Meeting 04-2021 of the Parking Authority Board held on April 13, 2021, for information.

ATTACHMENTS

1 PAB minutes April 13 2021



Minutes of Meeting

MEETING #: DATE: TIME: PLACE: CHAIR:	04 April 13, 2021 10:00 AM MS Teams Chris Krumpholz, Member
ATTENDEES:	Frances Larizza, Member (teleconference) Brian Hamilton, Member Jonathan Paske, Supervisor – Parking Authority Doug Vincent, Manager – Licensing & Enforcement Kara Pratt – Waterfront BIA Representative
REGRETS :	Leslie McEachern, Acting GM – Development & Emergency Services

1. Confirmation of Agenda

Moved by Frances Larizza, seconded by Chris Krumpholz.

"With respect to the April 13, 2021 Parking Authority Board meeting, it is recommended that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed."

CARRIED

2. Minutes of March 9, 2021 Meeting

Moved by Frances Larizza, seconded by Chris Krumpholz.

"That the minutes of the Parking Authority Board meeting held March 9, 2021 be approved."

CARRIED

3. Outstanding Items

The RFP for Parking Management Solutions (mobile parking purchase, ticket management system, and online payments) is in progress. Legal Services has reviewed the agreement and will submit a red-line copy to Parking Authority today.

Page **2** of **3** Minutes of April 13, 2021 Meeting

Discussions with Engineering regarding a cost recovery strategy for when the department closes a street and removes meters from Parking Authority's ability to generate revenue are in progress.

4. Financial Statement

The financial statement indicates revenues are approximately 13% (\$271,900) below budget due to continued lockdowns to-date because of COVID. When the budget was created it was anticipated workplaces would be more open in 2021 and there would be a 20% reduction in revenues because of COVID, however the lockdowns have had a larger effect on revenues.

5. Waterfront Parkade Security

Security at the Waterfront parkade was discussed following an incident recently where several vehicles were vandalized. Police are investigating and reviewing camera footage. Members were informed of security guard and mobile patrol routines. Since the incident security routines have been temporarily increased. The topics of an increased security presence as well as additional security cameras were discussed. Customers pay for use of a parking space only and the City does not, and can not, guarantee that vehicles or their contents will not be damaged or stolen. This type of incident is in no way the norm or regularly occurring. Members acknowledge that the level of security needs to be balanced with the cost and that an increase in rates would need to be applied if security measures are to be increased. It was requested that an informal survey of customers be conducted to determine if users would be willing to pay increased rates in order to off-set increased security expenses if implemented.

6. New Business

Members were informed that during the current lockdown paid parking and parking enforcement throughout the city has and will continue. Parking Authority is continuing to allow a 15 minute grace period at on-street meters while individuals are actively conducting curb-side pick up at local businesses.

7. Next Meeting

The next meeting will be May 11, 2021 at 10:00 AM via MS Teams.

8. Adjournment

Moved by Frances Larizza, seconded by Brian Hamilton.

"That the April 13, 2021 Parking Authority Board meeting be adjourned."

CARRIED

Meeting adjourned at 11:30 AM.



MEETING DATE 06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)

SUBJECT Heritage Advisory Committee Minutes

SUMMARY

Minutes of Meeting 04-2021 of the Heritage Advisory Committee held on April 22, 2021, for information.

ATTACHMENTS

1 HAC minutes April 22 2021

MEETING: H	IERITAGE ADVI	SORY COMMITTEE	PAGE 1 of 5
DATE:	THURSDA	Y, APRIL 22, 2021	MEETING NO. 04-2021
TIME:	5:00 P.M.		
PLACE:	VIA MS T	EAMS	
CHAIR:	MR. A. CC	OTTER	
MEMBERS – ELI PARTICIPATION		OFFICIALS – ELECTI	RONIC PARTICIPATION:
Ms. J. Bonazzo Ms. K. Costa	•	Mr. M. Szybalski, Manag Ms. L. Lavoie, Council &	ger – Archives, Records & Privacy & Committee Clerk
Mr. A. Cotter, Chai Mr. N. Duplessis	r	RESOURCE PERSON	S – ELECTRONIC PARTICIPATION
Ms. D. Pallen		Ms. L. Abthorpe, Heritag	·
Ms. H. Strobl Ms. S. Walker		Coordinator	evelopment and Public Art
Mr. D. Yahn, Vice Chair		Mr. J-L. Charette, Ministr Culture Industries	ry of Heritage, Sport, Tourism and
		Ms. L. Costanzo, Supervi Events	isor – Cultural Development &
		Mr. R. Mastrangelo, Arch	hivist Assistant
		GUESTS – ELECTRON	NIC PARTICIPATION
		~ ~ ~ ~ ~ .	

Councillor R. Johnson Mr. P. Boyle, General Manager – Magnus Theatre

1.0 LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Chair, Mr. A. Cotter, acknowledged that we are meeting on the traditional territory of the Ojibwa Anishnaabe people of Fort William First Nation, signatory to the Robinson Superior Treaty of 1850, and recognized the contributions made to our community by the Métis people.

2.0 DISCLOSURES OF INTEREST

3.0 AGENDA APPROVAL

MOVED BY: Ms. S. Walker SECONDED BY: Ms. D. Pallen WITH RESPECT to the April 22, 2021 Heritage Advisory Committee meeting, we recommend that the agenda as printed, including any additional information and new business, be confirmed.

CARRIED

4.0 <u>PRESENTATIONS</u>

4.1 <u>Magnus Theatre</u>

Mr. P. Boyle, General Manager – Magnus Theatre provided an update relative to the ongoing infrastructure renewal project at Magnus Theatre, 10 Algoma Street South, a designated heritage property.

Spalling brick was replaced in September 2020. Other completed projects include an electrical upgrade in the schoolhouse attic, EPDM repairs to the auditorium and schoolhouse roofs, a new display on the fire alarm annunciator panel, and garden rejuvenation.

Recladding of the cupola, which had been deferred due to the COVID-19 pandemic, will be completed soon. As recommended by HAC, a dark colour will be chosen to match the schoolhouse shingles. It was the consensus of committee that Mr. P. Boyle would not be required to return to HAC with colour samples.

Window replacement, as presented at a prior HAC meeting, is still to be done.

Mr. P. Boyle shared a preview of longer-term projects, including the following:

- Expansion of the production shop area,
- Relocation of office space in old school house to create smaller, black box theatre, which can be rented for theatre, dance, and other performances, and
- New box office area, which will be accessible and more secure.

The above-noted projects will enable Magnus Theatre to create jobs and generate more revenue, as well as create a positive economic impact on businesses in the downtown area.

Mr. P. Boyle noted that he has been working with Realty Services and will be consulting with Parks & Open Spaces relative to the expansion at Magnus Theatre. He will return for HAC approval before construction begins.

The Chair thanked Mr. P. Boyle and Magnus Theatre for being excellent custodians of a designated heritage building.

5.0 <u>CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MINUTES</u>

The Minutes of the Heritage Advisory Committee Meeting No. 03-2021 held on March 25, 2021 to be confirmed.

MOVED BY: Ms. S. Walker SECONDED BY: Ms. H. Strobl

THAT the Minutes of Meeting No. 03-2021 held on March 25, 2021 be confirmed.

CARRIED

6.0 VICKERS PARK CULTURAL HERITAGE EVALUATION REPORT

Mr. R. Mastrangelo, Archivist Assistant provided an update relative to the Vickers Park Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report and the committee reviewed the recommendations in the executive summary.

There was discussion relative to the four corner boulders bordering Vickers Park. It was noted that the language in the report relative to the boulders should match the language in the original deed. The report should note that the boulders are to be maintained, as they were part of the gift.

There was discussion relative to historic trees in Vickers Park. There is one tree of note in the park, a multi trunk tree known as the travelling tree, or company tree. The tree is well known as a spot for photos. It was the consensus of committee that the heritage value of the tree should be noted in the report. A committee member recommended that the tree be used for public engagement on Facebook, asking for personal stories about the tree.

Councillor R. Johnson requested a presentation of the report to the Clean, Green and Beautiful Committee, as there may be synergies.

7.0 <u>STRATEGIC PLAN</u>

The Chair, Mr. A. Cotter noted that an updated Strategic Plan would be distributed to committee for approval at the May 27, 2021 meeting.

8.0 <u>CHIPPEWA PARK CAROUSEL</u>

Ms. J. Bonazzo provided an update on activities of the Carousel Restoration Committee and noted that the fundraising auction will be open until April 30, 2021.

9.0 <u>HERITAGE RESEARCHER UPDATE</u>

Mr. R. Mastrangelo, Archivist Assistant, provided an update relative to the above-noted, including the following:

- The City's walking tour app will be released on May 25, 2021. The app features the five current heritage walking tours, a public art walking tour, and tours from Thunder Bay Museum. Potential additional tours may include a food producer tour, a French tour and a driving tour of public art throughout the city.
- The April Walleye article featured the Salvation Army and the May article will feature the Eatons building.
- The Immigrant Settlement Program asked for permission to use videos from Doors Open and requested to have someone speak about History of Thunder Bay in a Zoom call or recorded video. Ms. L. Abthorpe, Heritage Researcher will provide the presentation.
- The history page on the city website will be updated, including the addition of Indigenous history.
- Ontario Heritage is looking for looking for local photographs for the Ontario Heritage Tool Kit. They have specifically asked for photos of the Waverley Park area.

10.0 <u>NEW BUSINESS</u>

10.1 Presentations to Council

Mr. M. Szybalski, Corporate Records Manager & City Archivist provided an update on three HAC items that will be presented to City Council: A walking tour app presentation, a Doors Open presentation and the HAC Terms of Reference report.

10.2 Addition to Heritage Register

There was discussion relative to adding the former Ontario Bank building on Bendell Street to the Heritage Register. It was noted that there has been a great deal of community interest in the building, which was one of the first buildings in Port Arthur. The property owner will be invited to an upcoming HAC meeting.

10.3 Stones at Mission Island Boat Launch

The Chair shared a photo of the former Dominion Bank building on East Victoria Avenue and noted that when the building was demolished, pieces of the façade were brought to Mission Island and are still displayed there.

10.4 <u>Committee Resignation</u>

The Chair noted that a resignation letter had been received from HAC Citizen Appointee Sarah Walker and committee members wished her well in her future endeavors.

11.0 <u>NEXT MEETING DATE</u>

The next meeting is scheduled for Thursday, May 27, 2021 at 5:00 p.m. via Microsoft Teams.

12.0 ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 6:44 p.m.



Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/	Development & Emergency	REPORT NO.	R 67/2021
DIVISION	Services - Planning Services		
DATE PREPARED	05/12/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)	FILE NO.	58T-17501
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
SUBJECT	Amend Draft Plan of Subdivision - 3	3053 20th Side Roa	ıd

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report R 67/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Planning Services), we recommend draft plan approval (58T-17501) be extended to June 30, 2024, subject to the conditions outlined in Attachment "C" as it applies to Concession 3 NKR, Part of Lot 21 described as Parts 1 & 2 on RP 55R-7116 and Concession 3 NKR, South Part of Lot 2, 3053 and 3125 20th Side Road;

AND THAT any necessary By-laws be presented to City Council for ratification;

ALL as contained in Report No. R 67/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Planning Services), as submitted by the Development & Emergency Services Department.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The subject lands received draft approval for a plan of subdivision comprising of 24 lots for single detached dwellings on June 18, 2018. The Owner has not commenced the process to enter into a Subdivision Agreement with the City as the Owner did not intend on developing the lands but rather to sell to a potential developer. The lands have not been sold and the Owner prefers to extend draft approval rather than letting the draft approval lapse on June 18, 2021. Without an extension, the draft approval will lapse.

Administration is recommending that the extension be granted to June 30, 2024 given that the conditions of approval remain relevant and the Owner is actively marketing the lands for development.

DISCUSSION

The lands (shown on Attachment A) have received draft approval, on June 18, 2018, for a residential plan of subdivision that is to be serviced by municipal piped water and individual private septic systems.

The plan consists of:

- 1. 24 lots for single detached dwellings
- 2. Two new streets
- 3. One Parkland Block
- 4. One green space/storm retention management Block.

The subject lands received draft approval for a plan of subdivision on June 18, 2018. The draft plan approval was valid for 3 years ending June 18, 2021 and will lapse if an extension is not granted. The owner never intended on developing the lands but, undertook the application process in order to have draft approval in place to market the lands for sale to developers. To date, the owner notes that there has been little interest, however they do not wish for the draft approval to lapse.

All of the conditions contained in Attachment "C" are the same as those originally imposed. No additional conditions or modification of conditions are required as part of the proposed extension. The additional three year extension will another opportunity to market to potential developers and allow time for studies and reports to be finalized, the agreement to be executed, and ultimately the registration process to be completed should the lands be sold.

Administration recommends that the extension be granted given that the owner continues to actively market the lands for sale,

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no financial implications associated with this report.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that extending the time for completion of draft plan approval conditions for the Draft Plan of Subdivision should be approved.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED

- 1. Attachment A Draft Approval Conditions for File 58T-17501
- 2. Attachment B Draft Approved Plan
- 3. Attachment C Property Location

PREPARED BY: Decio Lopes, MCIP, RPP., Senior Planner

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY:	DATE:
Karen Lewis, General Manager – Development & Emergency Services	June 4, 2021

DRAFT APPROVAL CONDITIONS FOR 58T-17501 apply for a period of 3 years, ending on June 30, 2024 for the plan, as redlined, shown on Attachment "C" of Report R70/2018 (Planning Services), which shows a total of 24 lots for single detached dwellings, 2 streets, and 3 blocks for storm water management and parkland.:

STANDARD CONDITIONS:

- 1. That the streets be shown and dedicated as a public highway on the final plan.
- 2. That the streets be named to the satisfaction of the City of Thunder Bay.
- 3. That Lot 13 is redlined to expand Block 26 to the western limit of the property
- 4. That the owner retain an Ontario Land Surveyor's Certificate confirming that all lots conform to the requirements of By-law 100-2010, as amended.
- 5. That the owner enter into a Subdivision Agreement satisfactory to the City of Thunder Bay to satisfy all the requirements, financial and otherwise, concerning the provision of roads, installation of services and drainage.
- 6. That the owner satisfies the Parks & Open Spaces Section with respect to parkland dedication.
- 7. That such easements as may be required for utility or drainage purposes shall be granted to the appropriate authority.

CONDITIONS TO BE COMPLETED PRIOR TO A SUBDIVISION AGREEMENT:

- 8. That to prior to any earth works or vegetation removal, the owner shall submit a tree inventory and retention plan and that any recommendations are included in Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner.
- 9. That prior to entering into a Subdivision Agreement with the City, the owner shall provide a final servicing study prepared by a Professional Engineer, to the satisfaction of the City Engineer, and that any requirements are included in Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner.
- 10. That prior to entering into a Subdivision Agreement with the City, the owner conduct a noise and vibration study due to the property's proximity to the railway corridor and that any recommendations be included in the Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner.

ATTACHMENT A - Draft Approval Conditions for File 58T-17501

- 11. That prior to entering into a Subdivision Agreement, the applicant shall provide a final hydrogeological and geotechnical Study prepared by a Professional Engineer for the design of the road system and septic systems, and shall include an appraisal on groundwater conditions in the area with recommendations for permanent groundwater control measures, to the satisfaction of the City Engineer. This updated Study shall include addressing the Provincial Policy Statement that site conditions are suitable for the long-term provision of partial services with no *negative impacts*, to the satisfaction of the City Engineer, Planning Services Division, and the Thunder Bay District Health Unit and that the City is to be advised in writing, by the Thunder Bay District Health Unit how this condition has been met, , and that any requirements are included in Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner.
- 12. That prior to entering into a Subdivision Agreement with the City, the owner shall prepare a final lot grading and drainage plan to the satisfaction of the City Engineer and the Lakehead Region Conservation Authority, and that any requirements are included in Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner
- 13. That prior to entering into a Subdivision Agreement with the City, the owner shall provide a final Traffic Study to the satisfaction of the City Engineer, and that any requirements are included in Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner.
- 14. That prior to entering into a Subdivision Agreement with the City, the applicant shall provide a satisfactory final stormwater management report, erosion control plan, and an assessment on the existing cross-culvert under 20th Side Road (at the northeast corner of the subject lands), prepared by a Professional Engineer, confirming the stormwater management quantity and quality control requirements, and identifying any off-site drainage improvements to be completed by the owner, to the satisfaction of the City Engineer and the Lakehead Region Conservation Authority, and that any requirements are included in Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner.

CONDITIONS TO BE INCLUDED IN A SUBDIVISION AGREEMENT:

- 15. That the Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner contain a provision wherein the owner agrees to include in all offers of purchase and sale the following notices:
 - (a) For all lots, notice that postal services is via community mailboxes.
 - (b) For all lots, notice that homeowners should utilize water conservation features and techniques as the lands are serviced with an unlimited supply of City water that will ultimately discharge into the natural environment through their private septic systems.

ATTACHMENT A - Draft Approval Conditions for File 58T-17501

- (c) For all lots, notice that the septic system design must include an advanced nitrate treatment system capable of removing a minimum of 50 to 65% of nitrogen compounds from the effluent.
- (d) For all lots, notice that raised septic beds may be required.
- (e) For all lots, notice that the plan of subdivision is located near a railway corridor and that daily rail activity is likely to interfere with some of the activities of the dwelling occupants
- 16. That the Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner contain a provision wherein the owner agrees to stop all work and notify the Ministry of Citizenship, Culture, and Recreation in the event that cultural heritage features are uncovered during construction.
- 17. That the Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner contain a provision wherein the owner agrees to stop all work and notify the Police, Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, and the Registrar of Cemeteries Ministry of Government Services in the event human remains are uncovered during construction.
- 18. That the Subdivision Agreement between the City and owner contain a provision for the construction of fences along all park blocks, walkway blocks, and stormwater management facilities, if required, to the satisfaction of the Parks & Open Spaces Section and the City Engineer.
- 19. That the Subdivision Agreement between the City and owner contain a provision for completion of tree and brush clearing along 20th Side Road for the provision of improved sight distances at the proposed intersection.
- 20. That the Subdivision Agreement between the City and the owner contain any recommendations in the updated Hydrogeological Study be incorporated into the Subdivision Agreement.

ATTACHMENT A - Draft Approval Conditions for File 58T-17501

CONDITIONS TO BE COMPLETED PRIOR TO THE REGISTRATION OF THE SUBDIVISION :

- 21. That the owner satisfies the City Engineer with respect to the dedication of land for a road dedication, at no charge to the City, with an approximate width of 5m along the 20th Side Road portion of lots 1 and 2 for future road widening purposes.
- 22. That prior to final approval, the Subdivision Agreement be registered against the title of the lands to which it applies.
- 23. That prior to final approval, the owner shall enter into an agreement with Thunder Bay Hydro Electricity Distribution Inc. for the costs of supplying electricity service to the development and that the City is to be advised in writing, by Thunder Bay Hydro Electricity Distribution Inc. how this condition has been met.
- 24. That prior to final approval, the owner shall enter into an agreement with Thunder Bay Telephone for the provision of telephone service to the development and that the City is to be advised in writing, by Thunder Bay Telephone how this condition has been met.
- 25. That prior to final approval, the owner shall enter into an agreement with Union Gas Limited for the provision of natural gas service to the development and that the City is to be advised in writing, by Union Gas Limited how this condition has been met.
- 26. That prior to final approval, the owner shall satisfy the City Engineer that the applicable requirements of the *Environmental Assessment Act* have been met.
- 27. That the owner satisfies the City Engineer with respect to the dedication of land for drainage and stormwater management purposes.
- 28. That prior to final approval, the owner shall satisfy the City Engineer with respect to servicing the subdivision and providing all required easements and for releasing or modifying any existing easements.

ATTACHMENT B - Plan showing Proposed Draft Plan of Subdivision

Site Statistics:



TITLE: Applicant's Subdivision Pl	an		Date: JUNE/2021
PREPARED BY DL	SCALE As Noted	FILE NO. 58T-17501	



TITLE: Property Location			Date:	JUNE/2021
PREPARED BY DL	SCALE As Noted	FILE NO. 58T-17501		



Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/	Development & Emergency	REPORT NO.	R 73/2021
DIVISION	Services - Superior North EMS		
DATE PREPARED	05/13/2021	FILE NO.	
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
SUBJECT	New Emergency Vehicle Purchase		

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report R 73/2021 (Development & Emergency Services - Superior North EMS), we recommend that the purchase of five new emergency vehicles be awarded to Crestline Coach Ltd. which submitted the successful proposal for the amount of \$796,883 plus HST;

AND THAT Crestline Coach Ltd. be the proponent to supply up to five more new emergency vehicles in 2022;

AND THAT the Manager-Supply Management be authorized to issue a purchase order to award this contract;

AND THAT the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to sign any necessary agreement related to the report;

AND THAT any necessary By-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The 2021 capital budget includes 940,000 for the purchase of five new emergency vehicles and associated equipment. In 2021, a request for proposal was issued to cover five consecutive years of emergency vehicle purchases (2021 - 2025) with Crestline Coach Ltd. being the successful proponent. The City's Emergency Medical Services (EMS) requires the supply and delivery of up to nine new single-stretcher emergency vehicles. Five emergency vehicles will be ordered in 2021 and up to four will be ordered in 2022.

The City has an option to extend the Contract with the successful Proponent to purchase an estimated number of 12 to 15 additional units over the following next three years (2023, 2024, 2025). The final decision will be based on:

- Satisfactory performance
- Operational needs and annual budget approvals

• That the future pricing is acceptable to the Municipality. With the expectation that the price for the future vehicles will be similar to the price of the first vehicles.

The request for proposal also outlined that the City may be interested in additional emergency vehicles in the years 2022 to 2025.

DISCUSSION

A request for proposals for the supply and delivery of up to nine new emergency vehicles was advertised in the Chronicle Journal and on the City of Thunder Bay website.

After review of the responses by the Supply Management Division and Superior North EMS, it was deemed the bid from Crestline Coach Ltd. met all the requirements as outlined in the proposal document.

Five emergency vehicles will be ordered in 2021 with the remainder to be ordered in 2022 pending budget approval.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

The 2021 capital budget includes 940,000 for the purchase of five new emergency vehicles and associated equipment. In 2021, a request for proposal was issued to cover five consecutive years of emergency vehicle purchases (2021 - 2025) with Crestline Coach Ltd. being the successful proponent. The City's Emergency Medical Services (EMS) requires the Supply and Delivery of Up to Nine New Single-Stretcher Emergency vehicles. Five Emergency vehicles will be ordered in 2021 and up to four will be ordered in 2022.

The City may be interested in extending the Contract with the successful Proponent to purchase an estimated number of 12 to 15 additional units over the following next three years (2023, 2024, 2025). There are sufficient funds in the 2021 capital budget to proceed with purchase based on the breakdown of costs as detailed below:

Contract Proposal Price \$796,883

HST 13%	\$103,594.79
Less HST Rebate	\$89,569.65
Net Cost	\$810,908.14

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that Superior North EMS should proceed with the purchase of five new emergency vehicles from Crestline Coach Ltd.in 2021.

BACKGROUND

Capital funds are included in the 2021 capital budget for the purchase of five new emergency vehicles. Superior North EMS responds to over 30,000 calls for service each year and the five new emergency vehicles will replace five units that have reached the end of their life cycle. Superior North EMS has a fleet of 38 emergency vehicles with an average life cycle of six to nine years. The recommended purchase of the new emergency vehicles is critical to maintaining a reliable emergency vehicle fleet.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:

None.

PREPARED BY: Deputy Chief E. Kadikoff, EMS

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)	DATE:
Karen Lewis, General Manager – Development & Emergency Services	June 4, 2021



Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/	Development & Emergency	REPORT NO.	R 78/2021
DIVISION	Services - Superior North EMS		
DATE PREPARED	05/19/2021	FILE NO.	
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
SUBJECT	Work Plan for Superior North EMS	2021-2030 Master	Plan

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report R 78/2021 (Development & Emergency Services – Superior North EMS), we recommend that the Superior North EMS 2021 to 2030 Master Plan (Attachment A) be accepted as a guiding document;

AND THAT the work plan (Attachment B) be approved for Administration to follow;

AND THAT an update on progress on the work plan be presented not later than Q1 2022;

AND THAT Administration be authorized to proceed with negotiations with the Municipality of Shuniah:

AND THAT Administration begin implementing recommendations impacting service within the City of Thunder Bay with updates at key milestones.

AND THAT the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to execute all required documentation;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN

The City's Strategic Plan for 2019-2022 includes a strategic priority that speaks to reviewing the programs and services the City provides, how it provides them, what to maintain, change, reduce or enhance and how to improve service.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The 2021-2030 Superior North Emergency Medical Services Master Plan was received by Committee of the Whole on January 25, 2021 (Report R8/2021).

The Plan offers a set of recommendations for both District and City operations and offers recommendations relative to the enhancement of key performance measures and performance targets.

This Report presents the Work Plan Administration proposes to follow, using the Master Plan as a guiding document.

DISCUSSION

Performance Concepts Consulting examined all aspects of service provided by SNEMS and the Plan offers a broad range of recommendations.

The resulting Superior North EMS 2021-2030 Master Plan has been received by Council. City staff have recommended the Master Plan be adopted by Council as a guiding document moving forward.

The 2021 Work Plan addresses System-wide recommendations contained in the Master Plan.

District Operations

The District-focused recommendations are like dominoes; their order and sequencing are vitally important.

The analytics associated with the Master Plan will be updated this summer in preparation for meetings with core stakeholders late summer, or as soon as it's possible to meet in person.

These stakeholder coordination/working sessions will establish an evidence-based consensus for moving forward with the seven Work Plan modules linked to Master Plan recommendations:

- 1. North Shore Non-Urgent Transportation (already partially underway)
- 2. North Shore Base Consolidation: Nipigon/Red Rock
- 3. North Shore Base Consolidation: Schreiber/Terrace Bay
- 4. Beardmore Ambulance Redeployment
- 5. Beardmore Community Paramedicine Initiative
- 6. Advocating for First Nations "Fair Funding" @ Nakina & Longlac Bases
- 7. Supporting the NAN Paramedic Service/Community Paramedicine Initiative

North Shore District municipalities and First Nation communities are important stakeholders in the design and execution of the 2021 Work Plan. A series of four up-front work plan dialogue sessions are a necessary first step in the detailed design and execution of the seven work plan modules. The following dialogue sessions (including District municipal and First Nation representatives) are envisioned:

i. Nipigon/Red Rock Session addressing...

- North Shore Non-Urgent Transportation (already partially underway)
- North Shore Base Consolidation: Nipigon/Red Rock
- ii. Schreiber/Terrace Bay Session addressing...
 - North Shore Non-Urgent Transportation (already partially underway)
 - North Shore Base Consolidation: Schreiber/Terrace Bay
- iii. Beardmore Session addressing...
 - Beardmore Ambulance Redeployment
 - Beardmore Community Paramedicine Initiative
- iv. First Nations Session addressing...
 - Advocating for First Nations "Fair Funding" @ Nakina & Longlac Bases
 - Supporting the NAN Paramedic Service/Community Paramedicine Initiative

These stakeholder coordination/working sessions will establish an evidence-based consensus for moving forward with the seven Work Plan modules linked to Master Plan recommendations.

System-wide Work Plan Elements

Evaluation / Performance Measurement

- Analytics update on SNEMS response times/peak system busyness/Code Black to support 2022 capital and operating budget process (Q3 2021)
- Annual SNEMS performance reporting scorecard standardized analytics + targets. (Q1 2022)

Operational Planning & Restructuring

- Identify additional ambulance requirements (capital and staffed vehicle hours) via just-intime resourcing (Q3 2021)
- Continue Shuniah Station Replacement Planning/Preparations (2021 & 2022)
- Advocate for Dispatch System refinements and accelerated Implementation Plan new Provincial AMPDS algorithm. (Ongoing beyond 2021)
- Collaborate with local health system stakeholders to develop public awareness program, featuring a variety of formats, to manage/reduce public usage of 9-1-1 for Paramedic Services. Capitalize on experience gained in other Ontario jurisdictions. This will be initiated in 2021 and continue in 2022.
- Ramp-up the scale of community paramedicine programs (CPP) to flatten the call volume demand curve. This is underway in 2021 & will continue in 2022.
- Advocate for permanent provincial funding for scaled-up CPP. This is ongoing beyond 2021.
• Identify further non-hospital alternative destinations and protocols for patients that help flatten the call volume demand curve. Examples: safe sobering sites, much-needed mental health sites, treat-and-refer protocols. This is underway in 2021 & will continue in 2022.

Ministry of Health approval will be required for program elements described above.

Performance Concepts Consulting has also recommended a number of changes to organizational design. As noted in the Plan, SNEMS' priority in recent years has rightly been delivering adequate front-line paramedic service. However, resources required to provide appropriate support and logistic functions have lagged behind. Recommendations are offered to improve communications, improve functional alignment, and better resource the work that needs to get done. These recommendations have been provided to Administration for its consideration in the form of a confidential addendum under separate cover. Administration will start to bring recommendations to Committee of the Whole in the near future.

CONSULTATION

Performance Concepts Consulting held information sessions in the fall of 2020 presenting the analytical data and seeking input from the following stakeholders:

- District Municipalities
- Both SNEMS Paramedic Union, UNIFOR 229(District) and UNIFOR 39(City)
- First Nations Communities
- Other stakeholders which included Hospitals, Police, Fire, Dispatch, Ministry of Health, ORNGE.

A SNEMS internal advisory committee consisting for both union and non-union members was also established to help guide the process as well.

To further support effective consultation with stakeholders SNEMS has created and added a featured item on its web page (thunderbay.ca/snems) to share the Master Plan and future updates.

On Saturday, May 15, Chief Gates presented his annual update to the Thunder Bay District Municipal League including an update on the Master Plan. He advised that he would be presenting a work plan to Committee of the Whole on June 14, 2021.

A letter of introduction of the new General Manager, K. Lewis, and update to stakeholders (First Nations, District municipalities and hospitals) was sent on May 19, 2021. Several responses have been received acknowledging the letter and welcoming future discussion sessions.

Both the Chief and the GM advised that in person sessions would be held with affected stakeholders as early as late summer if conditions associated with the pandemic permit such sessions.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The Plan includes recommendations that would have both positive and negative cost implications.

Financial implications will be reported as changes are recommended and incorporated into annual budget submissions for approval.

BACKGROUND

The initial Strategic Plan for Superior North Emergency Medical Services (SNEMS) was intended to span the years 2013 to 2017 and was past time for renewal.

Performance Concepts Consulting was selected to provide professional consulting services and develop a new Master Plan for SNEMS.

The project was initially paused when the provincial government announced early in its term that it intended to alter significantly certain aspects of the provision of paramedic service in Ontario. When change did not appear imminent the work proceeded, though the pace was somewhat slowed by the pandemic.

The draft Master Plan was presented to Committee of the whole on December 14, 2020. Input received leading up to that presentation, as well as questions and comments from members of Council that evening, informed the final edits to the Plan, which was received by Committee of the Whole on January 25, 2021.

The overriding patient-centric principles that informed the Master Plan are as follows:

- SNEMS must deploy its finite resources in a rational and responsible manner that safeguards the greatest number of current and future pre-hospital patients regardless of where they reside in Thunder Bay or the District.
- SNEMS is obligated to consider "best efforts" mitigation of any potential adverse impacts on existing communities/populations in the course of its evidence-based deployment of resources.

Administration was to return by end of April with an implementation plan.

On April 26, 2021, the General Manager of Development & Emergency Services, K. Lewis, advised Committee of the Whole by memo that the Report would be presented by June 21, 2021.

On May 19, 2021, GM Lewis advised stakeholders by letter that Administration was developing a work plan which it will bring to Thunder Bay City Council, the legislated authority for SNEMS governance, at Committee of the Whole on Monday, June 14, 2021.

They were advised it is better called a work plan, rather than the previously described implementation plan, because the evidence-based Master Plan contains a series of recommendations or modules that span a decade and will be sequenced, with consultations along the way on how best to achieve the necessary restructuring across the District.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that the Superior North EMS Master Plan should be adopted as a guiding document and that the 2021 work plan should be approved for Administration to follow.

It is further concluded that an update on progress on the work plan be presented not later than Q1 2022 and that Administration should be authorized to proceed with negotiations with the Municipality of Shuniah.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:

Attachment A – Superior North Emergency Medical Services Master Plan Attachment B – 2021 Work Plan for Superior North Emergency Medical Services Master Plan Attachment C – Letter to First Nation, District municipalities and hospitals from GM Development & Emergency Services

PREPARED BY: Karen M. Lewis, GM Development & Emergency Services and Chief Wayne Gates, Superior North Emergency Medical Services

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)	DATE:
Karen Lewis, General Manager – Development & Emergency Services	June 4, 2021





SUPERIOR NORTH EMS

2021-2030 Paramedic Services Master Plan

Submitted by:

Performance Concepts Consulting www.performanceconcepts.ca



Submitted to:

City of Thunder Bay/SNEMS

Table of Contents

1.0	Executiv	e Summary 1
	1.1.1	A Significant Master Plan Challenge: Forecast Growth in Call Volumes1
	1.1.2	SNEMS Analytics
	1.1.3	SNEMS & First Nations
	1.1.4	Functional Review of District Stations6
	1.1.5	2021-2030 Master Plan Recommendations & Implementation Road Map
	1.1.6	Moving Forward7
2.0	Introduc	tion & Methodology 9
_	2.1	Towards an Adaptable SNEMS Master Plan
	2.1.1	Impact of the COVID Pandemic
	2.1.2	Master Plan Principles
	2.1.3	Team-Based Approach to Building the SNEMS Master Plan
	2.2	SNEMS Master Plan Context
	2.2.1	Post-COVID Financial Realities
	2.2.2	Asset Management Pressures and Ontario Reg 588/1712
	2.3	SNEMS 101 – Governance, Funding & Operations13
	2.3.1	City Council Governance Role13
	2.3.2	SNEMS Funding Model13
	2.3.3	Distinct City and District Labour Forces14
	2.3.4	Implications for the Master Plan14
	2.4	Methodology: An Evidence-Based Approach15
	2.4.1	SNEMS System Performance Analytics
	2.4.2	Service Demand Forecast15
	2.4.3	Internal SNEMS Consultations15
	2.4.4	Evaluation of District Bases (Asset Management Compliance)
	2.4.5	First Nations Service Delivery Opportunities16
	2.4.6	"As Should Be" Restructuring and Resourcing – City SNEMS
	2.4.7	"As Should Be" Restructuring and Resourcing – District SNEMS

	2.4.8	SNEMS Organization Design	16
	2.4.9	Implementation Roadmap	16
3.0	SNEMS	Stakeholder Consultations	17
	3.1	Dialogue with SNEMS Superintendents & Support Staff	
	3.2	Frontline Paramedic Surveys	19
4.0	SNEMS	System Performance Analytics	21
	4.1	System-wide SNEMS Analytics	21
	4.2	City Model Analytics	24
	4.3	SNEMS Demand Forecast (Base Case Scenario)	31
	4.4	Community Paramedicine and Alternative Pathways	
	4.4.1	Re-imagining Paramedicine	34
	4.4.2	Dispatch Enhancements	34
	4.4.3	Propensity to Call 9-1-1	
	4.4.4	Community Paramedicine	
	4.4.5	First Nations	
	4.4.6	Alternate Pathways	
	4.4.7	Assess, Treat-and-Release or Assess-and-Refer	
	4.5	Revised Demand Forecast	
5.0	SNEMS	District Model	40
	5.1	Analytics Overview - Twinned Bases on North Shore (Nipigon/Red Rock + Schreiber/Terrace Bay)	
	5.2	Analytics Overview - Beardmore Base	
	5.3	District Base Functionality Review	
	5.3.1	SNEMS District Station Condition Assessments	
	5.3.2	Shuniah Station	50
	5.3.3	Armstrong Station	51
	5.3.4	Red Rock Station	
	5.3.5	Nipigon Station	53
	5.3.6	Schreiber Station	54
	5.3.7	Terrace Bay Station	55

	5.3.8	Marathon Station	56
	5.3.9	Manitouwadge Station	57
	5.3.10	Longlac Station	58
	5.3.11	Nakina Station	59
	5.3.12	Geraldton Station	60
	5.3.13	Beardmore Station	61
	5.3.14	Upsala Station	63
	5.3.15	Conmee Station	64
	5.3.16	Summary of District Stations Functional Assessment	65
	5.4	District Restructuring – Setting Up the Dominoes	
	5.4.1	District Staffing Concerns	
	5.4.2	District Down-staffing Analysis	67
	5.5	First Nations Enhanced Funding and Partnership Opportunities	
6.0	District S	SNEMS Recommendations	70
	6.1	A Restructured Non-Urgent Transfers Model	70
	6.1 6.1.1	A Restructured Non-Urgent Transfers Model Recommendation	
	-		70
	6.1.1	Recommendation	70 70
	6.1.1 6.2	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases)	70 70 70
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation	70 70 70 71
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1 6.3	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations	70 70 70 71 71
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1 6.3 6.3.1	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations Recommendation	70 70 70 71 71
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1 6.3 6.3.1 6.4	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations Recommendation Beardmore Restructuring	70 70 71 71 71 71 72
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1 6.3 6.3.1 6.4 6.4.1	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations Recommendation Beardmore Restructuring Recommendation.	
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1 6.3 6.3.1 6.4 6.4.1 6.4.2	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations Recommendation Beardmore Restructuring Recommendation Recommendation	
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1 6.3 6.3.1 6.4 6.4.1 6.4.2 6.5	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations Recommendation Beardmore Restructuring Recommendation Recommendation First Nations Funding and Collaboration Opportunities	70 70 70 71 71 71 72 72 73 73
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1 6.3 6.3.1 6.4 6.4.1 6.4.2 6.5 6.5.1	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations Recommendation Beardmore Restructuring Recommendation Recommendation First Nations Funding and Collaboration Opportunities Recommendation.	70 70 70 71 71 71 72 72 73 73 73
	6.1.1 6.2 6.2.1 6.3 6.3.1 6.4 6.4.1 6.4.2 6.5 6.5.1 6.5.1 6.5.2	Recommendation Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations Recommendation Beardmore Restructuring Recommendation First Nations Funding and Collaboration Opportunities Recommendation Recommendation Recommendation	70 70 71 71 71 71 72 72 73 73 73 73

7.0	City Recor	nmendations 75
	7.1	New Vehicle Hours
	7.1.1	Recommendation75
	7.2	Ramping Up Community Paramedicine75
	7.2.1	Recommendation75
	7.3	Maximizing Alternate Pathways75
	7.3.1	Recommendation75
8.0	Annual SN	EMS Report Card & Business Plan Performance Targets 76
	8.1.1	Recommendation76
	8.1.2	Recommendation76
9.0	Modernizi	ng SNEMS Org Design & Labour Relations 77
10.0	Implemen	tation Roadmap 78
	10.1	Relentless Focus on Execution
	10.2	District Recommendations78
	10.3	City Recommendations
	10.4	SNEMS Annual Report Card & Business Plan Performance Targets
11.0	Conclusio	n 80
	11.1	"How" Implementation Priority – Engaging Health System Stakeholders
	11.2	"How" Implementation Priority – Engaging First Nations
	11.3	"How" Implementation Priority – Rebuilding SNEMS with District Partners
	Appendice	25
	Appendix	A1 City Staff Survey Results
	Appendix	A2 District Staff Survey Results
	Appendix	B Facilities Condition Assessment Summary
	Appendix	C CONFIDENTIAL – Organization Re-design Addendum

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

1.0 Executive Summary

Superior North Emergency Medical Service (SNEMS) is committed to patient-centric, evidence supported delivery of paramedic services within the City of Thunder Bay and across the District. The challenges facing SNEMS are complex and significant. Solutions set out in this Master Plan are not incremental - they are in fact transformational. Transformational change at SNEMS is required to safeguard pre-hospital patients in the post-COVID era where the City of Thunder Bay and District municipal funders face tight budgets and finite resources.

The 2021-2030 SNEMS master plan has been prepared according to the following overriding patientcentric principle:

SNEMS must deploy its finite resources in a rational and responsible manner that safeguards the greatest possible number of current and future pre-hospital patients - regardless of where they reside in Thunder Bay or the District.

SNEMS is obligated to consider "best efforts" mitigation of any potential adverse impacts on existing communities/populations in the course of its evidence-based deployment of resources.

1.1.1 A Significant Master Plan Challenge: Forecast Growth in Call Volumes

The City of Thunder Bay and the surrounding District will experience a no-growth population from 2021 to 2030. However the "aging tsunami" imbedded in the existing population will drive SNEMS call volumes across the coming decade.



Seniors > 65 Years of Age = Aging Tsunami on the March

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

SNEMS call volumes will also be significantly impacted by growth in the public's willingness to call 9-1-1. This propensity to call 9-1-1 is growing by almost 6% annually.

Growing Likelihood to Call 911 Driving Demand Forecast



Taken together the aging tsunami and growing willingness to call 9-1-1 generated the following "base case" call demand forecast for SNEMS. Between 2021 and 2030 calls will increase by almost 6% annually.



SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

1.1.2 SNEMS Analytics

The 2021-2030 SNEMS Master Plan included a detailed package of City SNEMS and District SNEMS analytics charts. SNEMS analytics data trends have informed the Findings/Recommendations featured in this Master Plan. The SNEMS analytics package should be reviewed carefully in its entirety when considering Master Plan Recommendations, however the following highlights are noteworthy.



City SNEMS System Busyness (Unit Hour Activity)

City SNEMS system busyness levels (UHA) have been stabilized by two decisive actions: removing Code 1-2 non-urgent patient transfers from the City SNEMS workload. and adding ambulance vehicle hours of service every couple of budget years. Stable levels system of busyness (despite annual call volume growth) have led to acceptable average Code 4 emergency response times. By 2019 "Code Zero" levels of ambulance system overload had been brought under control. The key leave-behind: additional vehicle hours of service will be required in the first half of the Master Plan to keep the growing City SNEMS call volume "pot" from boiling over.

In the District, the focus for transformational change is on the north shore twinned stations of Nipigon/Red Rock and Schreiber/Terrace Bay. The analytics for the 4 north shore bases demonstrate that Code 1-2 transfer work is significant - restricting the ability of SNEMS to implement significant/ positive operational restructuring.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



The Beardmore station also presents a significant restructuring opportunity. Beardmore system busyness (UHA) data documents the low workload/patient impacts associated with the sub-optimal deployment of this 12-hour ambulance resource. Additional Beardmore analytics confirm the station is not performing well from a value-for-money perspective.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



1.1.3 SNEMS & First Nations

SNEMS is honoured to provide pre-hospital 9-1-1 emergency response and other supportive pre-hospital health care services to First Nations communities across the District.

The SNEMS Armstrong station is 100% funded by senior levels of government because it primarily delivers services to First Nations. The Nakina station meets/surpasses the Armstrong First Nations workload precedent required to secure 100% senior government funding. Nakina's First Nation territory calls represent 77% of the total 2017-2019 call volume. While not meeting the Armstrong First Nations workload precedent, the Longlac station delivers almost 2/3 of its total 2017-2019 call volume to First Nations territory calls.

Station	All Calls*	Station Area FN Calls	% FN Calls	All FN Calls	% FN Calls
Longlac	1618	905	55.93	1005	62.11
Armstrong	1585	950	59.94	1154	72.80
Nakina	630	464	73.65	485	76.98
Beardmore	287	91	31.70	106	36.93
*2017-2019 com	hinod	-	-		

*2017-2019 combined

Beyond issues associated with "fair share" funding arrangements, SNEMS is embracing an evolving opportunity to work with the Nishnawbe Aski Nation (NAN) as they work towards the creation of their own paramedic service.

1.1.4 Functional Review of District Stations

As a core component of this Master Plan, an updated operational assessment was completed for each District station and associated residences. Only 2 of the 14 District stations are owned by the City with SNEMS responsible for maintenance. The balance of the stations depend on landlords maintaining them to acceptable standards. While three District stations approach full compliance with regulatory/functional ambulance station requirements, four others will require replacement in the first half of the Master Plan's 10-year timeframe. One station replacement has been successfully completed with the Conmee-to-Kakabeka Falls transition. The Kakabeka Falls station has been built by the Municipality of Oliver-Paipoonge and leased to SNEMS. This municipal leaseback option should be utilized for the remaining station replacements.

1.1.5 2021-2030 Master Plan Recommendations & Implementation Road Map

The following tables set out the 2021-2030 Master Plan Recommendations across a series of themes/categories.

Summary of District Recommendations & Timeframes

Recommendation	DO NOW /DO SOON 2021 25	DO LATER 2026 30
A Restructured Non-Urgent Transfers Model		
Secure funding and establish north shore hospital partner	2021	
• Prepare operational plan/route schedule + secure multi-patient vehicle	2021	
Roll-out operational patient transfer system	2022	
Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases)	1	1
 Confirm twinned stations round the clock staffing plan Execute new round the clock staffing plan North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations 	2021 2022	
Implement schedule contained in recommendation	2021-23	
Beardmore Restructuring	2021 25	
 Confirm leave-behind solution Re-deploy Beardmore 12-hour unit and implement leave-behind solution 	2021 2022	
Decommission station	2022	
First Nations Funding and Collaboration Opportunities	1	1
 Advocate for Nakina/Longlac enhanced Provincial funding model Support NAN paramedic/community paramedicine initiative 	2021-22 2021-23	
District Stations 10-Year Replacement Plan		
 Implement schedule contained in recommendation Make provisions for additional station replacements as required 	2021-24	2026

DO

LATER

2026 30

Summary of City Recommendations & Timeframes DO NOW
/DO SOON
2021 25 New Vehicle Hours 2021 25 • Prepare 5-year resourcing plan featuring two additional 12-hour units
• Execute 5-year resourcing plan with timing of new units determined by
SNEMS Chief 2021
2021 25

SNEMS Chief		
Ramping Up Community Paramedicine		
Prepare multi-year community paramedicine business plan	2021	
Execute community paramedicine business plan	2021-25	
Revise community paramedicine business plan based on initial results		2026-30
Maximizing Alternative Pathways		
 Secure community/agency alternate pathway partnerships 	2021-22	
Design and execute specific alternate pathway initiatives	2022-25	
• Evaluate initiatives and continue to deliver/identify alternate pathway		2026-30
opportunities		

SNEMS Annual Report Card & Business Plan Performance Targets

Recommendation	DO NOW /DO SOON 2021 25	DO LATER 2026 30
Select new Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) and Design Annual Report Car	d	
• KPI selection (City + District)	2021	
• Set KPI performance targets (City + District)	2022	
KPI report card to Council	2023	
Third Party SNEMS Performance Review/Progress Evaluation		
Execute third party review/evaluation	2023	

1.1.6 Moving Forward

This evidence-based 2021-2030 Master Plan puts-forward a series of transformational recommendations. The recommendations are supported and informed by analytics and data. Stakeholder consultation was not central to the development of evidence-based transformation. The urgent need for change precluded meaningful consultation by SNEMS.

However, moving forward stakeholder consultation on *implementing* transformational change will be essential. The following stakeholder consultation priorities are set out to engage SNEMS stakeholders on the path forward.

Implementation Priority – Engaging Health System Stakeholders

Health system stakeholders will be essential partners in securing necessary funding and operational support in both the District and the City. SNEMS looks forward to engaging health system partners and colleagues in the coming years.

Implementation Priority – Engaging First Nations

SNEMS is committed to delivering appropriate paramedic services to First Nations communities and patients in the City and across the District. While First Nations have not been consulted at the front end of the transformation process, their counsel and insights will be actively sought as SNEMS moves forward to implement positive change. In particular, SNEMS will work with First Nations to explore culturally appropriate community paramedicine opportunities.

SNEMS will also commit to collaboration with the Nishnawbe Aski Nation (NAN) on their journey to establish their own paramedic/community paramedicine service.

Implementation Priority – Rebuilding SNEMS with District Partners

District municipalities will be valued partners in delivering new, revitalized SNEMS stations across the District. SNEMS looks forward to station replacement joint ventures on the north shore and beyond.

2.0 Introduction & Methodology

2.1 Towards an Adaptable SNEMS Master Plan

Superior North Emergency Medical Service (SNEMS) is committed to patient-centric, evidence supported delivery of paramedic services within the City of Thunder Bay and across the District.

Building on the progress achieved via its first Strategic Plan, SNEMS is now embarking on a ten-year master planning process. For SNEMS, successful master planning is not about producing a static document featuring rigid "must do" actions. Master planning is a nimble process that addresses strategic priorities in a changing and evolving service delivery landscape. Securing desired patient care results via the SNEMS master plan will not be a straight-line proposition. The 2021-2030 Paramedic Services Master Plan will be a living document that adjusts course as the circumstances and challenges facing SNEMS change.

This initial version of the SNEMS master plan has been driven by system performance data and evidence. The master plan is also a values driven planning tool - patient centric principles have informed resource allocation decisions and restructuring recommendations.

The challenges facing SNEMS are complex and significant. Solutions set out in this Master Plan are not incremental - they are in fact transformational. Transformational change at SNEMS is required to safeguard pre-hospital patients in the post-COVID era where the City of Thunder Bay and District municipal funders face tight budgets and finite resources.

2.1.1 Impact of the COVID Pandemic

The preparation of the SNEMS 2021-2030 master plan has been impacted/shaped by the COVID pandemic. Initial work on the SNEMS master plan in early 2020 preceded the COVID lockdown. As the initial wave of the pandemic progressed, SNEMS pivoted all available resources to focus on core service delivery and the battle against COVID 19. SNEMS leadership put its master plan work on hold - an entirely appropriate decision under the circumstances.

The Performance Concepts Consulting master plan team proceeded with a "deep dive" into SNEMS performance analytics and call volume demand forecasting during the 3-month pause to battle COVID. Performance Concepts executed this "deep dive" analytics work online in collaboration with SNEMS long time "data stewards" InterDev Technologies.

During the summer of 2020 SNEMS leadership were able to reengage in master plan production and the Performance Concepts team was able to execute necessary fieldwork in Thunder Bay and the District - while adhering to all recommended infection control/social distancing/mask protocols.

While the COVID pandemic complicated the production of the SNEMS 2021-2030 master plan, the final product has not been compromised. SNEMS and City of Thunder Bay staff have exhibited grit and perseverance in the development of the master plan. The Performance Concepts team has been honoured to support SNEMS in this undertaking while SNEMS continues to serve on the frontlines in the battle against the COVID 19 pandemic.

2.1.2 Master Plan Principles

The challenges facing SNEMS are both myriad and complex. Establishing strategic priorities and driving transformational change in an organization is never easy. Competing priorities for finite resources must be recognized and triaged using evidence-based, rational analysis.

The 2021-2030 SNEMS master plan has been prepared according to the following overriding patientcentric principle:

SNEMS must deploy its finite resources in a rational and responsible manner that safeguards the greatest possible number of current and future pre-hospital patients - regardless of where they reside in Thunder Bay or the District.

SNEMS is obligated to consider "best efforts" mitigation of any potential adverse impacts on existing communities/populations in the course of its evidence-based deployment of resources.

2.1.3 Team-Based Approach to Building the SNEMS Master Plan

The City of Thunder Bay has established a master planning *Oversight Team* consisting of the following City staff change management leaders:

- General Manager Development & Emergency Services Department
- Chief Superior North EMS
- General Manager Corporate Services & Long Term Care and City Treasurer
- Manager Realty Services

Within SNEMS the Chief has created a *Paramedics Working Group* to provide advice/feedback on the operational aspects of the master plan. SNEMS Managers, Supervisors, City medics and District medics sit on the Working group.

The City's master plan *Oversight Team* and the Performance Concepts project team have briefed representatives of the City and District SNEMS bargaining units on the issues and potential recommendations being considered during the preparation of 2021-2030 SNEMS Master Plan.



short/medium term by the added impacts of COVID debt load. While a pre-COVID SNEMS master plan might have envisioned incremental progress, a post-COVID SNEMS master plan will need to consider transformational change. Provincial funding solutions going forward will be increasingly difficult to secure, and a demonstrated willingness to consider transformational change may well be a pre-requisite for securing strategic infusions of Provincial funds.

2.2.2 Asset Management Pressures and Ontario Reg 588/17

The Province has mandated a sustainable asset management model for phased adoption across the Ontario municipal sector. By 2023, Ontario municipalities must implement the following asset management model/components:

- 1. Comprehensive asset inventory.
- 2. Asset condition ratings.
- 3. Measurable asset preservation service levels (i.e. asset quality to be maintained over time).
- 4. Sustainable life-cycle asset management maintenance/capital program.
- 5. Sustainable rehab/replacement financial plan to maintain service levels & implement life-cycle program.

An Additional Pressure: O. Reg. 588/17 ASSET MANAGEMENT

- By 2023 the Province has mandated ALL municipalities as follows:
 - 1. Establish asset inventories + condition ratings
 - 2. A life cycle/service level assessment needs to be completed for each facility/asset class
 - 3. Municipalities will have to budget for timely replacement of assets according to their life cycles
- Decisions over municipal sector asset/facility replacement can no longer be deferred (Including EMS bases)
- Decisions are imminent (by 2023)

PERFORMANCE

O Reg 588/17 mandates "good government" sustainable asset management practices and accountable stewardship of taxpayer-funded public assets. Municipalities will no longer be able to "kick the can down the road" by eroding asset quality over time in order to avoid politically or financially difficult life-cycle capital funding commitments.

Much work remains to be done across Ontario municipalities (including Thunder Bay and District municipalities) to meet the mandated requirements of Regulation 588/17 by the fast-approaching 2023 deadline.

The 2021-2030 SNEMS Master Plan will need to secure compliance with O. Reg. 588/17 mandates and deadlines.

2.3 SNEMS 101 – Governance, Funding & Operations

2.3.1 City Council Governance Role

The City of Thunder Bay Council has the legislated authority/accountability for SNEMS governance, budgeting and operations. This accountability applies within the boundaries of the City and across the entire District. District municipal Councils do not have legislated/official input into SNEMS governance, service levels, or budgets.

2.3.2 SNEMS Funding Model

The property tax funded portion of SNEMS operating costs is apportioned among the City and District municipalities based on their relative ability-to-pay. The ability-to-pay formula uses a given municipality's percentage of taxable weighted assessment to establish that same municipality's share of the SNEMS property tax supported budget.

There is no "benefits received" component to the SNEMS cost-sharing formula. For example, the location of a SNEMS station based inside or outside a given municipality has no impact on that municipality's relative share of the SNEMS tax supported budget.

			11,920,793	Α	В
			2	018 Levy	
	Weighted Assessment	(%)	Estimated Total Levy	Quartely Billing	
City of Thunder Bay	13,645,177,258	81.02%	9,658,682	2,414,671	
Town of Greenstone	638,570,906	3.79%	452,010	113,002	
Town of Marathon	149,126,822	0.89%	105,559	26,390	
Township of Conmee	63,786,065	0.38%	45,151	11,288	
Township of Dorion	45,895,796	0.27%	32,487	8,122	
Township of Gillies	37,094,756	0.22%	26,257	6,564	
Township of Manitouwadge	51,582,996	0.31%	36,513	9,128	
Township of Neebing	320,264,059	1.90%	226,698	56,674	
Municipality of Nipigon	93,831,029	0.56%	66,418	16,604	
Township of O'Connor	68,471,636	0.41%	48,467	12,117	
Township of Oliver & Paipoonge	780,023,069	4.63%	552,136	138,034	
Municipality of Red Rock	42,172,731	0.25%	29,852	7,463	
Township of Schreiber	42,935,180	0.25%	30,391	7,598	
Municipality of Shuniah	745,633,810	4.43%	527,794	131,948	
Township of Terrace Bay	116,379,309	0.69%	82,379	20,595	
District Municipalities			2,262,111	565,528	
Total	16,840,945,422	100%	11,920,793	2,980,198	

Current SNEMS Budget Apportionment

The costs for SNEMS ambulance resources (and overheads) positioned inside the City of Thunder Bay represented 50% of the 2019 SNEMS property tax supported operating budget.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

The ability-to-pay SNEMS apportionment formula apportions 81% of the required property tax revenues to the City of Thunder Bay.

In 2019, City of Thunder Bay taxpayers covered the entire cost of the City SNEMS supported budget. City of Thunder Bay property taxpayers also funded an estimated \$2.8 million of SNEMS operations across the District.

2.3.3 Distinct City and District Labour Forces

While SNEMS is a single organization imbedded within the City of Thunder Bay, it delivers pre-hospital paramedic services using two distinct pools of paramedics. There is a standalone pool of full time and part time City paramedics. There is also a standalone pool of full time and part time District paramedics. Each pool of paramedics belongs to their own distinct bargaining unit.

The differences in City versus District work locations, patient care challenges, and work environments has contributed to the existence of two distinct City and District frontline paramedic cultures.

This silo-based delivery model is unique among Ontario paramedic services. It creates a whole series of operational, deployment and service delivery challenges for SNEMS leadership. The inflexibility of the City/District paramedic silos makes it more difficult to address on-the-road staffing gaps that are in turn creating measurable patient care risk.

Many of the District paramedics are "suitcase medics" that reside in Thunder Bay but travel to remote stations across the District for the duration of their shifts. This reality compounds the challenges of securing predictable/adequate on-the-road staffing at multiple District stations.

2.3.4 Implications for the Master Plan

Thunder Bay City Council has the sole authority to approve/implement the recommendations included in the SNEMS 2021-2030 Master Plan.

From a funding perspective, Council will need to balance City of Thunder Bay taxpayer interests with the patient care requirements within the City and across the District.

Improving SNEMS flexibility to deploy its valued/skilled paramedics across the currently City and District resourcing silos will be an important factor in securing consistent levels of on-the-road deployed vehicle hours for patient care.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

2.4 Methodology: An Evidence-Based Approach

SNEMS staff and the Performance Concepts team have successfully collaborated in the midst of the COVID pandemic to execute the following master planning methodology across 2020.

2.4.1 SNEMS System Performance Analytics

Performance Concepts has prepared a SNEMS analytics profile to provide a historical snapshot of SNEMS workload and performance.

The analytics profile contains a brief set of integrated SNEMS (City + District) workload indicators. The majority of the analytics profile provides a deeper dive into the standalone City and District delivery models. In the District, the focus is on selected areas/SNEMS bases that are impacted by recommended service delivery transformation.

The analytics profile covers call volumes, response times, system busyness and code zero trends across 2015-2019. COVID has skewed 2020 performance data, and therefore it is not considered in this master plan.

2.4.2 Service Demand Forecast

The Performance Concepts team has prepared a service demand forecast that extends well beyond the ten-year time horizon of this 2021-2030 master plan. The demand forecast is calculated using a mix of Ministry of Finance population projections for the Thunder Bay CMA (Census Measurement Area) and SNEMS patient count data sorted by age cohorts. The demand forecast calculation engine addresses aging tsunami demographic realities and the expanding propensity of the public to call 911 for assistance. Outputs from the demand forecast model include the following base case outputs:

- Annual paramedic calls up to 2046
- Annual paramedic required vehicle hours of work (time-on-task) up to 2046

A revised scenario for projected calls and vehicle hours of work has also been developed to reflect demand reductions that could be generated by upscaled community paramedicine and alternate pathways.

2.4.3 Internal SNEMS Consultations

Performance Concepts has executed wide ranging interviews with SNEMS management, supervisors and an assortment of staff with specialized roles/support functions.

Performance Concepts has also executed SNEMS-wide online surveys of paramedics (using Mentimeter.com) to explore workplace and system performance improvement opportunities.

The SNEMS Chief created a Master Plan advisory committee to provide counsel and feedback over the course of master plan production. This committee has provided periodic feedback to the Chief and the Performance Concepts team at critical points in the master planning process.

2.4.4	Evaluation of District Bases (Asset Management Compliance)
	Performance Concepts has conducted an on-site District-wide functional evaluation of SNEMS stations. This evaluation was conducted under SNEMS staff oversight and met all COVID infection control protocols. The results of this functional evaluation have informed the sustainable asset management recommendations contained in this master plan.
2.4.5	First Nations Service Delivery Opportunities
	A number of District bases provide paramedic services to primarily First Nations patient populations. The cost of paramedic services delivered by these District bases merit modified/enhanced senior government funding. The master plan addresses funding fairness for bases serving First Nations.
	This master plan also addresses efforts currently underway by the sovereign Nishnawbe Aski Nation (NAN) to develop its own paramedic service. SNEMS and the Performance Concepts team have engaged with NAN representatives to initiate ongoing collaboration around building/transitioning to a NAN paramedic service that would function across communities currently served by SNEMS.
2.4.6	"As Should Be" Restructuring and Resourcing – City SNEMS
	Evidence supported recommendations have been developed to ensure the City SNEMS model is deployed/resourced across the 10-year master planning horizon to secure targeted response times, maintain appropriate levels of system busyness, and effectively manage Code Zero unit availability impacts.
2.4.7	"As Should Be" Restructuring and Resourcing – District SNEMS
	Evidence supported recommendations have been developed to ensure the District SNEMS model is restructured/transformed in order to deploy/deliver reliable paramedic services launched from a rationalized set of functionally appropriate bases.
2.4.8	SNEMS Organization Design
	Performance Concepts has collaborated with the Chief to develop an "As Should Be" re-designed SNEMS management/leadership structure. The structure addresses the need for logistics/support upgrades - a must-have catch-up requirement to keep pace with frontline service growth that has occurred since the 2012 SNEMS strategic plan was approved and largely implemented.
2.4.9	Implementation Roadmap
	An implementation Road Map has been developed based on the following phasing:
	• A <i>Do Now/Do Soon</i> phase that extends across the first 5 years of the master plan
	• A <i>Do Later</i> phase that extends across the second 5 years of the master plan
	A 3 rd party progress assessment and master plan refresh are also recommended for Q4 2022 in order to maintain transformation momentum.

3.0 SNEMS Stakeholder Consultations

3.1 Dialogue with SNEMS Superintendents & Support Staff

Performance Concepts has executed interviews/dialogue sessions with a wide range of SNEMS superintendents and providers of specialized support/logistics functions. Themes from these diverse and wide-ranging conversations are highlighted below:

Internal Communications:

- Staff at all levels have consistently identified the need for improved communications across SNEMS. Input from staff is not always dealt with in a consistent fashion across the City and District services or across distinct stations.
- Staff agree that excellence in communication is required to push back against a silo-based culture in SNEMS caused by geographic separation of staff/bases.

Who Does What:

 There is a consensus that roles and responsibilities across SNEMS are blurred. There is a need for focused accountability about exactly who is responsible for a range of support/logistics and specialized functions. At the same time, these same roles require cross-trained staffing backup and coverage. Job descriptions are reported to be out of date and in need of a refresh. According to feedback, standard operating procedures are not well understood, and reporting hierarchies are not always clear.

Workload:

• Staff consistently report that workload capacity across SNEMS is being strained to the limit, and that unanticipated absences of staff result in cascading service delivery problems.

General Administration:

 There is a consensus that admin functions have not always been viewed as an organizational priority. Expanded frontline resources have provided extra pressure on administrative staff. Leadership team direction does not always flow through a single communication channel and direction can sometimes feel contradictory when coming from multiple sources.

> SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

Staffing:

 SNEMS staff all understand there is a serious disconnect between the necessary rostered shifts and the ability of SNEMS to fill these shifts. SNEMS has a significant an ongoing problem getting the required vehicle hours of service on the road. There is a constant/grinding workload associated with filling shifts.

Mental Health:

• Staff report that SNEMS needs a dedicated Psychologist and structured programs so medics with mental health issues are not left to their own devices. Many staff believe there is nobody to advocate for them in the system.

City/District Divide

 City and District SNEMS feature two distinct cultures driven by divergent work circumstances and reinforced by the existence of two collective agreements. Each culture is distinctly unsympathetic to the challenges faced by the other. In the case of the District, staff report the culture differs internally across widely separated stations. SNEMS is not viewed as a cohesive organization by its frontline medics.

Sick Time:

• Staff report that patterned sick time is tolerated (no repercussions).

SNEMS Vision:

• Staff are unable to align their work with a SNEMS patient-centric vision of service delivery because the entire organization is mired in "reaction mode" trying to keep its head above water. Structural changes are needed to get on track.

Headquarters:

• Staff report that SNEMS single-start HQ is showing multiple signs of overflow due to staffing growth. No lockers and not enough room for the vehicles.

3.2 Frontline Paramedic Surveys

Two distinct on-line Mentimeter.com surveys were conducted to secure feedback from City and District paramedics. With some participants only completing select questions, it was difficult to determine the exact breakdown of City/District participants. An estimated 51 City medics completed the majority of survey questions, as did 37 District medics - for a total of at least 88 survey respondents across SNEMS. More full-time than part-time medics completed both surveys.

The full survey results are documented in Appendix A. A summary of the survey responses follows:

- With regards to Fleet and Equipment, all responding medics feel that SNEMS vehicles are reasonably up-to-date, and that the equipment provided is appropriate. Similarly, vehicles are generally seen as well stocked and "ready-to-go" with the right supplies. While District medics feel they have adequate time to check vehicles at the beginning of each shift, City medics strongly disagreed.
- Surprisingly, District medics generally feel better trained and able to maintain their skills than City medics:



Figure 1 - District responses re: Training/Skills

- City medics feel significantly less safe while on duty and are less aware of the supports available to them for mental wellness. City paramedics agree that the public/patients often confuse their uniforms with those of the Police.
- In the District, stations are generally seen as sub-par from a functional and comfort point of view, with medics agreeing that they base their shift selection location on the quality of station more often than by the shift pattern or expected workload.
- City medics strongly agree that the "single start" Headquarters is getting crowded as SNEMS staffing has grown but are neutral on whether supply and logistics have kept up with growth.

City medics also do not feel that vehicle cleaning requirements are, for the most part, cutting into calls during their shift.

- Both City and District medics strongly feel that SNEMS have insufficient frontline coverage to staff all shifts and call-ins and felt they could not always get time off when needed. City medics strongly feel they cannot count on getting off-shift on-time.
- District staff feel they enjoy a nice balance of calls and breaks. As expected, City staff report having more than enough work to do during a shift. Breaks are hard to guarantee, with City staff feeling "run off their feet" much of the time.
- With regards to Staff-Management Relations, both City and District staff feel that management does not understand their concerns, are not trying to improve SNEMS performance or address problems. City medics feel less aware of the SNEMS operational and patient care priorities, and whether these priorities have been explained to them:





 City medics strongly agree that more has to be done to address hospital offload delays, ramp-up Community Paramedicine, utilize alternate pathways, and add more vehicle hours to deal with Code Zeroes. District staff support modernizing District bases and eliminating low-priority Code 1-2 transfers on the North Shore, as well as securing additional funding for bases serving primarily First Nation communities.







4.0 SNEMS System Performance Analytics

4.1 System-wide SNEMS Analytics

The following profile of summary level SNEMS workload data and response time metrics informs the 2021-2030 SNEMS Master Plan's overall change management narrative. Each analytics chart/table is supported by a brief factual narrative statement.

SNEMS Dispatched Code 3-4 Calls



Despite no confirmed growth in the City/District population served, SNEMS has experienced moderate growth in dispatched Code 3 "urgent" calls and significant growth in Code 4 "emergency" calls. Dispatched Code 4 emergency call volumes in 2019 have increased by 34% compared to 2015.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



Average Code 3-4 On-Scene Response Times

Despite significant growth in call volumes, SNEMS average on-scene Code 4 (emergency) response times have held steady across 2015-2019. Additional vehicle hours of service added across the 2015-2019 period were essential to maintain SMEMS Code 4 response times.





When disaggregated by age cohorts, SNEMs Code 4 calls are relatively heavily in senior citizen age cohorts > 65 years of age. By 2019 the calls in these senior citizen age cohorts had increased significantly over 2015 levels.



SNEMS Code 4 In-service Time By Age Cohort

In-service time for Code 4 calls clustered in the senior citizen > 65 years of age cohorts had increased significantly by 2019 compared to 2015. In 2015 4,087 hours of in-service time was spent caring for patients > 65 years old versus 6,085 hours in 2019 - a 49 percent increase.



Average in-service time per call for patients > 65 years old had increased significantly by 2019.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

4.2 City Model Analytics

The following profile of City SNEMS system performance analytics has informed the recommendations put forward in the SNEMS 2021-2030 Master Plan. Each analytics chart/table is supported by a brief factual narrative. A summary of observations/Findings will be offered at the conclusion of the analytics profile.





While the distribution pattern of calls across the day are the same, the volume of City SNEMS dispatched Code 4 calls in 2019 are markedly higher than 2017 for every hour of the day.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



Code 4 "Lights and Siren" return trips to hospital represent a consistent 10% to %12 percent of Dispatched Code 4 calls. This pattern of Code 4 Returns is typical of Ontario ambulance systems.



Code 4 Return average on-scene response times are stable across time of day between 2017-2019.



After shedding significant Code 1-2 transfers workload after 2015, City SNEMS system busyness (Unit Hour Activity or UHA) has been stabilized in the 32% to 35% range. The addition of vehicle hours of service was required to secure stable UHA in the face of significant call volume growth across 2016-2019.



2015 system busyness by hour of day reflected a City SNEMS in workload crisis. Structural reform was urgently needed in the form of non-urgent Code 1-2 transfer work being redeployed to provincially funded non-paramedic contractors.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



By 2017 City SNEMS UHA levels at peak workload hours of the day had stabilized. Peak UHA levels below 45% reflect a very busy (but probably sustainable) paramedic workload.



Stable City SNEMS UHA at peak workload hours of the day remained stable in 2019 - hovering around 40% or lower. Investments in additional vehicle hours of service were/are paying off.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN







In 2015 the incidence of zero-available-units was approaching crisis levels. Ambulance availability shortages were endemic across all hours of the day.



In 2015 the equivalent of 54 calendar days were spent at zero-available unit levels. Code 4 calls happening when City SNEMS was at Code Zero featured measurably eroded response times compared to SNEMS Dispatched Code 4 averages below 9 minutes.
2017 Zero Available Units: # Occurrences



By 2017 the incidence of Code Zero shortages had decreased significantly. Ambulance units previously occupied with Code 1-2 work could now respond to Code 3-4 calls.



By 2017 time at Code Zero equated to a total of 7 calendar days - a huge improvement over 2015 crisis levels. Next Code 4 call response times are deeply concerning - significant risk factor.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

2019 Zero Available Units: # Occurrences



2019 Code Zero occurrences continued the downward trend from 2015 crisis levels and were also lower than 2017.



By 2019 time at Code Zero equated to a total of 4.5 calendar days - a significant improvement over 2017 levels. Next Code 4 call response times (when at Code Zero) continue to be deeply concerning.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

4.3 SNEMS Demand Forecast (Base Case Scenario)

This demand forecast (base case) sets out the daunting call volume and time-on-task challenges facing SMEMS without implementing significant system restructuring. Attention will be focussed on the 2021-2030 period of the long-term forecast. The first 10-years of the forecast mirror the time horizon of the master plan and they are more likely/dependable to unfold as presented, compared to the out-years beyond the next decade. The demand forecast contains a significant caveat. The First Nations population residing in Thunder Bay and the District is not accurately reflected in the 2016 census. A recent study suggests this uncounted First Nations population is approximately 20,000 people. Moving forward, SNEMS should collaborate with First Nations researchers to update the demand forecast to better reflect the actual First Nations population.



Population Forecast Supporting SNEMS Service Demand Forecast

The Ontario Ministry of Finance population projections for the Thunder Bay CMA are a key ingredient and the data backbone of the demand forecast. The Province predicts a flat no-growth population across 2021-2030.

However, the senior citizens >65 age cohorts of the Thunder Bay CMA population are going to experience significant growth (see chart below). This aging tsunami is a demographic certainty as baby boomers join these > 65 years old population cohorts. The much-discussed aging tsunami is affecting health care across Ontario. SNEMS will not be exempt from the service demand impacts of the aging tsunami.



Seniors > 65 Years of Age = Aging Tsunami on the March

Beyond the aging tsunami, an even more profound service demand driver is becoming increasingly apparent. Across all age cohorts, the public is becoming increasingly likely to request services by calling 9-1-1 (see table below). Service requests per capita have increased steadily (5% +) across 2015-2019.

Growing Likelihood to Call 911 Driving Demand Forecast



Change in Service Calls per capita



SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN The base case forecast of SNEMS calls is set out in the chart below. This forecast accounts for the impacts of the aging tsunami as well as the impact of increasing public willingness to call 9-1-1 for assistance. The 2021 to 2030 period is both instructive and daunting from a budget/service delivery perspective. Forecast service requests/calls in 2021 are 41,733. By 2030 at the end of the master planning time horizon, forecast service requests/calls have increased to 64,742. This represents an increase of 23,009 calls over ten years - an increase of 55%. A Thunder Bay property tax base experiencing no significant growth in taxable assessment cannot absorb the budget impacts generated by the annual 5-6 percent call volume increases featured in the base case demand forecast.

Base Case Forecast: Projected Service Requests/Calls



Calls Per Year Projection



SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

4.4 Community Paramedicine and Alternative Pathways

4.4.1 Re-imagining Paramedicine

The traditional municipal approach of adding ambulance vehicle hours of service to deal with increasing call volumes is not sustainable in the medium to long term. Although population growth in the Thunder Bay region is flat, the "aging tsunami" and an increasing propensity to call 9-1-1 by all age cohorts, continues to drive both call volumes and "time on task".

The 5.5%+ projected annual increases in SNEMS call volume (base forecast) across the next decade and beyond is not sustainable. Thunder Bay taxpayers cannot afford to add a \$500,000 12-hour ambulance crew every second year with no end in sight. Can we reimagine new ways of doing business?

4.4.2 Dispatch Enhancements

For many years, Ontario ambulance calls have been prioritized using a computerized triage tool called Dispatch Priority Card Index (DPCI). This tool was developed by the Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care. DPCI uses extremely cautious algorithms for assessing patient condition - more than 70% of 9-1-1 requests for ambulance service are dispatched at Code 4 lights and siren status. Confirming the overly cautious nature of the DPCI algorithm, when paramedics arrive on-scene and evaluate the patient, only 10% of these dispatched Code 4 calls are deemed "life threatening" and return to hospital with lights and siren. With at least 70% of total calls classified as Code 4 emergencies, ambulance resourcing must be maximized to ensure targeted on-scene response times can be achieved. The opportunity to queue less serious calls and focus on truly life-threatening calls is being missed

The Ministry of Health and Long-Term Care is presently converting its communications centres from DPCI to the Advanced Medical Priority Dispatch System (AMPDS), long felt to be the worldwide gold standard in ambulance call triaging. AMPDS allows communicators to more sensitively categorize the call by chief complaint and set a determinant level ranging from **Alpha** (minor) to **Echo** (immediately life-threatening) relating to the severity of the patient's condition. The AMPDS system also uses the determinant **Omega** which may be a referral to another service or other situation that may not actually require an ambulance response. In the Niagara Region EMS communications centre, AMPDS triaged calls may be referred to a nurse in the dispatch centre for further assessment, health advice, referral, etc. Only a small number of calls are dispatched "hot" (with lights and siren), and lower priority triaged calls can be queued until an ambulance is available. Fewer lights and siren responses culminate in safer roads and more availability for true emergency calls.

4.4.3 Propensity to Call 9-1-1

A unique factor driving call volume growth regardless of population growth and aging, is the propensity to call 9-1-1. Whether driven by better awareness through media of emergency services available, prevalence of higher risk activity such as non-prescription drug use, or an "I want it now" mentality, the

number of ambulance calls per capita has been steadily climbing. Propensity to call is increasing at a rate often exceeding that of population growth and the aging tsunami In an effort to reverse this problematic trend, ongoing "Make the Right Call" 9-1-1 media campaigns are essential to re-educate the general public.

4.4.4 Community Paramedicine

A number of other innovations are showing promise on a smaller scale, and need to be ramped up significantly to make a difference:

"**Community paramedicine**" is an umbrella term that describes a more proactive and preventive approach to care provided by expanded scope paramedics. Most recently, COVID-19 highlighted the potential of Community Paramedics through critical roles at assessment clinics and assisting during staffing shortages at long term care facilities in crisis.

The concept of community paramedicine is quite broad in scope, allowing individual paramedic services across Ontario to develop programs that best meet the needs of their health care populations. During more "normal" times, three potential benefits of community paramedicine are as follows:

- Chronic disease management and injury prevention
- Reduced calls to 9-1-1 and transport to hospital for non-urgent patients
- Providing appropriate follow-up care for high-risk patients without hospital readmission

Community paramedics can aid in routine immunization, disease management and injury prevention by helping patients manage chronic diseases such as diabetes and hypertension. Simple home checks to verify compliance with prescription medications, assessing blood pressure, oxygen saturation and blood sugar, as well as confirming safety of the home environment can go a long way towards keeping patients out of hospital. Utilizing remote monitoring technology to assist with self-monitoring and alerting paramedics when values move out of normal range, ensures proactive action can be taken with the patient's family physician before symptoms escalate and there is a need to go to hospital. Point-of-care blood testing will soon compliment the community paramedic's skill set.

A number of studies have shown significant reduction in paramedic calls for those patients enrolled in community paramedicine programs. A group of Ontario medically complex "high EMS users" reduced their 9-1-1 activation by 24%. Remotely monitored Ontario patients reduced 9-1-1 activation by 26% and transportation to the emergency department by 31%. Rural Nova Scotia ambulance users reduced annual trips to emergency departments by 40%. Residents in an Ontario high-risk social-housing setting showed a 19% reduction in EMS calls to their housing complex.

Two additional initiatives in the Niagara Region show significant potential as well. Activities of their Falls Intervention Team (paramedic and occupational therapist) have resulted in a 3.8% reduction in calls for

falls among seniors in 2020, compared to the two previous years of increasing falls (9.4% and 14.2% respectively. Transports to hospital of these fall patients were reduced by 6.3%. Further, the Niagara EMS Mental Health and Addictions Response Team (paramedic and mental health nurse) has generated a 6.9% reduction in transport of mental health patients to Emergency Departments, despite an 8.1% increase in the number of calls.

The potential for innovation is considerable. As noted earlier, initiatives can and should be customized to local needs and capabilities.

With specific regard to SNEMS, the difference between City and District paramedic operations should be noted. District paramedics for the most part, operate at low utilization levels and have the capacity to conduct community paramedicine visits without additional costs or impacting emergency response. City paramedics on the other hand, are highly utilized for emergency coverage and have little excess capacity for community paramedicine. Dedicated community paramedics are necessary to provide these services in the City. SNEMS has a good head start with 100% provincially funded CP programs already providing:

- Remote Patient Monitoring
- Chronic Disease Management
- Emergency Department Admission Avoidance
- Home & Community Care

While hesitation exists for municipal Council/paramedic services to take on expanded funding responsibilities for ongoing primary health care initiatives, the above noted studies demonstrate that injecting lower-cost community paramedicine interventions has the potential to significantly reduce the ongoing growth in higher cost traditional ambulance services.

It is not unreasonable to expect a 20-30% reduction in forecast ambulance call volumes once a customized mix of community paramedicine programs are scaled up appropriately. A strong business case can be made for community paramedics reducing the future cost of traditional ambulance service.

4.4.5 First Nations

Poor social determinants of Health in First Nation communities such as overcrowded housing, high unemployment and unsafe drinking water, contribute to poorer health outcomes. In addition to a disproportionate prevalence of mental health problems and addiction disorders, the rate of chronic diseases such as diabetes, hypertension, renal disease and cancer is markedly elevated when compared to the general population. First Nation populations that live in remote areas have limited access to healthcare, other than local health centres. The travel distances faced by First Nations patients can result in delays in accessing care or unmet needs for preventative and primary care services.

Across the Thunder Bay District, SNEMS supplies a currently underutilized professional health care resource that can provide home-based care beyond 9-1-1 emergency response. Three SNEMS District

stations (Armstrong, Longlac and Nakina) currently deliver a majority of their 9-1-1 responses on First Nations territory. When not involved in emergency response, medics at these bases can be utilized in regular home monitoring of clients with chronic disease. Approximately 10% of the First Nation population is considered to have chronic disease significant enough to require home care and monitoring.

While community paramedicine research among First Nation communities is scant, SNEMS can expect some reduction in 9-1-1 call activation, but more importantly better health care at little or no additional cost to taxpayers.

4.4.6 Alternate Pathways

Traditionally, paramedics were required to transport all patients to a hospital emergency department. Recent legislative change now allows for transport to alternative destinations instead. Paramedics can now transport patients directly to an alternative facility that is most appropriate for their complaint (e.g. a sobering centre or mental health facility) rather than funneling all patients through a crowded emergency department. Not only do patients benefit from more timely and appropriate care, but ambulances are not tied up on hospital "offload delays" and freed up more quickly for emergency service.

4.4.7 Assess, Treat-and-Release or Assess-and-Refer

Similarly, not every patient needs to be transported at all. Unless a patient refused care, Provincial legislation previously required any patient who requested an ambulance to be transported to hospital. Formalization of protocols will provide paramedics with the following options:

- Allow paramedics to assess patients at the scene, provide needed care and then release the patient
- Allow paramedics to assess the patient and determine they are safe to refer to their GP or clinic (providing a transportation chit if necessary)

These options can/will quickly free up ambulance resources to re-engage in delivering emergency services.

4.5 Revised Demand Forecast

This modified demand forecast has been prepared to document the mitigation impacts of AMPDS, community paramedicine, and alternate pathways. The forecast attempts to model the demand mitigation of approximately 30 percent across the forecast. It is unlikely that the structural reforms required to secure a 30 percent demand mitigation can be achieved in the first five years of the 2021-2030 master planning horizon. Therefore, the likely net impact on demand across the 2021-2030 Master Plan will be significantly less - likely impacting only years 6-10 of the planning horizon.

Modified Forecast: Projected Service Requests/Calls



The projected call volumes in the modified scenario for 2030 are 49,460. This is more than 15,000 fewer calls than the base case forecast of 64,742 service requests/calls in 2030. Annual call volume increases in the modified forecast run between 3.6% to 3.7% compared to 5.5% + in the base case.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

Modified Forecast: Percentage Change in Service Requests/Calls

Call Growth (%)



Performance Concepts believes that a hybrid demand path (a mix of the two demand forecast scenarios) is the most likely outcome across the 2021-2030 master planning horizon. The first 5-years of the master plan workload will more strongly reflect the "base case" call volume forecast, while the final 5 years should migrate towards the "modified" scenario if core master planning recommendations are successfully implemented.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.0 SNEMS District Model

District analytics have only focussed on District bases that are central in the restructuring recommendations set out in the 2021-2030 Master Plan. These bases are as follows:

- Nipigon & Red Rock twinned bases
- Schreiber & Terrace Bay Twinned bases
- Beardmore

As was the case with City SNEMS, a brief factual narrative supports each analytics chart/table.



SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.1 Analytics Overview - Twinned Bases on North Shore (Nipigon/Red Rock + Schreiber/Terrace Bay)

District analytics have only focussed on District bases that are central in the restructuring recommendations set out in the 2021-2030 Master Plan. These bases are as follows:

- Nipigon & Red Rock twinned bases
- Schreiber & Terrace Bay twinned bases
- Beardmore

As was the case with City SNEMS, a brief factual narrative supports each analytics chart/table.



Nipigon-Red Rock delivers a significant amount of non-urgent transfers (Code 1-2 plus difficult-tocalculate up-coded Code 3 calls). These calls pull one of the two twinned ambulances out of their emergency response catchment area virtually every day of the Monday-Friday work week. While Code

1-2 calls are on the decline, dispatched Code 3-4 combined workload has increased significantly in 2019.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



Schreiber-Terrace Bay delivers a significant amount of non-urgent transfers (Code 1-2 plus difficult-tocalculate up-coded Code 3 calls). These calls pull one of the two twinned ambulances out of their emergency response catchment area most days of the Monday-Friday work week. Dispatched Code 3-4 combined workload has been relatively stable across 2017-2019 while Code 1-2 calls have increased.



The dispatched Code 4 on-site average response are stable/acceptable across the two "twinned" north shore emergency coverage catchment areas covered by the 4 bases.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



Nipigon-Redrock: Code 4 Return Call Volumes & Response Times (2017-2019)

Code 4 "Lights and Siren" Return volumes and their average response times are stable/acceptable across 2017-2019.



Code 4 "Lights and Siren" Return volumes are stable. While Code average response times for Return calls are increasing, they continue to be faster that the response times for the broader pool of Code 4 dispatched calls.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



The 4 twinned north shore bases feature system busyness levels ranging from 12% to 15% in 2019 for their combined Code 1-4 call volumes workload.



System busyness (UHA) peaks during the mid-day hours when Code 1-2 workload and Code 3-4 workload is being executed in parallel. UHA drops off during hours when Code 1-2 transfer work is not typically executed.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



System Busyness – Unit Hour Activity by Day of Week (2017-2019 combined)

Monday-Friday feature the highest levels of system busyness since these are the days the majority of Code 1-2 long-haul transfers into TBRHSC take place.

5.2 Analytics Overview - Beardmore Base

The Beardmore base has an operating budget of more than \$800,000 for a 12-hour ambulance unit. Beardmore executed fewer that 80 dispatched Code 4 calls annually between 2017 and 2019. In 2019 this equated to a Code 4 response executed every 4.7 deployed shifts.



SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



It was necessary to combine 3-years of Beardmore Dispatched Code 4 data to build-out this hours-ofday call volume chart. There are not enough call data points across 2017-2019 to generate a meaningful pattern.





Code 4 response times fluctuate by hour of day due to the small number of calls (with varying response times) in any given hour.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



Code 4 Returns are the truly serious emergency calls. Unlike the Dispatched Code 4 calls, Code 4 Returns occur once a paramedic has put eyes on a patient and evaluated their condition. This patient evaluation is conducted using the Canadian Triage and Acuity Scale (CTAS). CTAS 1-2 are the most serious and generate an immediate Code 4 Return to hospital priority. Across 2017-2018 only three CTAS 1 patients received a Code 4 Lights and Siren Return to hospital by Beardmore. In 2019 there were only 11 patients treated by Beardmore that were evaluated as CTAS 2-3. In 2019 Beardmore executed a Code 4 Lights and Siren Return every 33 days (about once a month).



Only 3% of the budgeted/deployed Beardmore vehicle hours were engaged in Code 1-4 call volume work. The other 97% of the budgeted hours were deployed but not utilized.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN



Peak busyness by hour of day at the Beardmore does not exceed 4.5% UHA.



Peak busyness by day of week at the Beardmore base does not exceed 4.2% UHA.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.3 District Base Functionality Review

5.3.1 SNEMS District Station Condition Assessments

A series of SNEMS station condition assessments were conducted by various engineering firms across 2011-2012. A summary of those engineering assessments appears in Appendix B. Various SNEMS stations have undergone renovations as a result of those assessments.

As a core component of preparing the 2021-2030 Master Plan, Performance Concepts carried out a District stations assessment tour between August 10th -13th 2020. Accompanied by a SNEMS Deputy Chief, Performance Concepts Senior Associate John Prno executed an updated <u>operational</u> assessment of each District station and associated paramedic residence(s). A summary of these District station assessments follows, based on operational "best practices". The following functional checklist was used to evaluate each District station:

- Appropriate Exterior Signage
- Drive-thru Bays
- Secure access, e.g., keypad entry
- Adequate space to walk around each stored vehicle and to unload stretcher from the rear of the vehicle
- Adequate floor drain and interceptor capability
- Water Resistant Surfaces in vehicle wash areas
- Smoke Detectors/Carbon Monoxide Monitors
- Emergency Lighting
- Emergency Exit Signage
- Emergency Generator
- Eyewash Station
- Adequately sized powered Overhead Door(s) with safety stop and manual release
- Time to full door open of less than 20 seconds
- Electrical Vehicle Plug-in(s) that prevent cord from crossing garage floor
- Garage Ventilation and Exhaust controlled by Carbon Monoxide/Nitrogen Dioxide monitors
- Separate Individual Sleeping Rooms
- Separate Washrooms and Showers each with Ventilation Fans
- Kitchen with fridge, freezer, stove/oven, microwave
- Laundry facilities
- Sufficient number and size of Staff Lockers
- Sufficient Secure Storage for medical supplies
- Adequate Staff Parking

5.3.2 Shuniah Station

The Shuniah Station is a combination of i) a leased partial single bay located in Shuniah Fire and Emergency Services Hall #1 and ii) a leased commercial trailer located behind the Fire Hall. The following functional observations have been documented:

- The ambulance bay is not drive-thru
- Space in the fire hall is extremely limited, with no room behind the ambulance to remove the stretcher or properly clean the vehicle without moving the vehicle outside
- There is no floor drain in the bay used for the ambulance, requiring water to be squeegeed into the next bay during washing.
- Although ventilation and exhaust fans exist, they are not controlled by Carbon Monoxide/Nitrogen Dioxide monitors.
- Emergency power is provided by a fixed natural gas generator that is limited to providing power to the fire hall itself.
- The staff trailer has a lounge, two small bedrooms and a single washroom.







5.3.3 Armstrong Station

The Armstrong station is a SNEMS-owned, unique renovation of a previous structure that now consists of two separate buildings: a 2-bay garage and a crew quarters building. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Ambulance bays are not drive-thru
- Emergency power to the entire station is provided by a fixed diesel generator
- A Radon gas control system is in place
- Space in the vehicle bays is limited, with no room behind the ambulance to remove the stretcher
- Overhead door opening time is slightly slower than ideal at 23 seconds.
- The garage floor condition is severely deteriorated
- There is a single washroom in the crew quarters, but no shower as sleeping quarters are provided off-site.

Overnight accommodations are provided in two SNEMSowned houses located at #4 and #6 Northern Drive, less than a kilometer from the station. Both are 2-bedroom houses with the expected living room, kitchen, single washroom and shower. Neither house has central air conditioning, relying instead on portable floor units. Wood siding, trim and shingles on the houses require attention. The house located at 4 Northern Drive has a clothes washer on-site as well as employee-owned fitness equipment.









SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.3.4 Red Rock Station

The Red Rock station is a small single-bay structure leased from the Nipigon hospital. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Ambulance bay is not drive-thru
- Pavement condition is fair
- Emergency power is provided by a portable gasoline generator which presently does not work
- Water level in the floor drain is high, but this is likely due to delayed interceptor cleaning amid COVID-19
- The Stop button on the garage door control is not functional
- Medical supplies are limited as this station restocks at Nipigon

Overnight accommodations are provided 301-30 Frost St. - a leased 2-bedroom apartment in a 3-story walk-up apartment building less than 1 km from the station. There are no laundry facilities (these are available at the station) and there is only one washroom/shower. The front walk area is in poor condition.



5.3.5 Nipigon Station

The Nipigon station is a two-bay, 2,080 sq ft structure leased from the Nipigon hospital. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Ambulance bays are not drive-thru
- An additional bay is presently required to hold the PRU at the station
- Pavement requires some repair
- Emergency power is provided to a limited number of red outlets through the hospital generator
- Space in the vehicle bays is limited with no room behind the ambulances to remove stretchers
- Sleeping quarters are provided inside the station a single bedroom and a futon in the lounge area. No laundry facilities are provided. Crews utilize laundry facilities at the Red Rock station



5.3.6 Schreiber Station

The Schreiber station is a single bay in a privately-owned commercial complex, with crew quarters located on the second floor in a public area of the building. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Ambulance bay is not drive-thru
- There is no emergency generator/backup power
- There is no central air conditioning, relying instead on portable floor units
- There is a single washroom/shower
- There is a dangerous foot gap in the fire escape stairway
- Sleeping quarters are provided inside the station a futon in a bedroom/office and lounge furniture



5.3.7 Terrace Bay Station

The Terrace Bay station is a two-bay structure leased from the Terrace Bay hospital. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Bays are not drive-thru
- Space in the vehicle bays is limited with no room behind the ambulances to remove stretchers
- The front of the apron is deteriorating and requires repair
- There is no emergency generator/back-up power
- Garage ceiling paint is peeling due to water damage
- There is no central air conditioning, relying instead on portable floor unit
- Sleeping quarters are provided inside the station a futon in a bedroom/office and a second bedroom



SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.3.8 Marathon Station

The station is a three-bay structure leased from the Marathon hospital. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Bays are not drive-thru
- Winter tires are stored between bays
- Overhead door opening time is slightly slower than ideal at 22 seconds
- Emergency power is provided by a portable generator with plug-in located on the deck
- There is no central air conditioning, relying instead on a window unit
- Sleeping quarters are provided inside the station a bed in the lounge and a second bedroom



5.3.9 Manitouwadge Station

The Manitouwadge station is a three-bay two-storey structure leased from the Manitouwadge hospital. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Bays are not drive-thru
- Small round floor drains are utilized instead of traditional trench drains
- There is central air conditioning, but it needs to be supplemented with a portable floor unit
- Emergency power is provided by an aging portable generator
- Sleeping quarters are provided inside the station two bedrooms. Lockers and washrooms are located on the lower level of the station. The lower level training room also contains employeeowned fitness equipment





SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.3.10 Longlac Station

The Longlac station is a two-bay structure leased from the Municipality of Greenstone. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Bays are not drive-thru
- Pavement is heaving in front of the bay doors
- Linoleum is torn and lifting
- Emergency power is provided by a portable generator
- Sleeping quarters are inside the station a lounge and a second bedroom



5.3.11 Nakina Station

The Nakina station is a one-bay drive-thru structure attached to the community health centre and leased from the Municipality of Greenstone. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Bay doors are 10' high which is the lower limit of acceptability
- Gas monitors are protected from moisture by a garbage bag
- Pavement has typical breakdown due to weather and front requires masonry repairs
- Emergency power is provided by a portable generator
- There is a single washroom/shower. Sleeping quarters are provided inside the station two bedrooms



SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.3.12 Geraldton Station

The Geraldton station is a SNEMS-owned three-bay structure. The following functional observations have been documented:

- Bays are not drive-thru
- Emergency power is provided by a fixed natural gas generator
- Individual washrooms/showers (as well as a separate handicapped washroom) are available.



Well-equipped overnight accommodations are provided at 1202 Main St., less than 1 km from the station. This leased three-bedroom apartment on the second floor of a private home includes two bathrooms.



5.3.13 Beardmore Station

The Beardmore station is a combination of a single bay structure leased from the Municipality of Greenstone and a leased commercial trailer located behind the station. The following functional observations have been documented:

- A portion of the station is sealed off due to mould issues
- Bay is not drive-thru
- Floor drain is inadequate in size
- Oxygen cylinder securement is ad-hoc at best
- Emergency power is provided by a portable generator
- There is no central air conditioning, relying instead on a portable floor unit
- There are two unisex washrooms/showers.

Overnight accommodations are provided in the leased trailer located behind the station. There are two bedrooms and an unused central area. Air conditioning is provided by two wall AC units. There is no washroom in the trailer.







SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.3.14 Upsala Station

The Upsala station is a single bay structure attached to the health centre and leased from the Upsala Volunteer Ambulance Association. The following functional observations have been documented:

- There is no pavement
- Ambulance bay is not drive-thru
- Floor drain is inadequate in size
- Gas monitors are protected from moisture by a garbage bag
- Emergency power is provided by a fixed diesel generator
- A water purification system is in place that provides water for both the station and health centre
- There is no central air conditioning, relying instead on portable floor units
- Laundry equipment is located in the health centre
- There is a single washroom and separate shower. Sleeping quarters are provided inside the station two bedrooms.



5.3.15 Conmee Station

The Conmee station is a combination of a single bay (leased in a shared two-bay Conmee Fire Department out-building) plus a leased commercial trailer that comprises the crew quarters. The following functional observations have been documented:

- There is no pavement
- Ambulance bay is not drive-thru
- Floor drain is inadequate in size
- There are no Nitrogen Dioxide/Carbon Monoxide monitors
- An exhaust fan exists but seems manually controlled and undersized. We were unable to confirm its acceptable functioning during our visit.
- There is no emergency generator or back-up power at this site
- There is a single washroom/shower
- Sleeping quarters are provided through two bedrooms in the trailer





SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN
5.3.16 Summary of District Stations Functional Assessment

While currently "functional", there is no District station that meets all the regulatory/functional requirements for a sustainable paramedic service in Ontario:

- 13 stations lack drive-thru bays
- 6 have inadequate air conditioning
- 6 have a single washroom/shower
- 4 have insufficient room indoors to remove the stretcher from the ambulance
- 4 have either a non-working or no emergency generator
- 4 have inadequate floor drainage in the garage bay
- 2 have inadequate garage ventilation and/or Carbon Monoxide/Nitrogen Dioxide monitoring
- 2 have slower than ideal garage door opening times
- 1 has a garage door barely meeting the minimum acceptable size
- 1 has a portion of the station sealed off for mould issues
- 1 has a dangerous foot gap on the fire escape

Only three stations: (Geraldon, Longlac and Manitouwadge) approach full compliance. Four other stations (Shuniah, Schreiber, Beardmore and Conmee) are in need of replacement in the first half of the Master Plan's 10-year timeframe. The balance of stations all require significant attention, and perhaps replacement in the second half of the Master Plan. Only the Conmee station currently has a plan for replacement. Ongoing station maintenance is the responsibility of the existing station landlords (typically not SNEMS). There may well be an annual operating budget impact for SNEMS associated with station replacements and/or refurbishments.

The overnight accommodations required for SNEMS suitcase medics that are provided on-site are for the most part "bare bones", making adaptive reuse of previous offices to meet fire regulations. One District station has no washroom in the sleeping trailer used. Three stations feature off-site owned/rental accommodations. Only one of these housing sites has separate washroom facilities.

5.4 District Restructuring – Setting Up the Dominoes

5.4.1 District Staffing Concerns

Maintaining compliance with an approved staffing pattern normally requires providing an adequate number of full-time medics to fill the normal schedule, supplemented by sufficient part-time medics to fill shift vacancies caused by full-time staff taking vacation, stat holidays and sick time. For the most part ambulance services implement this model via the 20% factor (i.e. one additional full-time equivalent of part-timers for every four full-time paramedic). Longer term absences can be addressed through an adequate part-time staffing pool - or by full-time "float" paramedics that step into schedule vacancies for the duration of the absence. In an urban paramedic system such as the City SNEMS, short notice absences (e.g., illness during a shift) are normally filled quickly with a part-time paramedic arriving to resolve any down staffing within an hour.

SNEMS District staffing is disproportionally affected by a number of complicating factors such as travel time to the worksite, distance and the on-call nature of overnight operations at most bases. A task as simple as replacing a paramedic who is ill at work, can result in down staffing for much of a shift before an available paramedic can be found and travel to the station.

"Suitcase" Medics

The ideal approach to supporting northern remote communities is to have medics live in the community that they work in. This situation is broadly beneficial - with medics supporting local businesses and paying local property taxes. This ideal reality does not exist for SNEMS. While there are a number of locally residing paramedics, many of those working in the District prefer to reside in or near Thunder Bay. This results in SNEMS schedules designed to accommodate long "suitcase medic" commutes to the worksite - where paramedics living in Thunder Bay travel to a District station and reside there for 4 to 7 days depending on the particulars of the schedule.

District schedules require paramedics to be "on-duty" for part of a given day and then "on-call" for the remainder of the day. In practical terms this means medics must reside at or near the District station to maintain after-hours response times. To address difficulties in obtaining short-term accommodations for suitcase medics, SNEMS has provided space in District stations to serve as bedrooms, or where space does not allow, has rented or purchased off-site accommodations for paramedics to use. The quality of these accommodations has an impact of willingness of staff to work in particular District station locations (see District Station functional assessments in this plan).

"Rest Breaks"

The District staffing model is designed to provide on-site "on-duty" coverage in a station during the portion of the 24-hour day when 9-1-1 calls are most likely to occur. During the remainder of the day, medics are "on-call" and wear a pager to alert them to 9-1-1 calls. When paged, medics respond to the

station in a timely manner and complete the call. Provincial regulations mandate an 8-hour "rest break" before these "on-call" paramedics can begin a regular "on-duty" shift. For example, an overnight call that ends at 4 am would require "rest" until noon later that day regardless of the dayshift being scheduled to begin at 7am. During these rest periods, 9-1-1 emergency coverage is usually provided by the next nearest emergency vehicle from another station.

5.4.2 District Down-staffing Analysis

Down-staffing is the inability to maintain compliance with the approved staffing pattern. Down-staffing can be either partial (one member of the ambulance crew is not available perhaps due to illness) or full (both members of the ambulance crew are not available due to a mandated rest break). Where partial down-staffing occurs, the remaining paramedic provides "first response" emergency care to the patient until a transporting ambulance arrives on-scene.

During 2019, an estimated 1,597 hours of full down-staffing (mostly due to rest breaks) occurred across the District. This full down-staffing service delivery interruption represented the equivalent of 133 twelve-hour shifts with District stations unstaffed.

There was an estimated 9,572 hours of full + partial down-staffing across the District during 2019 equivalent to 798 twelve-hour shifts without required staffing in place. This District total compares to 542 hours or 45 twelve-hour shifts down-staffed in the City SNEMS operations in 2019. By station, Armstrong has the most significant number of down-staffs, but service delivery is less impacted than other stations due to its 24-hour on-duty coverage. The following table provides detailed estimates of down-staffing by District station for 2019.

	Full Down-staffing Hours	Partial Down-staffing Hours	Combined Down- staffing Hours
Armstrong	378	2118	2496
Beardmore	192	729	921
Conmee	221	650	871
Geraldton	20	182	202
Longlac	111	698	809
Manitouwadge	9	113	122
Marathon	31	79	111
Nakina	16	289	305
Nipigon	162	701	863
Red Rock	40	264	304
Schreiber	65	402	467
Shuniah	161	907	1068
Terrace Bay	127	254	381
Upsala	64	588	652
TOTAL	1597	7975	9572

Table 1 - 2019 Down-staffing Hours by Station

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

5.5 **First Nations Enhanced Funding and Partnership Opportunities**

SNEMS is honoured to provide pre-hospital 9-1-1 emergency response and other supportive pre-hospital health care services to First Nations communities across the District.

The Armstrong station is already funded at a 100% level by senior levels of government. That funding model was the result of previous evidence-based advocacy undertaken by SNEMS. The table below documents the fact that across 2017-2019 72.8% of Armstrong calls responded to patients on First Nations land.

The Armstrong precedent is clear - if 100% senior government funding was appropriate for the Armstrong station due to the 73% call volume threshold for First Nation communities, then that same threshold should apply to other SNEMS stations.

The table below also demonstrates that the Nakina station meets/surpasses the Armstrong First Nations workload precedent required to secure 100% senior government funding. Nakina's First Nation territory calls represent 77% of the total 2017-2019 call volume.

While not meeting the Armstrong First Nations workload precedent, the Longlac station delivers almost 2/3 of its total 2017-2019 call volume to First Nations territory calls. Enhanced funding beyond the standard 50/50 cost sharing with the Province would appear to be worthy of discussion/consideration for a base with a strong majority of First Nations calls.

Station	All Calls*	Station Area FN Calls	% FN Calls	All FN Calls	% FN Calls
Longlac	1618	905	55.93	1005	62.11
Armstrong	1585	950	59.94	1154	72.80
Nakina	630	464	73.65	485	76.98
Beardmore	287	91	31.70	106	36.93

First Nations Community Support by SNEMS

*2017-2019 combined

Beyond issues associated with "fair share" funding arrangements, SNEMS is embracing an evolving opportunity to work with the Nishnawbe Aski Nation (NAN) as they work towards the creation of their own paramedic service. Mr. Ovide Mercredi (NAN Health Transformation Lead & Negotiator) has called upon the Governments of Ontario and Canada to support the implementation and provision of Paramedic Services and Community Paramedicine in NAN Communities.

SNEMS Chief Gates and the Performance Concepts team have met with Mr. Mercredi and the NAN technical team tasked with building a NAN Paramedic and Community Paramedicine program. The NAN

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

team is in the process of building a business case to secure a paramedic/community paramedicine service. The introduction to the NAN business case includes the following powerful statement:

"Fundamental to the equal application of lawful standards, guidelines, and services in First Nation communities it is unacceptable that NAN communities do not have timely access to Paramedic Services. All residents of Ontario are entitled to equal and equitable application of standards and Paramedic Services."

Superior North EMS and Performance Concepts have been asked to participate in the refinement of the evolving NAN business case. Chief Gates and Performance Concepts President Todd MacDonald are personally and professionally committed to the NAN project- including the potential transfer of SNEMS assets to NAN where appropriate.

The SNEMS 2021-2030 Master Plan will allocate staff time/capacity as required to support NAN as this important initiative moves forward.

6.0	District SNEMS Recommendations
6.1	A Restructured Non-Urgent Transfers Model
6.1.1	Recommendation
	SNEMS should secure/deploy ongoing Provincial funding to implement a scheduled/routed non-urgent patient transfer system across the north shore of the District. This model should employ an appropriately configured multi-patient transfer vehicle(s). A scheduled/dependable multi-patient transfer vehicle will ensure north shore patient procedures at Thunder Bay Regional Health Sciences Centre (TBRHSC) can be coordinated/scheduled based on the timing of the ride - as opposed to arranging ad-hoc rides based on an arbitrary appointment time.
	The new north shore non-urgent patient transportation solution system should be coordinated/overseen by a north shore hospital. The new system should not include paramedic staffing/trip provision. Provincial funding received by SNEMS should be used to create a service delivery contract with the selected hospital - essentially a pass-through funding model. Annual results reporting should be a feature of the service delivery contract.
	A mandatory outcome of the new non-urgent patient transportation system should be the elimination
6.2	of dispatched Code 1-2 long-haul transfers to TBRHSC by SNEMS units at the Nipigon, Red Rock, Schreiber and Terrace Bay stations. Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases)
6.2 6.2.1	Schreiber and Terrace Bay stations.
	Schreiber and Terrace Bay stations. Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases)
	Schreiber and Terrace Bay stations. Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases) Recommendation Once the north shore non-urgent patient transportation model is operational, the current simultaneous daytime deployment of four 12-hour SNEMS vehicles across the Nipigon, Red Rock, Schreiber and

6.3 North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations

O Reg 588/17 will require municipalities across Ontario to develop a plan for timely/appropriate replacement of assets that have reached the end of their useful life. Thunder Bay/SNEMS need to comply with this asset management mandate. The current twinned configurations of the Nipigon/Redrock and Schreiber/Terrace Bay north shore stations is a product of commendable local volunteerism that built these stations decades ago - well before the Province assigned land ambulance delivery responsibility to municipalities. There is no viable business case/asset management strategy that supports the replacement of the existing four stations under O Reg 588/17.

6.3.1 Recommendation

Two new SNEMS ambulance stations should be constructed to replace the existing twinned north shore stations - Nipigon/Redrock and Schreiber/Terrace Bay. The two new stations should accommodate the current number of ambulances deployed from the existing four stations.

The replacement station for Nipigon/Redrock should be located close to the existing Nipigon station in order to provide timely support to the catchment area currently covered by the Beardmore station. This master plan makes no recommendation for the location of the station to replace the Schreiber/Terrace Bay stations.

Both new stations should be designed by SNEMS, owned and built by District local municipalities or *First Nations. SNEMS should occupy the stations as a long-term lease tenant.* The long-term lease should cover the construction and maintenance costs of the new bases over their projected life cycle. The Province will cover 50% of the capital costs for these replacement stations.

This reconfigured two-station model avoids approximately \$4 million in station replacement capital costs associated with a status-quo replacement scenario under O Reg 588/17 for the four existing stations.

6.4 Beardmore Restructuring

The following overarching principle appears at the beginning of this master plan:

SNEMS must deploy its finite resources in a rational and responsible manner that safeguards the greatest possible number of current and future pre-hospital patients - regardless of where they reside in Thunder Bay or the District.

SNEMS is obligated to consider "best efforts" mitigation of any potential adverse impacts on existing communities/populations in the course of its evidence-based deployment of resources.

The Beardmore station analytics profile makes it clear that the current deployment of a 12-hour ambulance does not meet a value-for-money test, nor is it consistent with the above noted master plan principle. The Beardmore ambulance delivers 8,760 paramedic hours that generate a 3% level of system busyness (UHA).

6.4.1 Recommendation

The existing Beardmore ambulance station should be de-commissioned, and the 12-hour staffed ambulance should be redeployed. The Beardmore unit delivers 8,760 paramedic hours of service annually. 9-1-1 patient transport will be maintained by SNEMS ambulances deployed at Nipigon and Geraldton.

There are two viable redeployment options for the Beardmore 8,760 paramedic hours:

- Redeploy the Beardmore medic/vehicle hours to City SNEMS in order to address ongoing service demand pressures documented in the SNEMS demand forecast. Consistent with this Master Plan's patient-centric approach, the Beardmore redeployment would provide much needed paramedic services to a significant number of future City patients.
- 2. Redeploy the Beardmore medic/vehicle hours across the District in a pattern designed by the SNEMS Chief. The objective would be to reduce down-staffing risk at selected SNEMS District bases caused by the combination of overnight standby and "rest time" provisions in the collective agreement.

SNEMS/City Council should proceed with implementation of one of these viable re-deployment options as per the timing set out in the master plan's Implementation Roadmap.

6.4.2 Recommendation

SNEMS should deploy a single paramedic/Paramedic Response Unit (PRU) in Beardmore as leavebehind mitigation for the closure of the Beardmore station. This leave-behind paramedic resource should be staffed ten hours per day/five days per week. This equates to 2,600 annual paramedic hours. The scheduling of the leave-behind medic/PRU should include the days of the week where the existing community health centre is closed. The community health centre in Beardmore currently operates Monday-Thursday. The net result would be 7 days/week healthcare coverage for Beardmore and close by First Nations communities. The medic/PRU would deliver a mix of 9-1-1 emergency coverage and coordinated community paramedicine as part of the community health team.

This recommendation must be implemented in seamless coordination with the Beardmore station closure and the re-deployment of the existing 12-hour Beardmore vehicle.

On a net basis (implementing both of the above recommendations) the 6,160 paramedic hours leaving the Beardmore area represent 257 12-hour ambulance shifts - or 4.9 shifts per week.

6.5 First Nations Funding and Collaboration Opportunities

6.5.1 Recommendation

Consistent with the Armstrong 100% funding precedent already agreed to by the Province, Thunder Bay City Council and the SNEMS Chief should engage with the appropriate Ministers/senior staff to secure an enhanced funding model for the Nakina and Longlac stations that primarily serve First Nations communities.

6.5.2 Recommendation

City Council and SNEMS should endorse/support the Nishnawbe Aski Nation initiative to create a NAN paramedic/community paramedicine service. The SNEMS Chief should be directed by Council to advise/support NAN on the design and resourcing of the new paramedic/community paramedicine service. SNEMS should report back to City Council at an appropriate time on the potential transfer of SNEMS assets to NAN for purposes of service delivery continuity across communities currently serviced by SNEMS stations and ambulances.

6.6 District Stations 10-Year Replacement Plan

Station recommendations will fall into two categories. The first category is a schedule of required station replacements. The second category is a schedule of required major rehabilitation projects at existing stations. Station replacement capital costs can be funded in part by reduced operating spending on ad hoc suitcase medic accommodation.

6.6.1 Recommendation

Four stations are slated for replacement: Shuniah, Schreiber, Beardmore and Conmee. The sequence of replacement supports the District transformation recommendations included in this Master Plan.

STATION REPLACEMENT PLAN	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025	2026- 2030
New Kakabeka Station							
Nipigon/Red Rock site selection and Station design							
Schreiber/Terrace Bay site selection and Station design							
Nipigon/Red Rock construction							
Schreiber/Terrace Bay construction							
Decommission Beardmore Station							
Shuniah site selection and Station design							
Upsala site selection and Station design							
Shuniah construction							
Upsala construction							

*Estimated station replacement costs of \$2 M per station...total \$8 M across four years. Avoided "status quo" capital costs total \$6 M across four years. Timing assumes District municipal agreement.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

6.6.2 Recommendation

In addition to minor repairs and upgrades noted in the Facilities Condition Assessment, a series of more significant infrastructure upgrades are required at the following remaining stations:

STATION	ASSET UPGRADES
Armstrong	Garage floor rehabilitation
Marathon	Installation of an in-situ standby generator to provide emergency power
Manitouwadge	Installation of an in-situ standby generator to provide emergency power
Longlac	Installation of an in-situ standby generator to provide emergency power
Nakina	Installation of an in-situ standby generator to provide emergency power

* A miscellaneous capital project of \$200,000 can address minor repairs and upgrades plus the five significant upgrades noted above.

7.0	City Recommendations
7.1	New Vehicle Hours
7.1.1	Recommendation
	In order to mitigate the service demand pressures documented in the master plan's demand forecast, SNEMS should develop a Do Now/Do Soon five-year resourcing plan that features the addition of two 12-hour ambulance resources plus vehicles. These additional 12-hour units/vehicles are going to be necessary to manage system busyness levels (UHA) and control the problematic impacts of Zero Available Units on "Next Code 4 Call" response times.
	City Council may choose to re-deploy the Beardmore Station 12-hour unit to City SNEMS in order to supply one of the two required units in the five-year resourcing plan.
7.2	Ramping Up Community Paramedicine
7.2.1	Recommendation
7.2.1	Recommendation Without delay, SNEMS should prepare a multi-year community paramedicine business plan to ensure the scaled-up Provincial funding maximizes potential opportunities to "bend the curve" of the expected call volumes put forward in the 2021-2030 Master Plan's 10-year (base case) demand forecast.
7.2.1	Without delay, SNEMS should prepare a multi-year community paramedicine business plan to ensure the scaled-up Provincial funding maximizes potential opportunities to "bend the curve" of the expected call volumes put forward in the 2021-2030 Master Plan's 10-year (base case) demand
	Without delay, SNEMS should prepare a multi-year community paramedicine business plan to ensure the scaled-up Provincial funding maximizes potential opportunities to "bend the curve" of the expected call volumes put forward in the 2021-2030 Master Plan's 10-year (base case) demand forecast.
7.3	Without delay, SNEMS should prepare a multi-year community paramedicine business plan to ensure the scaled-up Provincial funding maximizes potential opportunities to "bend the curve" of the expected call volumes put forward in the 2021-2030 Master Plan's 10-year (base case) demand forecast. Maximizing Alternate Pathways

8.0 Annual SNEMS Report Card & Business Plan Performance Targets

8.1.1 Recommendation

SNEMS should expand its currently mandated response time performance plan to include other key paramedic system performance metrics.

Expanded City SNEMS system performance targets/metrics should address system busyness, hospital offload delay, and a Code Zero profile. Measurement of community paramedicine/alternate pathways impacts is also appropriate.

Expanded District SNEMS system performance targets should address down-staffing service delivery interruptions and community paramedicine work volumes delivered by existing deployed paramedics.

SNEMS performance targets/results reports should be integrated with the City's annual budget process. The result should be a Results Based Management Plan-Do-Check-Act continuous improvement business planning cycle.



8.1.2 Recommendation

A third party SNEMS performance review/progress evaluation should be undertaken in year 3 of the master plan to provide Council with an update on the impact of Do Now/Do Soon recommendations. This performance review/progress evaluation should be data driven and informed by the recommended performance metrics set out in this master plan.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

Modernizing SNEMS Org Design & Labour Relations

9.0



The SNEMS Staffing "Slinky"

SNEMS priority in recent years has rightly been delivering adequate paramedic resources "on the road' to address call volume pressure, hospital offload delays and Code Zero risk. However, as the forward-facing section of the *SNEMS staffing "slinky"* has stretched forward, its support/logistics tail-end has lagged behind. A delayed investment in necessary supervision and support staff is now required to keep the *SNEMS staffing "slinky"* moving forward in sequence. Performance Concepts has designed a multi-year staffing plan and organization re-design to address this challenge.

The SNEMS organization re-design changes/options supporting the 2021-2030 Master Plan are contained in a confidential addendum. The SNEMS Chief has received this addendum and will be advancing appropriate staffing proposals and organization re-design as part of the annual budget process.

SUPERIOR NORTH EMS 2021-2030 PARAMEDIC SERVICES MASTER PLAN

10.0 Implementation Roadmap

10.1 Relentless Focus on Execution

Initiating significant change to achieve improved organizational performance is always hard. It requires a relentless focus on the execution of a well-designed Implementation Roadmap.

The Performance Concepts team has created a carefully phased roadmap; balancing a quick/timely pace of change with a recognition that capacity limitations need to be realized/respected.

The Roadmap is phased across the following two time periods: **Do Now/Do Soon** (2021-25) and **Do Later** (2026-2030).

10.2 District Recommendations

Recommendation	DO NOW /DO SOON 2021 25	DO LATER 2026 30
A Restructured Non-Urgent Transfers Model		
Secure funding and establish north shore hospital partner	2021	
• Prepare operational plan/route schedule + secure multi-patient vehicle	2021	
Roll-out operational patient transfer system	2022	
Rationalized Deployment of Vehicle Hours (North Shore Twinned Bases)	1	
 Confirm twinned stations round the clock staffing plan Execute new round the clock staffing plan 	2021 2022	
North Shore Twinned Base Consolidations	'	
Implement schedule contained in recommendation	2021-23	
Beardmore Restructuring	1	
 Confirm leave-behind solution Re-deploy Beardmore 12-hour unit and implement leave-behind solution 	2021 2022	
Decommission station	2022	
First Nations Funding and Collaboration Opportunities		
Advocate for Nakina/Longlac enhanced Provincial funding model	2021-22	
Support NAN paramedic/community paramedicine initiative	2021-23	
District Stations 10-Year Replacement Plan		
 Implement schedule contained in recommendation Make provisions for additional station replacements as required 	2021-24	2026

10.3 City Recommendations

Recommendation	DO NOW /DO SOON 2021 25	DO LATER 2026 30
New Vehicle Hours		
• Prepare 5-year resourcing plan featuring two additional 12-hour units	2021	
• Execute 5-year resourcing plan with timing of new units determined by SNEMS Chief	2021-25	
Ramping Up Community Paramedicine		
 Prepare multi-year community paramedicine business plan Execute community paramedicine business plan 	2021 2021-25	2026-30
Revise community paramedicine business plan based on initial results Maximizing Alternative Pathways	1	2020-50
 Secure community/agency alternate pathway partnerships Design and execute specific alternate pathway initiatives Evaluate initiatives and continue to deliver/identify alternate pathway 	2021-22 2022-25	2026-30
opportunities		2020 3

10.4 SNEMS Annual Report Card & Business Plan Performance Targets

Recommendation	DO NOW /DO SOON 2021 25	DO LATER 2026 30		
Select new Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) and Design Annual Report Card	1			
• KPI selection (City + District)	2021			
 Set KPI performance targets (City + District) 	2022			
KPI report card to Council	2023			
Third Party SNEMS Performance Review/Progress Evaluation				
Execute third party review/evaluation	2023			

11.0 Conclusion

This evidence-based Master Plan puts-forward a series of transformational recommendations. The recommendations are supported and informed by analytics and data. Stakeholder consultation was not central to the development of evidence-based transformation. The urgent need for change to mitigate patient risk precluded meaningful and time consuming front-end stakeholder consultation. Consistent with patient centric master planning principles, data and evidence determined the "What" storyline of the 2021-2030 Master Plan.

However, moving forward stakeholder consultation on *implementing* the Roadmap's transformational change will be essential. The following consultation priorities will require engagement with SNEMS stakeholders on the equally important "How" implementation storyline of the Master Plan.

11.1 "How" Implementation Priority – Engaging Health System Stakeholders

Health system stakeholders will be essential partners in securing necessary funding and operational support in both the District and the City. SNEMS looks forward to engaging health system partners and colleagues in the coming months and years. A prime example is the start-up of a North Shore non-paramedic non-urgent patient transfer system. Funding for this important District transformation "domino" from the LHIN is firming up and progress appears imminent. "How" consultations will work out the operational details between SNEMS, North Shore health system actors and a potential patient transportation contractor.

11.2 "How" Implementation Priority – Engaging First Nations

SNEMS is committed to delivering appropriate paramedic services to First Nations communities and patients in the City and across the District. While First Nations have not been consulted at the "What" front end of the transformation process, their counsel and insights will be actively sought as SNEMS moves forward to implement positive change. In particular, SNEMS will work with First Nations as valued partners to explore culturally appropriate community paramedicine opportunities, and secure 100% senior government funding for District stations meeting the Armstrong precedent for primarily serving a First Nations patient population.

SNEMS will also commit to ongoing collaboration/dialogue with the Nishnawbe Aski Nation (NAN) on their journey to establish their own paramedic/community paramedicine service.

11.3 "How" Implementation Priority – Rebuilding SNEMS with District Partners

District municipalities will be valued partners in delivering/building new, revitalized SNEMS stations across the District. SNEMS looks forward to station replacement joint ventures on the North Shore and beyond.

SNEMS is also committed to dialogue when it comes to implementing/scheduling a leave-behind Paramedic Response Unit/community paramedicine resource after Beardmore closes. "How" questions can focus on expanding weekly coverage at the Beardmore community health centre.

81



2021 WORK PLAN & STAKEHOLDER DIALOGUE SESSIONS

Superior North EMS Master Plan

June 2021

Introduction

The Superior North EMS 2021-2030 Master Plan has been received by Council. City staff have recommended the Master Plan be adopted by Council as a guiding document moving forward. This 2021 Work Plan addresses District-specific and SNEMS-wide recommendations contained in the Master Plan (see below for District). These District recommendations are like dominoes; their order and sequencing are vitally important. The final section of the work plan deals with system-wide issues.



1.1	District Work Plan Modules
	The following <i>Workplan modules</i> need to be planned in detail, and then executed with focus, to achieve the recommended SNEMS restructuring across the North Shore and beyond.
	1. North Shore Non-Urgent Transportation (already partially underway)
	2. North Shore Base Consolidation: Nipigon/Redrock
	3. North Shore Base Consolidation: Schreiber/Terrace Bay
	4. Beardmore Ambulance Redeployment
	5. Beardmore Community Paramedicine Initiative
	6. Advocating for First Nations "Fair Funding" @ Nakina & Longlac Bases
	7. Supporting the NAN Paramedic Service/Community Paramedicine Initiative
1.2	Upfront District Stakeholder Coordination - A Work Plan Priority
	North Shore District municipalities and First Nation communities are important stakeholders in the design and execution of the 2021 Work Plan. A series of 4 Up-front Work Plan dialogue sessions are a necessary first step in the detailed design and execution of the 7 Work Plan Modules. The following dialogue sessions (including District municipal and First Nation representatives) are envisioned:
	i. Nipigon/Red Rock Session addressing
	 North Shore Non-Urgent Transportation (already partially underway) North Shore Base Consolidation: Nipigon/Redrock
	ii. Schreiber/Terrace Bay Session addressing
	 North Shore Non-Urgent Transportation (already partially underway) North Shore Base Consolidation: Schreiber/Terrace Bay
	iii. Beardmore Session addressing
	 Beardmore Ambulance Redeployment Beardmore Community Paramedicine Initiative
	iv. First Nations Session addressing
	 Advocating for First Nations "Fair Funding" @ Nakina & Longlac Bases Supporting the NAN Paramedic Service/Community Paramedicine Initiative
	These stakeholder coordination/working sessions will establish an evidence-based consensus for moving forward with the seven Work Plan modules linked to Master Plan recommendations.

District Detailed Work Plan/Modules (2021)			
Once the Upfront dialogue sessions have been held, SNEMS and District municipal/First Nation stakeholders can coordinate efforts to build-out and execute the detailed Work Plan modules.			
Setting up the Work Plan Dominoes			
• The City/SNEMS will prepare a standardized format/template to document each of the seven Work Plan Modules. The seven templates (when populated) will each represent a standalone roadmap for execution.			
Sequencing the Work Plan Dominoes			
• An estimated 3-4 sequencing options will be developed and tested with appropriate District stakeholders. A preferred sequencing option will emerge, and it will be set out on a detailed multi-year critical path for progress tracking. Some Modules will almost certainly overlap or run in parallel. City staff estimate the overall sequencing period will not surpass five years. A stakeholder confirmation session will be held.			
Work Plan Module Production/Data Population			
Potential components to be positioned in each of the 7 Work Plan Modules are as follows:			
 i. Issue Definition/Current State ii. Desired Restructuring/Final State iii. Transition Issues/Challenges iv. Cost Impacts to Secure Desired Change/Final State v. Core Stakeholders/Partners for Change vi. Critical Path/Specific Action Items 			
The City/SNEMS will prepare/populate each of the draft Work Plan Modules prior to execution. A stakeholder confirmation session will be held.			
District Work Plan Next Steps			
 Upfront Stakeholder Coordination - North Shore/Beardmore. (Summer 2021) Detailed Work Plan Development/Modules Population (Late Summer/Early Fall 2021) Council Progress Update & 2022 Work Plan (Q1 2022) Work Plan Modules Execution - Completed (Q4 2021 to Q4 2022) 			

3.0	System-wide Work Plan Components					
3.1	System Evaluation/Performance Measurement					
	 Analytics update on SNEMS response times/peak system busyness/Code Black to support 2022 capital and operating budget process (Q3 2021) Annual SNEMS performance reporting scorecard - standardized analytics + targets. (Q1 2022) 					
3.2	Operational Planning & Restructuring					
	 Identify additional ambulance requirements (capital and staffed vehicle hours) via just-in-time resourcing (Q3 2021) 					
	Continue Shuniah Station Replacement Planning/Preparations (2021 & 2022)					
	 Advocate for Dispatch System refinements and accelerated Implementation Plan - new Provincial AMPDS algorithm. (Ongoing beyond 2021) 					
	Collaborate with local health system stakeholders to develop public awareness program					
	(featuring a variety of formats) to manage/reduce public usage of 9-1-1 for Paramedic Services. Capitalize on experience gained in other Ontario jurisdictions (Initiate in 2021 and continue in 2022)					
	 Ramp-up the scale of community paramedicine programs to flatten the call volume demand curve. (Underway in 2021 & continue in 2022) 					
	 Advocate for permanent provincial funding for scaled-up CPP (Ongoing beyond 2021) Identify further non-hospital alternative destinations and protocols for patients that help flatten the call volume demand curve. Examples: safe sobering sites, much-needed mental health sites, treat-and-refer protocols. (Underway in 2021 & continue in 2022). 					



DEVELOPMENT & EMERGENCY SERVICES DEPARTMENT 2nd Floor, Victoriaville Civic Centre 111 Syndicate Avenue South P.O. Box 800 Thunder Bay, Ontario P7C 5K4 Tel: (807) 625-2216 Fax: (807) 623-2206

<u>Sent by e-mail</u>

May 19, 2021

Re: Superior North Emergency Medical Services Master Plan

I am writing to introduce myself to you as the new General Manager of Development & Emergency Services for the City of Thunder Bay. In this position, I have senior management responsibility for the overall strategic direction of Superior North Emergency Medical Services.

While I am new to this position, I am a long-time member of the City's Executive Management Team and worked with City Council on the development, publication, implementation and tracking of five successive strategic plans.

Together with Chief Gates, I look forward to working with you in the years to come.

The SNEMS 2021-2030 Paramedic Services Master Plan is available for review at www.thunderbay.ca/SNEMS.

Related to the Master Plan, we are developing a work plan, which we will bring to Thunder Bay City Council, the legislated authority for SNEMS governance, at Committee of the Whole on Monday, June 14, 2021. The meeting is livestreamed and archived for a period on the City website (<u>www.thunderbay.ca/watchcouncil</u>).

It is better called a work plan, rather than the previously described implementation plan, because the evidence-based Master Plan contains a series of recommendations or modules that span a decade and will be sequenced, with consultations along the way on how best to achieve the necessary restructuring across the District.

Having said that, the overriding patient-centric principles that informed the Master Plan, remain central to our work:

- SNEMS must deploy its finite resources in a rational and responsible manner that safeguards the greatest number of current and future pre-hospital patients regardless of where they reside in Thunder Bay or the District.
- SNEMS is obligated to consider "best efforts" mitigation of any potential adverse impacts on existing communities/populations in the course of its evidence-based deployment of resources.

We will be updating the analytics associated with the Master Plan this summer and preparing for meetings with core stakeholders this fall, or as soon as it's possible to meet in person. This will involve discussions with core stakeholders and an opportunity for a deep review of up to date, key analytics including existing and forecast demand.

The work plan will consider various sequencing options with core stakeholders and then move forward with an appropriate restructuring pathway to strengthen paramedic service for the long term and achieve our patient-centric principles.

The first module is North Shore Non-Urgent Transportation, which is partially underway, and is being done in partnership with the Ministry of Health, Nipigon District Hospital and McCausland Hospital.

We will keep you informed though direct communications such as this from me and Chief Gates, updates at Thunder Bay District Municipal League, information on our website at <u>www.thunderbay.ca/SNEMS</u> and through meetings as Gommittee of the Whole - June 14, 2021 Fage 131 of 201 discussed above. Should you have any questions regarding the information contained in this letter, please contact me at <u>karen.lewis@thunderbay.ca</u>.

Yours truly,

KM Jewis

Karen M. Lewis General Manager Development & Emergency Services Department City of Thunder Bay

Copy to: Wayne Gates, Chief SNEMS Ernie Kadikoff, Deputy Chief EMS District Operations



Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/	Development & Emergency	REPORT NO.	R 87/2021
DIVISION	Services - Licensing &		
	Enforcement		
DATE PREPARED	06/01/2021	FILE NO.	
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		

SUBJECT Proposed Changes to Fireworks By-law

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report R 87/2021 (Development & Emergency Services – Licensing & Enforcement), we recommend a comprehensive update of the City's fireworks by-law as outlined in this Report;

AND THAT the current by-law, as amended, be repealed and replaced and be presented to Council for ratification on or before October 31, 2021.

LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN

The City's Strategic Plan for 2019-2022 vision for Thunder Bay is One City, Growing Together. Thunder Bay will "foster an inclusive city" and "provide a high quality of life to our citizens."

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report provides Administration's recommendation to repeal and replace the City's Fireworks – Sale and Setting off By-law 45-1993, as amended. The recommended changes include the permitted named days; increase days sales are permitted; reduce the time of day permitting discharge; add permitted weather days; and provide stronger penalties.

DISCUSSION

As part of the review, Administration reviewed by-laws of 22 larger Ontario municipalities and consulted with relevant stakeholders.

Research & Review

In reviewing the possible options or solutions to noise concerns surrounding fireworks, Administration has: reviewed many, larger Ontario municipalities' by-laws and received information from individuals involved in local fireworks sales as well as the Canadian manufacturing industry and the Canadian National Fireworks Association. The following relevant information was derived from that review and is summarized as follows:

- i) Named Days In a review of larger Ontario municipal by-laws, there were none that permitted more than four (4) "named days", while most had two (2) or three (3) "named days". All had Victoria Day and Canada Day, while the third day was either "Diwali Day" or "New Year's Eve". The City currently has seven (7) named days.
- ii) Additional Discharge Days North Bay was the only City found to allow up to seven (7) days prior to the "named days", while the others were split almost evenly with either a) just the "named days" or b) one day before (largely, evenings only). The City currently permits three (3) additional days for discharge before each named day.
- iii) Special Canada Day Variation Some municipalities established special rules, to assist the public to know what alternative weekend can also be used when Canada Day does not fall on a weekend. For example, if Canada Day falls on a Monday or Tuesday, the immediately preceding Saturday is also permitted for discharge. Alternatively, where Canada Day falls on a Wednesday, Thursday or Friday; the Saturday immediately following Canada Day, would also be permitted but not evenings before these additional days.
- iv) Alternate Days, i.e. Rain Date A few municipalities provided that when environmental conditions on the "named days" made it impractical for the setting off of fireworks, the next day (or prior) was deemed to be an alternate "named day". The City currently does not provide for an alternate day.
- v) Discharge Hours Largely, municipalities set the "named days" without hours restrictions; however, many newer by-laws added restrictions to evening hours only, Dusk to 11pm, on each of the "named days", and to the proceeding day, where authorized. The City currently does not specify permitted hours on the permitted days.
- vi) Decibel level restrictions for fireworks The review did not find an example of a by-law which restricted the sale/discharge of consumer (family) fireworks based upon a decibel level of sound emitted. The federal government regulates decibel levels of fireworks produced/sold, as consumer fireworks in Canada; currently there isn't a requirement for packaging to identify the "decibel-sound" of any specific fireworks.
- vii) Noiseless Fireworks Noiseless fireworks do not exist as of yet. Certain fireworks, like fountains or flares, do not have an explosion or "boom" that is found in the majority of fireworks sold in Canada.
- viii) Total Ban on Fireworks In reviewing the by-laws of these larger Ontario municipalities, some were found to require a permit, while some did not regulate fireworks. A By-law prohibiting the sale/discharge, could not be located.

Committee of the Whole - June 14, 2021

ix) Seller Regulation –In reviewing the sample by-laws, some indicated that licences or permits were required by sellers. All regulated the sale/display to the "named days" and usually the seven (7) days immediately prior, some used "business" days prior.

Consultation

In preparation of this report, Administration has consulted with residents whom have contacted the Licensing & Enforcement Division with concerns; long-term sellers/licensed display technicians in the City; the Canadian fireworks industry; and the related Association for Sellers. In Thunder Bay, the sellers acknowledge that the availability and supply of fireworks has greatly increased through the expansion of local (and area) retail sellers, as well as significant marketshare coming from on-line sales availability.

These discussions with suppliers, toward reducing in-City nuisances created by discharge activities, clearly identify that any reduction in the number of "named days" will have a negative impact on corresponding sales. They have identified that the least-profitable current "named days" would be Victoria Day, Labour Day and Lunar New Year (no specific ranking given). It was also identified that some municipalities in western Canada, such as Vancouver, have introduced restrictions (i.e. Oct 31st, only discharge) and permit systems for discharge of residential fireworks that have severely restricted firework sales (and associated discharge issues); but illegal discharges still do occur.

Local residents stated that they have been adversely affected by fireworks discharges, both lawful and illegal, mainly causing sleep-related disturbances and stress/anxiety to their animal pets, as the two main issues concerning fireworks discharges. A small portion of complaints (unverified) related to potentially unsafe handling practices or property concerns related fire/personal safety, as the issues most commonly associated with nuisance discharges.

Recommended Changes to the By-law

Administration believes the 1993 By-law needs a comprehensive update in both form and substance, references, definitions, offence/penalty sections, etc., and would best accomplished by repealing and replacing the existing by-law. The following is a summary of Administration's recommendations:

- 1. Removal of December 31, as a "named day", as the proposed changes will permit discharge of fireworks on New Year's Eve.
- 2. Establish only three "named days": Canada Day, Civic Holiday and New Year's Eve as well as the evening of each immediate, preceding "named day."
- 3. Authorize other recognized religious or cultural days through a new individual permitting process.

- 4. Increase authorized sales days from six (6) days before "named day" to seven (7) business days.
- 5. Restrict the discharge of fireworks to the evening hours, of authorized days only, being "dusk of authorized day, until 12:30 am on day following."
- 6. Provide that an "alternative weather-day" be established as the next day to the authorized day only.
- 7. Provide an additional "discharge-only" date for Canada Day, where Canada Day does not fall on a Saturday or Sunday. The additional day will not to be used for sale date calculations.
- 8. Provide for stronger minimum penalties for first-time offences and establish a system of escalating fines for repeat offenders.
- 9. Establish provisions that makes the property owner, or named-tenant, additionally responsible for discharge of fireworks on any specific property.
- 10. Repeal and replace existing By-law with updated regulatory provisions, including new definitions and required sections.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no financial implications associated with this report.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that Administration should complete a comprehensive update of the City's fireworks by-law as detailed in this Report.

BACKGROUND

At the July 20, 2020 Committee of the Whole meeting, a resolution was passed directing Administration to report back before November 23, 2020 with information and options on potential changes that may include decreased dates established for the setting off of fireworks; the potential of increased support from By-law enforcement to respond to noise complaints relating to fireworks and the ability for the City to enforce a decibel level for the sale of fireworks and accompanying displays.

At the November 16, 2020 Committee Of the Whole, Council passed a referral resolution directing Administration to conduct further review and consultation and report back on or before June 14, 2021 with recommendations to change the fireworks by-law.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:

None.

PREPARED BY: Doug Vincent, Manager – Licensing & Enforcement, Development & Emergency Services

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)	DATE:
Karen Lewis, General Manager – Development & Emergency Services	June 4, 2021



Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/ DIVISION	Community Services	REPORT NO.	R 85/2021
DATE PREPARED	05/27/2021	FILE NO.	
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
SUBJECT	Multi-Use Indoor Sports Facility - E	xpression of Intere	st

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report R 85/2021 (Community Services), we recommend that Council direct Administration to administer an Expression of Interest, as described in this report, inviting proposals from the private sector and other interested organizations for a Multi-use Indoor Sports Facility to respond to both short and long term needs, either at Chapples Park or other locations;

AND THAT Administration report back on the status and outcome of the Expression of Interest by November 30, 2021

AND THAT the report include recommendations or options for Council's consideration;

AND THAT any necessary By-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN

The recommendations in this report support the Grow strategy of the 2019-2022 City of Thunder Bay Strategic Plan – One City Growing Together. Item three in the Grow Strategy suggests "Develop key City infrastructure that builds capacity such as a new multi-use indoor sports facility, the first phase of the Waterfront Trail and a long-term plan for the replacement of Fort William Gardens." The community's need for access to a multi-use, indoor turf sports facility is supported in City of Thunder Bay Council's 2019-2022 Strategic Plan – One City Growing Together, the Chapples Park Master Plan (R48/2017), and the Recreation and Culture Facilities Master Plan "Fit Together" (R152/2016).

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This report recommends a proposed Expression of Interest process to solicit proposals from the private sector and other organizations regarding potential facility solutions for a proposed multi-use indoor sports (turf) facility in a manner that is consistent with the City's Supply Management By-law No. 113-2011 including proposed activities and timelines. The report also suggests proposed minimum facility design requirements and proposed evaluation criteria.

DISCUSSION

Expression of Interest Purpose

Through an Expression of Interest (EOI) process, the City is seeking potential interest from third parties to respond to the community's demand for indoor turf in the short and/or long term. The proposed objectives of the EOI are as follows:

- Identify potential parties interested in addressing the community's need for access to indoor turf;
- Explore various partnership options and structures;
- Capitalize on the collective energies/expertise of interested parties; and
- Optimize and limit the use of public resources.

This EOI is a non-binding invitation to the bidding community to indicate whether there is interest in bidding for the supply of goods/services. Through the EOI process, the City is open to receiving proposals from private sector and other organizations, including the possibility of coalitions, to provide a 'facility' (re-purposed space, lease, new construction) and any/all of the following services - financing, design, construction, operation, maintenance, programming and/or marketing. The City is open to facilitating/brokering innovative and creative arrangements, including but not limited to, private/public partnerships, joint ventures, alternate financing/ownership arrangements. The City is open to solutions that address the community's needs in the short and/or long term. While the majority of turf user groups expressed a preference for the Chapples Park location, the City is open to various site options, on City or non-City lands, as well as various building solutions. The City is willing to consider a proponent's proposal to provide capital start-up for new construction, "fit-up", short or long term lease arrangements, the purchase of 'time', and/or a proponent's contribution and/or role in respect of operating the facility. The City shall not be liable for any expenses incurred, including a proponent's expenses associated with the cost of preparing proposals in response to the EOI. Subject to a proponent meeting mandatory requirements, qualified submissions will be scored against pre-specified criteria with the intent to shortlist proponents with the possibility of inviting them to participate in a second stage procurement process in the form of a possible request for proposal, sole/single source negotiations or other process.

Proposed Minimum Facility Requirements

In addition to meeting mandatory submission requirements prescribed by Supply Management, it is recommended that proponents be informed of any minimum City facility design requirements as they consider and develop their proposals. The design elements will vary based on whether the proposal contemplates a short or long term solution.

Facility Design Elements - Short Term Solution

Minimum Requirements:

- Available mid-October to mid-April
- Provision of FIFA quality indoor synthetic turf multi-purpose playing surface to accommodate a diversity of turf sports; minimum single use playing surface dimension 27.43m x 45.72m (90 x 150 ft.)
- Accessible washrooms within facility solution or immediately adjacent
- Minimum height clearance of 12.19m (40 ft.)
- Readily accessible to parking/public transit (eg within 400 m) and available parking must comply with Zoning By-law
- Accessible by Fall 2023 or sooner.

Recommended Requirements:

- Larger playing surface and ability to partition to accommodate multiple, concurrent users at one time
- Access to change rooms, secure equipment storage, administrative space within proposed building solution.

Facility Design Elements – Long Term Solution

Minimum Requirements:

- Available October to mid-May
- Provision of FIFA quality indoor synthetic turf multi-purpose playing surface approximating or larger than 58m x 95m (190 x 310 ft.) and ability to partition to accommodate multiple, concurrent, diverse turf sport users at one time
- Minimum height clearance of 12.19m (40 ft.).
- 2 lane walking/running track (>318m)
- Accessible washrooms within facility solution or immediately adjacent
- Referee change rooms
- User group change rooms
- Administrative space
- Spectator capacity (900)
- Storage
- Compliance with City's Facility Design Standards Policy
- Readily accessible to parking/public transit (eg within 400 m) and available parking must comply with Zoning By-law
- Compliance with City's Net Zero Strategy (conditional upon Council approval).

Recommended Requirements:

- Preferred location Chapples Park
- Multi-purpose meeting/program space
- Other recreation, sport and/or community amenities in response to identified need
- Food/beverage concession.

Proposed Evaluation Criteria

Administration is recommending that submissions be evaluated in 6 key areas by an internal, multi-disciplinary Technical Committee: experience and capacity; consideration of the community's needs; proposed site; proposed building solution and sustainability; social stewardship; and financial implications for the City of Thunder Bay. Subject to the feedback of the Technical Committee, there is some existing capacity to procure the services of an independent third party consultant to guide the evaluation of proposals.

July 12, 2021	Issue Date for Expression of Interest through CTB BIDS & TENDERS™
July 19, 2021	Non-mandatory Information Session (participation via MS Teams)
Aug 3, 2021	Deadline for Respondent Questions
Aug 16, 2021	Deadline for Issuing Addenda
August 27, 2021	Expression of Interest Deadline
October 4, 2021	Short List Selections
Nov. 8, 2021	Recommendations to CTB Council

Proposed Key Activities/Timelines

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

The Expression of Interest process would be implemented within existing corporate capacity.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that Council direct Administration to proceed with the implementation of an Expression of Interest Process as outlined in this report to solicit proposals from the private sector and other organizations regarding potential facility solutions for a proposed multi-use indoor sports (turf) facility in the short and long terms.

BACKGROUND

At the May 14th, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting, a memo to Council, and a resolution was adopted directing Administration to begin an Expression of Interest process to invite proposals from the private sector and other interested organizations for a Multi-Use Indoor Sports Facility for the short and long terms, at the preferred Chapples Park location or alternative locations.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:

Appendix 1 - Anticipated Facility Demand

PREPARED BY: Kelly Robertson, General Manager, Community Services

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)	DATE:
Kelly Robertson, General Manager, Community Services	June 3, 2021

Appendix 1 - Anticipated Facility Demand

The anticipated demand for indoor turf is informed by a third party study completed in spring 2018 and follow up engagement with potential key end users of a proposed facility in both 2019 and 2020. Individuals representing a total of 15 potential end user groups representing a minimum of 5,500 – 6,600 members responded to surveys. Key anticipated user groups during peak season (October to mid May), prime time (evenings/weekends) include: soccer, football, Ultimate Frisbee, lacrosse, cricket, rugby, and baseball. Peak season, non-prime use (weekdays/daytime) is expected to include students of local school boards, including Indigenous high schools, post secondary institutions, older adults, and possibly corporate leagues. Less demand is expected during off peak (mid May to September) season as turf users prefer to be outside. In addition to turf sport users, the City has received requests from both individuals and groups for the facility to accommodate indoor walking, especially during the winter months.

Three separate engagements involving potential key end users conducted annually between 2018 -2020 suggests the following anticipated demand/user profile for the facility:

- soccer groups (Mens', Womens', Lakehead Express, Thunder Bay Chill) represent 54-74% of demand during peak season, prime time, followed by football (minor, flag, touch) 8 28% and Ultimate Frisbee 4 12%; the balance of turf users (lacrosse, baseball, cricket, rugby) represent 10% or less of peak season, prime time demand
- the majority of key end users will request $\frac{1}{4}$ or $\frac{1}{2}$ pitch bookings
- based on a full field playing surface that approximates 95 100m long x 58 60m wide and a minimum 12.19m high, that can be divided into 4 smaller pitches, pent up demand during peak season, prime time is expected to be at least 28%
- the majority of potential key end users (50 60%) expressed a preference for the Chapples Park location
- potential end users of the proposed facility have identified 11 new events involving 33 event days that could be held between October to mid May annually. Total attendance, including accompanying persons, is expected to be 4,888 with 20% of event participants originating from outside of Thunder Bay (80+ km one way).
- indepth engagement/research into the demand for indoor walking has not been completed to date; however, consultations with over 1,600 community members conducted to inform the Recreation and Facilities Master Plan confirm walking as the most popular leisure/recreation activity (55%). In addition, a former 'Dome Walkers' program that was offered through the former air supported sports dome structure located on CLE lands accommodated over 10,000 walkers during the years it was offered at this facility.


Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/	City Manager's Office - Human	REPORT NO.	R 77/2021
DIVISION	Resources & Corporate Safety		
DATE PREPARED	05/19/2021	FILE NO.	
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
SUBJECT	2020 Employment Equity Report		

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report R 77/2021 (City Manager's Office - Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division), we recommend City Council direct Administration, through the Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division, to continue to support and promote equal opportunities for employment through current and new initiatives as highlighted in the attached Employment Outreach and Retention Plan;

AND THAT the Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division (HRCS) conduct an Employment Equity Survey in 2023, and report the result back to Committee of the Whole in the second quarter of 2024;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to Council for ratification.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Report provides the results of the 2020 Employment Equity Survey (*Appendix A*) as referenced in Report R 72/2018 (Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division).

2020 Employment Equity Survey

The results of the 2020 survey highlight that 49.93% of the Corporation's workforce is comprised of women, 7.20% are Indigenous peoples, 4.43% are visible minorities, 11.95% are persons with disabilities, and 5.10% self-identify as belonging to the 2SLGBTIQ+ community. Combined, approximately 28.68% of the Corporation's workforce represents Indigenous peoples, visible minorities, persons with disabilities, and the 2SLGBTIQ+ community.

The Corporation's current workforce demographic for women, visible minorities and persons with disabilities reflects Thunder Bay's labour force demographic as identified in the 2016 Statistics Canada "Census Metropolitan Area" (CMA) data for Thunder Bay. The percentage of employees self-identifying as an Indigenous person at the Corporation is lower than Thunder Bay's labour force. Statistics Canada does not have data for the 2SLGBTIQ+ community.

Applicant Data

With the exception of the 2SLGBTIQ+ community, the Corporation collects data, on a voluntary basis, on the same equity groups from applicants.

2020 applicant data indicates that 42.31% of employment applications received are from women, 6.73% are from Indigenous peoples, 12.95% are from visible minorities, and 3.26% are from persons with disabilities. The same data highlights that the percentage of applications received from women, Indigenous peoples, and persons with disabilities are less than Thunder Bay's labour force population and the Corporation's 2020 workforce demographic population. Applications from visible minorities is reflective of both populations. The 2SLGBTIQ+ equity group will be added beginning July 1, 2021.

Applications received from women has been declining since 2011, and applications received from Indigenous Peoples was increasing positively over time until 2020. There has been a healthy increase in applications from visible minorities, and applications from persons with disabilities increased steadily since 2014 but experienced a slight decline in 2020.

Occupational Group Distribution

In 2020, employees were asked for the first time to identify their occupation on the employment equity survey. This data illustrates an opportunity for the Corporation to strengthen internal workforce development and outreach efforts towards recruiting and hiring more:

- Indigenous peoples within the supervisor and manager occupations,
- visible minority employees within the supervisor, manager, administrative, and professional/technical occupational groups,
- employees with disabilities within the managerial occupation,
- female employees within the trade and operations occupations, and
- employees from the 2SLGBTIQ+ community within the trades, managerial and operations occupations.

Going Forward

Given the decline in applications from female applicants since 2011, the decrease in applications received from Indigenous peoples and persons with disabilities in 2020, and the fact that the current Indigenous employee population at the Corporation is lower than Thunder Bay's labour force, Human Resources and Corporate Safety (HRCS) recognizes that there is opportunity to further strengthen workplace inclusion and outreach efforts to have workforce representation that is more reflective of local demographics. This includes encouraging more applications from women, Indigenous peoples, and persons with disabilities. Details within this report and Appendix B provide information on current and upcoming initiatives geared towards all equity groups.

Workplaces that have diversity of thought, perspectives and ideas are better able to solve problems creatively and collaboratively, and diverse organizations are more likely to achieve

Committee of the Whole - June 14, 2021

goals.ⁱ Moreover, inclusive workplaces, in which employees feel accepted and able to bring their full selves to work, will more likely retain a more committed and engaged workforce.ⁱⁱ A number of initiatives are underway within the Corporation, including working in partnership with the Indigenous Relations & Inclusion Office (IRIO) to fulfill initiatives outlined in the 2021-2027 Indigenous Relations & Inclusion Strategy, as well as initiatives outlined in the Corporation's Employment Outreach and Retention Plan (*Appendix B*).

HRCS will continue to support the City's employment outreach and retention efforts in order to:

- increase the number of applications received from females, Indigenous peoples, visible minorities, persons with disabilities, and the 2SLGBTIQ+ community,
- increase the number of hires from these equity groups,
- educate all City staff on the importance of equity, diversity, and inclusion, and retain employees from these equity groups, and
- retain, engage, and develop employees from these equity groups.

All of these efforts will support promoting equal opportunities for employment.

It is important to note that due to the COVID-19 pandemic, fewer job competitions were posted in 2020, approximately 15% less than the last three year average, and some previously planned 2020 initiatives were deferred.

DISCUSSION

Introduction – Workforce Demographic Analysis

Process to Survey Employees

In 2020, the Corporation conducted its sixth voluntary Employment Equity Survey. In an effort to promote participation of every active employee, the HRCS Division launched a significant creative marketing and communication plan. The plan consisted of an enhanced distribution strategy and new branding, which included renaming the survey *internally* as the 2020 CTB Workforce Census (see Appendix A). The 2020 survey yielded a 38.78% response rate from our workforce, which was a substantial increase over previous years.

Year	Response Rate
2005	24%
2008	30%
2011	28.5%
2014	23.2%
2017	24.2%
2020	38.78%

The survey is voluntary and confidential and provides employees with opportunities to "selfidentify" whether they are male, female, an Indigenous person, a visible minority or a person with a disability. In 2020, for the first time, employees also had the opportunity to self-identify as belonging to the 2SLGBTIQ+ community (two spirit, lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, intersex, queer, questioning and other sexual or gender minorities).

What is the overall general goal?

Consistent with past employment equity surveys, the Corporation compares the results of the survey to the most recent Statistics Canada "labour force" census data. The Statistics Canada data identifies individuals 15 years of age or older who are participating in the labour force, either employed or unemployed. Note that with the exception of the persons with disabilities group, the Statistics Canada 2016 census data is based on 25% of the Thunder Bay CMA population.

As a Corporation we are working towards having a workforce population that is reflective of the labour force in the CMA Thunder Bay community, and the most recent labour force Statistics Canada data is used as a benchmark to achieve this goal.

Did we achieve our overall general goal?

Group	Thunder Bay Labour Force (As a percentage of the total labour force population of the City of Thunder Bay from Statistics Canada)	2020 CTB Employment Equity Survey Results (As a percentage of survey responses)		
Female	48.96%	49.93%		
Indigenous Peoples	9.69%	7.20%		
Visible Minorities	4.10%	4.43%		
Persons with Disabilities	*11.42%	11.95%		
2SLGBTIQ+	**	5.10%		

The results of the City's 2020 employment equity survey compared to Thunder Bay's labour force demographic are:

*Ontario Statistic (2012)

**Statistics Canada does not collect data related to the 2SLGBTIQ+ community.

The 2020 data above shows that the Corporation's workforce demographic as it relates to women, visible minorities and persons with disabilities reflects the labour force market in the community. The number of employees self-identifying as Indigenous peoples is lower than Thunder Bay's labour force.

The City's employment equity survey has been completed six times, in three-year intervals, since 2005. The results of the surveys over the years are as follows:

Group	2005	2008	2011	2014	2017	2020
Female	54.00%	53.00%	52.7%	54.03%	55.39%	49.93%
Indigenous Peoples	6.0%	6.5%	5.5%	7.81%	9.63%	7.20%

Visible Minorities	2.25%	3.8%	3.8%	4.77%	4.08%	4.43%
Persons with Disabilities	14.39%	12.10%	9.7%	12.01%	14.23%	11.95%
2SLGBTIQ+						5.10%

The chart above illustrates that over time there has been some variability with the number of employees who self-identify as women, as an Indigenous person, or as a person with a disability. Generally, however, these employee populations were growing steadily from 2011 to 2020. There was a substantial increase in the percentage of Indigenous employees from 2005 to 2017. The visible minority workforce population has also been inconsistent, but has had positive growth from 2017 to 2020. No Corporate trend data exists for the 2SLGBTIQ+ community to date.

Employment Applications

The Corporation collects demographic data from job applicants on a voluntary self-identification basis. In 2020, the Corporation received a total of 14,107 applications.

From the applications received in 2020, 13,941 applications provided applicant data as it relates to gender, and indicates that 42.31% of these applications are from females. Seventy-seven percent of total applications (10,842 applications) provided information related to the following:

- 6.73% were from Indigenous peoples,
- 12.95% were from visible minorities, and
- 3.26% were from persons with disabilities.

The Corporation will begin tracking applicant data for the 2SLGBTIQ+ community commencing July 2021.

2020 applicant data indicates that the Corporation's outreach efforts yield approximately 22.94% of their applications from women, Indigenous peoples, visible minorities, and persons with disabilities. The Corporation has been collecting voluntary applicant demographic data since 2011.

Applicant Data Trend Over Time:

Group	2011	2014	2017	2020
Female	46.42%	49.7%	43.86%	42.31%
Indigenous Peoples	7.1%	7.05%	7.92%	6.73%
Visible Minorities	4.3%	5.98%	10.84%	12.95%
Persons with Disabilities	3.2%	2.35%	3.46%	3.26%
2SLGBTIQ+				

There has been a decline in applications received from women since 2011. Applications from Indigenous peoples was increasing positively over time until 2020. There has been a healthy

increase in applications from visible minorities, and applications from persons with disabilities shows variability, with a steady increase since 2014 and then a slight decline in 2020.

Equity Group	CMA Thunder Bay Labour Force Data	City of Thunder Bay 2020 Workforce Demographic	City of Thunder Bay 2020 Applicant Data	
Women	48.96%	49.93%	42.31%	
Indigenous Peoples	9.69%	7.20%	6.73%	
Visible Minorities	4.10%	4.43%	12.95%	
Persons with	11.42%	11.95%	3.26%	
Disabilities	11.42/0	11.73/0	5.2070	
2SLGBTIQ+		5.10%		

2020 Applicant Data versus Thunder Bay Labour Force Data & CTB 2020 Workforce Data:

A comparison of 2020 applicant data against the CMA Thunder Bay labour force population data and the Corporation's 2020 workforce demographic population highlights that while the number of applications submitted by those who identify as visible minorities is reflective of both populations, the number of applications submitted by women, Indigenous peoples and persons with disabilities do not reflect either population.

Opportunity exists for the Corporation to further strengthen outreach efforts in order to encourage more applications from women, Indigenous peoples, and persons with disabilities. While our female workforce population numbers are healthy, outreach efforts need to continue for this group to ensure there is no further decline.

Identities - "I Also Identify As"

As additional information, it is important to recognize that employees who identify as an Indigenous person, a visible minority, a woman, a person with a disability, or as belonging to the pride community, may also identify in any number of other equity groups that help inform their own identifies. Appendix C highlights the overlap and intersection of identifies for those employees who identified as belonging to one ore more of the equity groups mentioned within this report.

What are we doing to achieve our goals (general perspective)?

Current policies, procedures, and training programs are developed with a diversity and inclusion lens and promote cultural awareness, anti-racism, diversity and inclusion within the Corporation's labour force.

In 2018, the HRCS Division developed an Employment Outreach and Retention Plan (*Appendix B*) that captures current and future initiatives geared towards all equity groups.

Over multiple years and through a phased process, the HRCS Division, will continue to implement the plan in order to support the Corporation's efforts to achieve the following four goals:

- increase the number of applications received from females, Indigenous peoples, visible minorities, persons with disabilities, and the 2SLGBTIQ+ community,
- increase the number of hires from these equity groups,
- educate all City staff on the importance of equity, diversity, and inclusion, and
- retain, engage & develop employees from these equity groups

The Employment Outreach and Retention Plan is a living document, which will allow the Corporation to continue to consult, obtain feedback, and modify/add new initiatives as required. The Corporation will continue to consult with stakeholders and representatives of Indigenous peoples, persons with disabilities, visible minorities, women, and the pride community in order to enhance and develop new initiatives.

Indigenous Peoples

What is the goal?

The Corporation strives to have a workforce population that is, at a minimum, reflective of Thunder Bay's labour force community. Statistics Canada (2016) indicates that Indigenous peoples represent 9.6% of the CMA Thunder Bay area labour force.

Note: Statistics Canada cautions that Indigenous people may be underrepresented in census surveys due to the replacement of the long-form census in 2010 and because Indigenous people often cannot or choose not to participate. The representation of Indigenous people in the Thunder Bay CMA labour force community could be significantly higher than 9.69%.

Where are we now?

In 2011, Indigenous peoples represented 5.5% of our City's total employee workforce. This increased to 7.81% in 2014 and 9.63% in 2017. In 2020, representation fell to 7.20% and is not reflective of Thunder Bay's labour force community.

Group	2005	2008	2011	2014	2017	2020
Indigenous Peoples	6.0%	6.5%	5.5%	7.81%	9.63%	7.20%



Workforce Demographic Trend - Over Six Surveys

The Corporation's 5 year workforce demographic trend shows some inconsistency with a slightly increasing trend since 2005, and a decrease in 2020.

Occupational Group Distribution

In 2020, our voluntary employment equity survey asked respondents to identify their occupation. Appendix D provides an overview of the distribution of Indigenous employees by occupational group. In 2020, the lowest representation of Indigenous employees is in the occupational category of supervisor and manager. The highest representation and majority of Indigenous employees are in the trades, professional/technical, and operations categories. Opportunity exists for the Corporation to strengthen internal career development, and employment outreach efforts towards recruiting and hiring more Indigenous peoples within the supervisor and manager occupations.

What are we doing to achieve our goal?

In addition to the employment outreach and retention initiatives targeted towards all equity groups (*Appendix B*), some completed, current and future initiatives directed towards Indigenous peoples and employees include:

Indigenous Relations & Inclusion Strategy

In partnership with the Indigenous Relations & Inclusion Office (IRIO) we will continue to implement employment and outreach initiatives related to the Indigenous Relations & Inclusion Strategy, which include:

- Providing professional learning opportunities and supports to empower leadership and administration to build effective working relations with Indigenous partners.
 - Renewing and delivering Indigenous Cultural Awareness and other relevant learning opportunities to City Council and staff.
 - Evaluating Walk-a-Mile training to respond to evolving needs with Indigenous community input.

- Drafting a guidance document and delivering staff training on engagement with Indigenous partners and communities.
- Reviving and coordinating City Indigenous Employees' Network to identify priorities and engage staff for further retention.
- Collaborating with Well at Work, Health & Wellness Coordinator to develop culturally responsive staff supports (e.g., Elder support hours, promote cultural programming).
- Collaborating with Human Resources to enhance Indigenous recruitment and retention.
 - Creating responsive recruitment activities in partnership with Indigenous employment agencies.
 - Advising on employment equity studies and implementation of workforce diversity and workplace inclusion.

Community Events

We continue to engage staff to attend community events that increase awareness of Indigenous Peoples to learn about cultural best practices and develop partnering relationships.

Enhanced Communications

We are further enhancing our targeted communications plan to further promote employment opportunities to Indigenous people, which also includes enhancing our existing social media strategy (i.e. Facebook, Instagram) to reach Indigenous youth.

Career Fairs

We continue to participate in career fairs/events targeted towards Indigenous people, when made available.

Enhanced Recruitment Tool

Working with the (IRIO), we created an Indigenous Talking Circle recruitment tool that can be used for selection interviews, which provides a cultural space to learn about potential candidates.

Community Partnerships

We continue to consult and collaborate with key community Indigenous groups, recruitment services, educational institutions, and Ministry programs/initiatives. These collaborations will continue to explore and develop specific placement programs to assist Indigenous people to gain qualifications needed to apply for entry level positions.

Each year, the Corporation hosts placement students of Confederation College from key programs intending to serve Indigenous peoples, such as the Native Child and Family Services program, and the Aboriginal Community Advocacy Program. This partnership offers a rich learning environment for students, and helps them develop their skills and work networks.

The Corporation has had some success with short-term placement opportunities in the past (i.e. Anishinabek Employment & Training Services) and we look forward to building further opportunities in this regard (i.e. Operator in Training Internship with the Ontario First Nations Technical Services Corporation). We will also continue to partner with Oshki-Pimache-O-Win

Education and Training Institute to offer child care placement opportunities to Indigenous peoples.

Training

In December 2020, the Corporation launched its enhanced Indigenous Cultural Awareness training program, which will be provided to all employees over a three year period. This training was created to increase understanding and awareness of Indigenous peoples. This year, the Corporation will offer an Indigenizing Public Spaces training program to support staff in collaborating with Indigenous partners on Indigenous Place-making initiatives.

Staff Lunch and Learns

The Indigenous Liaison coordinates and hosts such learning opportunities for staff around commemorative days to offer enhanced knowledge and understanding of Indigenous peoples' lived experiences and cultural teachings on relevant topics to help inform their work approaches.

Smudging

Smudging ceremonies take place where possible, and early discussions have been had towards setting aside a room for smudging & other support uses (teachings) in the future. A Smudging Protocol is currently in development, which will be implemented and communicated throughout the Corporation.

Territory & Signatory Recognition

The City of Thunder Bay territorial statement (or personalized version) is incorporated into all meetings, training, events and appropriate areas.

Truth and Reconciliation Commission Recommendations

Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC) Call to Action Final Report recommendation number 57 speaks directly to the Municipal Government's role to provide education to public servants. This training has been implemented, as part of our Indigenous Cultural Awareness training above (as indicated above).

Seven Youth Inquest Recommendations

Inquest Recommendation Action # 118 & 139 relates to TRC recommendation #57 and calls on the Corporation to provide skills-based training in intercultural competency, conflict resolution, human rights, anti-racism to staff, which is provided to staff as part of the Indigenous Cultural Awareness training indicated above.

Inquest Recommendation Action # 109 speaks to developing and reporting on employment equity targets for Indigenous youth hired by the City. We have begun to track youth applicants who self-identify as Indigenous.

Inquest Recommendation Action #99 speaks to using social media and the internet to notify Indigenous students of opportunities (e.g. employment, recreation, volunteering). As indicated above, the HRCS Division is currently enhancing their existing social media strategy, which will notify Indigenous youth of job opportunities. The Recreation & Culture Division continues to communicate with Indigenous youth, educating about the job application process, and how they

Committee of the Whole - June 14, 2021

can become involved in recreational programs through leadership and volunteering opportunities.

Visible Minorities

What is the goal?

The Corporation aims to have a workforce population that is reflective of Thunder Bay's labour force community. Statistics Canada (2016) indicates that visible minorities represent 4.10% of the CMA Thunder Bay area labour force.

Where are we now?

In 2011, visible minorities represented 3.8% of our City's total employee workforce. This increased to 4.77% in 2014 and decreased to 4.08% in 2017. In 2020, representation increased to 4.43% and is reflective of Thunder Bay's labour force community.

Group	2005	2008	2011	2014	2017	2020

Workforce Demographic Trend - Over Six Surveys



The Corporation's 5 year workforce demographic trend shows some variability with a slightly increasing trend since 2005, a decrease in 2017, and an increase in 2020.

Occupational Group Distribution

In 2020, our voluntary employment equity survey asked respondents to identify their occupation group. Appendix D provides an overview of the distribution of visible minority employees by occupational group. In 2020, the lowest representation of visible minority employees are in the

Committee of the Whole - June 14, 2021

supervisor, manager, administrative, and professional/technical occupational groups. The highest representation and majority of visible minority employees are in the trades occupational group.

Opportunity exists for the Corporation to strengthen employment outreach efforts towards recruiting and hiring more visible minority employees within the supervisor, manager, administrative, and professional/technical occupational groups.

Visible Minorities – Breakdown by Race Category

Race Category	Definition	% of Employees
Black	African, Afro-Caribbean descent/ African-Canadian	12.50%
Middle Eastern	Arab, Persian, and/or West Asian descent, e.g. Afghan, Egyptian, Iranian, Lebanese, Turkish	9.38%
East/Southeast Asian	Chinese, Korean, Japanese, Filipino, Vietnamese, Cambodian, Indonesian and other southeast Asian descent	21.87%
Latino	Latin American or Hispanic descent	3.13%
South Asian	Indian Subcontinent descent, e.g. East Indian, Pakistani, Bangladeshi, Sri Lankan, Indo-Caribbean, etc.	21.87%
Other		31.25%

The 2020 survey asked employees to further self-identify their race category.

The above data describes the Corporation's visible minority workforce demographic by other race categories, for the purpose of identifying the diversification of our visible minority employees. In 2020, the Corporation's visible minority workforce demographic had the most representation from the east/southeast Asian, south Asian, and black race categories.

The data demonstrates that the Corporation has a comparable visible minority workforce demographic (4.22%) to the Thunder Bay labour force (4.10%), and is receiving a healthy number of applications from visible minorities.

Given the positive application response from visible minorities, opportunities exists for the Corporation to further diversity our workforce and capitalize on the benefits of having more diverse employees, which will provide more creative skill sets, diverse experiences, and perspectives.

What are we doing to achieve our goal?

In addition to some of the employment outreach and retention initiatives targeted towards all equity groups (*Appendix B*), some completed, current and future initiatives directed towards visible minorities and employees include:

Cultural Awareness Information Portal

To provide cultural awareness and encourage the sharing of cultures and diversity amongst the employee population, we are in the process of creating a Cultural Awareness Information Portal on the CTB Intranet. This portal will highlight key cultural observances and diverse recognition days/events, which will provide opportunities for employees to learn the benefits of diversity within our workforce, and recognize employees who represent our diverse workforce.

Cultural Awareness & Diversity Days

We are also working towards highlighting key cultural awareness and diversity days to celebrate throughout the year (i.e. Black History Month). The intent is to corporately recognize, educate and bring awareness to cultural and diverse observances on a monthly basis, which will further celebrate our diverse workforce.

Enhanced Communications

We are further enhancing our targeted communications plan to further promote employment opportunities to visible minorities, which also includes enhancing our existing social media strategy (i.e. Facebook, Instagram).

Community Partnerships

Work is underway to learn more from visible minority groups, recruitment services, educational institutions, and Ministry programs/initiatives within our community. Our hope is to learn on how to effectively reach potential applicants, and create skill development opportunities.

Training & Education

Commencing in 2021, we will begin providing all employees with general diversity training. This mandatory training is being provided to increase understanding and awareness of cultural diversity in the workplace. Research has also begun to create cultural lunch and learn sessions for our employees. This Fall, City leaders will have an opportunity to attend a session on the *Equitable Workforce: Cultivating Attitudes of Anti-racism & Allyship* to gain insights and learn more about best practices to foster a healthy working environment for all people regardless of their racial identity.

Continuously Learning

We are continuing to learn more about best practices related to diversity, anti-racism and allyship (i.e. black lives matter), and look forward to adding new initiatives to our outreach and retention plan.

Persons with Disabilities

What is the goal?

The Corporation aims to have a workforce population that is reflective of our labour force community. Statistics Canada indicates that persons with disabilities represent 11.42% Ontario's labour force.

Where are we now?

In 2011, persons with disabilities represented 9.7% of our City's total employee workforce. This increased to 12.01% in 2014 and to 14.23% in 2017. In 2020, this representation decreased to 11.95% and is reflective of Ontario's labour force community.

Group	2005	2008	2011	2014	2017	2020
Persons with Disabilities	14.39%	12.10%	9.7%	12.01%	14.23%	11.95%

Workforce Demographic Trend - Over Six Surveys



The Corporation's 5 year workforce demographic trend shows some variability with a sharp decrease from 2005 to 2011, then a positive increasing trend up until 2017, with a decrease in 2020.

Occupational Group Distribution

In 2020, our voluntary employment equity survey asked respondents to identify their occupation group. Appendix D provides an overview of the distribution of employees with disabilities by occupational group. In 2020, the lowest representation of employees with disabilities is in the occupational category of manager. The highest representation and majority of employees with disabilities are in the trades, operations, supervisor, and administrative groups.

Opportunity exists for the Corporation to strengthen employment outreach efforts towards recruiting and reducing barriers to employment for individuals with disabilities across all occupational groups.

What are we doing to achieve our goal?

In addition to the employment outreach and retention initiatives targeted towards all equity groups (*Appendix B*) some completed, current and future initiatives directed towards persons with disabilities and employees include:

Compliance with the AODA & IASR

With the introduction of the *Accessibility for Ontarians with Disabilities Act* (AODA) & the Integrated Accessibility Standard Regulation (IASR), the Corporation underwent an extensive review to ensure compliance. The HRCS Division actively participated in this review and employment procedures related to training, recruitment/selection/hiring, safety, accommodation, return to work process, performance management/development, and labour relations have been reviewed and are in compliance with regulations.

Training: The Corporation continues to provide training to employees on customer service as it relates to the IASR and the Ontario Human Rights Code. City Leaders are also provided with accessibility training as it relates to the Employment Standards – IASR regulation. This training focuses on procedural related recruitment requirements as required by IASR regulations.

Corporate delivered training is communicated with a statement advising that reasonable accommodations are available upon request (i.e. visual aids, etc.). Facilitators that deliver training are also made aware of the requirement for accessibility. This requirement is also included with any expressions of interest.

Recruitment: All job postings indicate that reasonable accommodations are available upon request.

Selection: Candidates who are selected to participate in an interview, test or other form of selection process are also informed that reasonable accommodations are available upon request. If an applicant requests an accommodation, a consultative review takes place to arrange for suitable accommodations.

Hiring: When making offers of employment, successful applicants are notified of procedures for accommodating employees with disabilities. During the onboarding process, employees are notified of policies to support employees with disabilities, including, but not limited to, policies on the provision of job accommodations.

Safety: Individualized workplace emergency response information is also provided to employees who have a disability, if the disability is such that the individualized information is necessary and the Corporation is aware of the need for accommodation due to the employee's disability.

Accommodation Plans: Individualized accommodation plans area available for employees with disabilities if required and the Corporation is aware of the need for the accommodation.

Return to Work Process: A return to work process also exists for employees absent from work due to disability, who require a disability- related to return to work accommodation.

Performance Management – Our Performance Management Assessment at the City of Thunder Bay (PACT) program, and our probationary period procedures, includes a process for supervisors/managers to differentiate between performance related issues and disability related issues.

Committee of the Whole - June 14, 2021

Redeployment: This process also takes into consideration the accessibility needs and any individual accommodation plans of an employee.

Grievance Handling & Discipline/Discharge: Processes related to these matters have also be updated to include steps to differentiate between performance related and disability related issues.

Enhanced Communications

We are further enhancing our targeted communications plan to further promote employment opportunities to persons with disabilities, which also includes enhancing our existing social media strategy (i.e. Facebook, Instagram).

Community Partnerships

We are continuing to meet with key community groups, recruitment services, and educational institutions to learn about programs and initiatives that are available to persons with disabilities. This includes exploring specific placement programs within the community that are geared towards persons with disabilities, and that focus on providing skills based training opportunities. To date, we have been successful in securing a few placements with Monty Parks and the Ontario March of Dimes. We are confident that more placement opportunities will be put in place.

Cultural Awareness & Diversity Days

As mentioned above, work is also underway to highlight key cultural awareness and diversity days for all equity groups, which will also include recognizing people who have a disability.

Women

What is the goal?

The Corporation aims to have a workforce population that is reflective of our labour force community. Statistics Canada (2016) indicates that women represent 48.96% of the CMA Thunder Bay area labour force.

Where are we now?

In 2011, 52.7% of the City's total employee workforce were women. This increased to 54.03% in 2014 and increased to 55.36% in 2017. In 2020, this representation decreased to 49.93% and is reflective of Thunder Bay's labour force community.

Group	2005	2008	2011	2014	2017	2020
Women	54.00%	53.00%	52.7%	54.03%	55.39%	49.93%





The Corporation's 5 year demographic trend shows some inconsistency with a small decline from 2005 to 2011, an increasing trend since 2011, and sharp decline in 2020.

Occupational Group Distribution

In 2020, our voluntary employment equity survey asked respondents to identify their occupation. Appendix D provides an overview of the distribution of female employees by occupational groups. In 2020, the lowest representation of female employees is in the occupational category of trades and operations. The highest representation and majority of female employees are in the administrative, professional, supervisor, and manager groups.

Opportunity exists for the Corporation to strengthen employment outreach efforts towards recruiting and hiring more female employees with within the trade and operations occupations.

What are we doing to achieve our goal?

To date, there have not been many specific initiatives attached to this particular equity group. We continue to apply best practices and as we learn more we will be identifying and establishing initiatives geared toward women.

Cultural Awareness & Diversity Days

As mentioned above, work is also underway to highlight key cultural awareness and diversity days for all equity groups, which will also include recognizing women.

Community Partnerships

We will identify and consult with community groups for women to learn about programs/initiatives that provide more opportunities for women in a variety of job types, especially with the trade and operations occupations.

Enhanced Communications

We are further enhancing our targeted communications plan to further promote employment opportunities to women, which also includes enhancing our existing social media strategy (i.e. Facebook, Instagram).

Pay Equity

To achieve pay equity, the Corporation ensures that female job classes are valued and compared to male job classes. We maintain pay equity by reviewing changes to our job classes (additions or eliminations) in a way that is free of gender bias. This is done by following a structured job evaluation process.

2SLGBTIQ+

What is the goal?

The Corporation aims to have a workforce population that is reflective of our labour force community. Statistics Canada indicates does not provide date for the 2SLGBTIQ+ community.

Where are we now?

This is the first year that the Corporation has included the 2SLGBTIQ+ community in our voluntary employment equity survey. The data demonstrates that 5.10% of our workforce is representative of the pride community.

Occupational Group Distribution

In 2020, our voluntary employment equity survey asked respondents to identify their occupation. Appendix D provides an overview of distribution of employees who identify as 2SLGBTIQ+ by occupational group. In 2020, the lowest representation of employees who identify as 2SLGBTIQ+ is in the occupational category of trades, manager, and operations. The highest representation and majority of these employees are in the administrative and supervisor groups.

Opportunity exists for the Corporation to strengthen employment outreach efforts towards recruiting and hiring more employees from the pride community within the trades, managerial and operations occupations.

What are we doing to achieve our goal?

As indicated above, this is the first year the 2SLGBTIQ+ equity group is part of our survey. To date, there have not been many specific initiatives attached to this particular equity group. As we learn more about our 2SLGBTIQ+ workforce demographic we will be identifying and implementing more initiatives.

Community Partnerships

We will identify and consult with key stakeholders in the community to learn about programs/initiatives that provide more employment related opportunities for the pride community.

Enhanced Communications

We are further enhancing our targeted communications plan to further promote employment opportunities to the pride community, which also includes enhancing our existing social media strategy (i.e. Facebook, Instagram).

Training

Gender and sexual diversity training was piloted with a group of employees in 2020 with great success. As a result, the Corporation will begin providing all employees with gender and sexual diversity training beginning in 2021 (mandatory training). Working with internal employees, in 2021 we began offering pride training to employees. This training provides employees with a greater understanding of the 2SLGBTIQ+ community and informative ways they can support employees within this demographic.

Cultural Awareness & Diversity Days

As mentioned above, work is also underway to highlight key cultural awareness and diversity days for all equity groups. On October 21, 2020, the Corporation supported International Pronouns Day, which is a day that seeks to make respecting, sharing, and educating about personal pronouns commonplace. This day will be highlighted within the Corporation again in 2021.

Adopt a New Acronym

On October 21, 2020, a memo was sent to all employees asking them to respect the use of pronouns identified by employees in the Corporation, as well as adopting the acronym 2SLGBTIQ+ when referring to two spirit, lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, intersex, queer, questioning and other sexual or gender minorities. Employees were encouraged to become more informed by taking any learning opportunities (as above) provided by the Corporation.

Add Pronouns to Name Profiles

The same memo encouraged employees were also encouraged to add their pronouns to their name in their email signature and/or business card profiles, which will create a safe space and encourage others to share their pronouns.

Using Pronouns at Work – Guide

A Using Pronouns at Work Guide was also created and distributed to illustrate the reasons why using pronouns is important, and it also provided some learning resources and tips on how to properly add pronouns to an email signature.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

Work will be undertaken within the existing approved budget and/or included for consideration in future budgets, if required.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that City Council should support the continuing work being done within the Corporation as it relates to workplace inclusion and employment outreach and retention, as outlined in this report, which supports promoting equitable opportunities for employment.

BACKGROUND

Corporate reports related to employment equity have been presented to Council in 2005, 2008, 2011, 2014, and 2017.

In response to Diversity Thunder Bay's deputation to Council on November 22, 2004, and the New Foundations Living Strategic Plan Action Item No. 17, the Human Resources Division completed an employment equity report capturing baseline employee demographic data and reported on outreach strategies to City Council in December 2005.

Year of Corporate Report	Findings & Recommendations
Corporate Report No. 2005.298 (Human Resources Division)	The corporate profile relatively mirrors the 2001 Thunder Bay CMA Statistic Canada demographics. The Human Resources Division would complete a subsequent equity survey and report back to Council in 2008.
Corporate Report No. 2008.202 (Human Resources Division)	The Corporation's workforce demographic of the four designated groups – women, aboriginal peoples, visible minorities, and persons with disabilities is fairly representative of the Statistics Canada Census Metropolitan Area (CMA) data for Thunder Bay. The Human Resources Division would complete another survey and report for 2011.
Corporate Report No. 2012.028 (Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division)	The Corporation's own workforce demographic reasonably reflects Thunder Bay's workforce demographic. The Human Resources Division would complete an employment equity survey again in 2014.
Corporate Report No. 105/2015 (Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division)	The Corporation's labour force demographic was consistent with the workforce population demographic in the Thunder Bay CMA. The Human Resources would complete another survey and report in 2017.
Corporate Report No. 72/2018 (Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division)	The results of the 2017 survey indicate that the Corporation's current labour force demographic for females, Indigenous peoples, visible minorities and persons with disabilities reflects Thunder Bay's labour force demographic. The Human Resources Division would complete another survey and report in 2020.

A summary of surveys and reports completed is as follows:

References:

¹ Diversity Hiring to Enhance Inclusive Workplace Culture. (2021, May). Queen's University (IRC). Retrieved May 18, 2021 from: <u>https://irc.queensu.ca/diversity-hiring-to-enhance-inclusive-workplace-</u> culture/?utm_source=rss&utm_medium=rss&utm_campaign=diversity-hiring-to-enhance-inclusive-workplaceculture

¹ Mor Barak, M. E. (2000). Beyond affirmative action: Toward a model of diversity and organizational inclusion. Administration in Social Work, 23(3/4), 47–68.

Thunder Bay [Census metropolitan area], Ontario and Ontario [Province]. Census Profile, 2016 Census. Statistics Canada. Retrieved May 18, 2021 from: <u>https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-</u> recensement/2016/dppd/prof/details/page.cfm?Lang=E&Geo1=CMACA&Code1=595&Geo2=PR&Code2=35&Searc hText=Thunder%20Bay&SearchType=Begins&SearchPR=01&B1=AII&TABID=1&type=0

Data Tables, 2016 Census, Thunder Bay [Census metropolitan area], Aboriginal Identity. Census Profile, 2016 Census. Statistics Canada. Retrieved May 18, 2021 from:

https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2016/dp-pd/dt-td/Rpeng.cfm?TABID=2&LANG=E&APATH=3&DETAIL=0&DIM=0&FL=A&FREE=0&GC=0&GK=0&GRP=1&PID=110693&PRI D=10&PTYPE=109445&S=0&SHOWALL=0&SUB=0&Temporal=2017&THEME=124&VID=0&VNAMEE=&VNAMEF=

Data Tables, 2016 Census, Thunder Bay [Census metropolitan area], Immigrant Status. Census Profile, 2016 Census. Statistics Canada. Retrieved May 18, 2021 from:

https://www12.statcan.gc.ca/census-recensement/2016/dp-pd/dt-td/Rpeng.cfm?TABID=2&LANG=E&APATH=3&DETAIL=0&DIM=0&FL=A&FREE=0&GC=0&GK=0&GRP=1&PID=110692&PRI D=10&PTYPE=109445&S=0&SHOWALL=0&SUB=0&Temporal=2017&THEME=124&VID=0&VNAMEE=&VNAMEF=

Labour force status for adults with and without disabilities, Ontario. Census Profile, 2012. Statistics Canada. Retrieved May 18, 2021 from:

https://www150.statcan.gc.ca/t1/tbl1/en/tv.action?pid=1310034701&pickMembers%5B0%5D=1.7&pickMembers%5B1%5D=3.1

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:

Appendix A – 2020 CTB Workforce Census

Appendix B - Employment Outreach & Retention Plan - Snapshot

- Appendix C I Also Identify As
- Appendix D-Occupational Group Distribution

PREPARED BY: Lorraine MacPhail Supervisor - Staffing, Development & Support Services

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)	DATE:
Norm Gale, City Manager	June 4, 2021



WHO SHOULD PARTICIPATE?

• As an employee we strongly encourage everyone to complete the survey to help the Corporation build the best quality data on our workforce make-up.

PRIVACY & CONFIDENTIALITY

- We know that protecting privacy and confidentiality is of utmost importance.
- To ensure respondent confidentiality, all responses are anonymous and no individual responses will be released. Only aggregate results will be shared for reporting purposes.

CENSUS DEADLINE

When you have completed this important survey, please return it to the Human Resources & Corporate Safety Division by **December 21, 2020.**

EMPLOYEE COMMENTS:

We welcome your anonymous comments or feedback on this census. Comments may be included in a public report.

TB167(2)(rev08/17)



Appendix B – Employment Outreach & Retention Plan – Snapshot (Current & Future Initiatives – For All Equity Groups)



Some current & future initiatives include:

- Provide an annual City of Thunder Bay career fair
- Create an employment brand that promotes diversity & inclusion
- Create a recruitment video that promotes diversity, inclusion & job opportunities
- Track applications by occupational group & review
- Conduct a Recruitment Process Improvement Review with an external consultant
- Consult & partner with community groups
- Use targeted communication plans
- Participate in career fairs
- Communicate information about entry-level positions to inform applicants about career paths
- Conduct employment outreach presentations
- Include a statement on all job postings about the Corporation's commitment to diversity
- Create a Why Join the City Guide
- Create an enhanced social media strategy that leverages appropriate recruitment channels

Some current & future initiatives include:

- Enhance existing recruitment, selection & hiring training to include more inclusive practices
- Develop specific placement programs for all equity groups (including youth internships)
- Continuously review entry-level job descriptions to ensure requirements are reasonable and bonafide
- Communicate high school coop program to all equity
- Educate community stakeholders on how to apply to the City employment opportunities



Some current & future initiatives include:

- Develop a diversity observances & awareness section on the CTB Intranet
- Provide general diversity training to all employees
- Create an Inclusion at the CTB Facilitator's (Training) Resource Guide
- Provide lunch & learns (on various inclusion, diversity, & anti-racism topics)
- Provide all employees with respect., code of conduct, & preventing workplace harassment/discrimination training
- Offer bystander intervention training
- Offer anti-racism training
- Create an anti-bullying / discrimination / harassment Awareness Campaign

Some current & future initiatives include:

- Research & develop expertise on equity groups, to develop new initiatives
- Celebrate & highlight key diversity observances within the Corporation
- Enhance current Orientation Manual to include diverse resources & make it an Employee Guide for all
- Routinely promote the Corporation's commitment to diversity & provide ongoing education
- Recognize & include Inclusion & Respect as a CTB Leadership Competency for all leaders
- Increase diversity & inclusion presence on CTB Intranet, by creating & offering inclusion toolkits, resources & materials for employees

To retain, engage & develop employees from equity groups.





Visible Minorities - Also Identify As

Employees who identify a visible minority can also identify in any number of other categories that help inform their own identifies. The information above highlights the overlap and intersection of identifies for those employees who identified as a visible minority.

Persons with Disabilities – Also Identify As

Employees who identify as a person with a disability can also identify in any number of other categories that help inform their own identifies. The information below highlights the overlap and intersection of identifies for those employees who identified as a person with a disability.



Women - Also Identify As

Employees who identify as a women can also identify in any number of other categories that help inform their own identifies. The information above highlights the overlap and intersection of identifies for those employees who identified as a woman.

<u>2SLGBTIQ+ – Also Identify As</u> Employees who identify as 2SLGBTIQ+ can also identify in any number of other categories that help inform their own identifies. The information below highlights the overlap and intersection of identifies for those employees who identified as a member of the pride community.



Occupational Group	% of Indigenous Employees	% of Visible Minorities	% of Persons with Disabilities	% of Women	% of 2SLGBTIQ+
Administrative (support staff, clerical support, etc.)	5.43%	3.10%	12.40%	80.62%	6.20%
Professional/Technical (paramedic, accountant, engineer, nurse, etc.)	7.54%	3.02%	10.55%	41.21%	3.52%
Trades (mechanic, electrician, carpenter, etc.)	8.7%	8.70%	21.74%	4.35%	0.00%
Operations (labourer, roads, sanitation, etc.)	7.27%	4.55%	15.45%	18.18%	1.82%
Supervisor	3.06%	2.04%	13.27%	47.96%	6.12%
Manager	2.38%	2.38%	4.76%	54.76%	0.00%



Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/ DIVISION	Infrastructure & Operations- (Engineering & Operations)	REPORT NO.	R 75/2021
DATE PREPARED	05/17/2021	FILE NO.	
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
SUBJECT	Waterfront Trail Long Term Plan		

RECOMMENDATION

For information only.

LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN

This Report directly supports two pillars of the City's Strategic Plan.

Strategic Pillar: Grow – Focus on city building and social infrastructure to strengthen our economy, lifestyle and well-being. Item #3 Develop key City infrastructure that builds capacity such as the first phase of the Waterfront Trail.

Strategic Pillar: Renew - Focus on essential infrastructure, revitalize our cores and enhance our Image Routes. Item #5 Promote, both inside and outside Thunder Bay, our many attractions, parks, facilities, services and innovative product development to encourage use.

The Waterfront Trail gives us more to do, a place for all to enjoy and supports active transportation.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

At the October 26, 2020 Committee of the Whole meeting Council requested Administration report back with a cost effective implementation plan inclusive of timelines and estimated costs for the construction of the Waterfront Trail between Mission Island Marsh and Fisherman's Park.

Thunder Bay's Waterfront Trail Improvement Plan was presented and approved by Council under Report No. R178/2016 (Engineering & Operations). The Plan examined route feasibility and provided a recommended route for a combined waterfront multi-use trail and active transportation route. Administration reviewed the Plan focusing on known changes along the alignment, improvements to the preliminary design that address barriers and promote usability, and revisions that could be established in the short-mid term.

Administration has prioritized construction of each section of the trail based on the ability to create meaningful connections for trail users as the Waterfront Trail is expanded as well as considering any impediments that may delay approvals or construction. Revised cost estimates have been completed. A plan of the sections of the Waterfront Trail indicating the proposed prioritized expansion is included in Attachments A to C.

DISCUSSION

The Waterfront Trail, when complete, has the potential to offer a range of diverse sights and attractions which help to convey the essence of the City of Thunder Bay to trail users along its approximately 13.5km long route connecting Mission Island Marsh to Fisherman's Park at the mouth of the Current River. The alignment includes some areas that are not waterfront-oriented, but these routes provide connections that mitigate property issues and other barriers.

Three sections of trail will be developed in 2021 including: the section on Mission Island from Island Drive to Mission Marsh, the section on Island Drive from the floodway to Main Street, and the section north of Prince Arthur's Landing to Richardson's Terminal.

Administration has prioritized the expansion of the Waterfront Trail by section and summarized the short to long term plans below and provided order of magnitude costing for each with additional details provided in Attachment D.

Property Discussions

Jackknife Bridge

This structure is owned by CP Rail and is currently rail access only. Administration will re-open discussions with CP to determine if they are willing to have the City establish a pedestrian walkway on this structure as this would provide access from the City directly to the newly developed Mission Island section of Waterfront Trail and encourage use of this otherwise orphaned piece of trail. Discussions with CP will also include emergency vehicle access across the bridge.

Administration has had negotiations with CP in the past to use the bridge for pedestrian access and had preliminary design options completed. The preferred option in 2002 cost \$800,000. Direction from Council in 2004 was to have CP rebuild the Brown Street pedestrian bridge and maintain it instead of constructing a new pedestrian access across the Jackknife Bridge.

Mission Island

Administration is in discussion with third party property owners with properties fronting the McKellar River to see if the trail being constructed in 2021 can have some of its alignment along the water. The city owned property on the island is well away from the water. As possible, the alignment will follow the river which will provide a more enjoyable experience and encourage more use.

South of Pool 6 to Maureen Street

The proposed trail alignment in the Plan follows the future alignment of Sleeping Giant Parkway which property negotiations are still required for. The current owner of the old Northern Wood Preservers site was contacted to determine if they are willing to have the City establish a temporary trail along the future alignment of the Sleeping Giant Parkway which is considerably further away from the water's edge or preferably establish a trail along the waterfront portion of the property. The owner has indicated that the current and future site plans include significant industrial traffic on the site that would not be conducive to establishing a trail along the water's edge. There are also complications with a proposed new spur line construction into the property that may impact the previously proposed road alignment. Further discussion and preliminary design concepts are required.

Between the Pool 6 and the old Northern Wood Preservers site there is the potential to develop a trail spur through the NOW Park site that would access the waterfront along the land that was reclaimed as part of the environmental remediation of contaminants in the harbour. Administration will open discussions with the third party owners of the site.

Old Great West Timber Site North of Prince Arthur's Landing

The new property owner of the previous Great West Timber site has expressed an interest in having the City establish the Waterfront Trail near the shore of this property when it is developed. Administration will continue to pursue this option but it is unknown when development will occur.

Council will be provided with results of all these discussions as appropriate for further direction.

Prioritized Extension

Wayfinding

Wayfinding signage is required throughout and will be installed as the trail sections are developed. Trail signage has been estimated at \$8,000 per km on average but will fluctuate significantly depending on the section of trail and number of decision points. Seating/rest area locations will be established where possible and can range up to \$35,000 each depending on amenities provided.

Short-Term (Years 1-5)

In the short-term, Administration will focus on completing the three sections of trail being constructed in 2021, advance detailed planning and design, acquire access to property where possible, and expanding the trail where possible around Prince Arthur's Landing. The section south to Pool 6 will be an important link for cruise ship visitors. The section north of the marina is included in the Active Transportation Plan as part of the Priority Cycling and Pedestrian networks. The railway tracks at Richardson's Terminal pose a significant barrier and it is expected that the Waterfront Trail will terminate at the lookout created this year in the short term. It is expected that negotiations and development of the trail spur to NOW Park can be completed in the short-term.

Based on the proposed work summarized in Attachment D, with an investment of \$3,300,000 the Waterfront Trail from the NOW Park spur north to the lookout to be created in 2021 can be completed in the short term. Planning and design costs are estimated at \$500,000.

Intermediate-Term (Years 6-10)

The primary objective in the intermediate term will be to create connections of the completed trail sections to the City and fill in uncomplicated sections to create longer continuous sections of trail.

Based on the proposed work summarized in Attachment D, with an investment of \$2,710,000 the Waterfront Trail from Mission Island north to Main Street Bridge could be completed largely as a shoulder facility and connections made at the Jackknife Bridge, Main Street and Grenville Avenue.

Long-Term (Years 10+)

The primary purpose will be complete the trail and address the barriers/restrictions including rail and river crossings and private property. Full scope of the work is unknown at this time. Going forward, additional enhancements to the route in general including separating the trail from roadways can be made where not completed previously and where possible, but have not been contemplated in this report.

Based on the proposed work summarized in Attachment D an investment of more than \$14,260,000 is required to complete shoulder facilities on Hammond Avenue and Maureen Street and address the noted barriers. A timeline is not possible to forecast as timing is largely based on discussions with property owners. The investment required for the projects that address barriers, suggests external funding will be necessary.

LINK TO EARTHCARE SUSTAINABILITY PLAN

This Report directly supports item 6.0 Community Lifestyle: Mobility's Goal to: Inspire and influence the evolution of integrated urban mobility that is efficient, affordable, and accessible.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

The prioritized plan presented in this report proposes short-term, intermediate-term, and longterm projects. The following financial implications address the short- and intermediate-term projects. Considering long-term projects are either low priority, dependent on property negotiations or external funding, it is suggested that these projects be addressed in future reports to Council. Based on the order of magnitude estimates completed the following investments are required:

<u>Short-Term (Years 1-5)</u> \$3,300,000 Intermediate-Term (Years 6-10) \$2,710,000

In order to proceed with the short- and intermediate-term projects, the Waterfront Trail will require funding of \$601,000 on average per year. Multi-use recreation trails are included in Parks and Open Spaces capital and are funded at \$300,000 annually. This is to cover trail development as well as trail rehabilitation. There is a significant gap between the annual budget envelope available and the average annual funding required to support development of the Waterfront Trail. Additionally, annual operating costs for multi-use trails are currently in the order of \$1,270 per kilometre and an associated increase in operating should be included in future budgets as the trail is developed.

It is understood that some private funding may be available to support the Waterfront Trail construction, but Administration has not been approached by any benefactors. If Council wishes to have the Waterfront Trail move forward as per the timelines proposed in this report, it is suggested additional funding be identified outside of the capital envelopes currently developed for Infrastructure & Operations. Using the existing envelopes will see a further deterioration of existing tax supported infrastructure, including Parks, Roads, Bridges and Stormwater infrastructure.

The City currently has a Recreation Trail Reserve Fund that was established to provide matched funding for external private fundraising from the community or other government trail funding on a 1 to 3 ratio. Annual contributions to this fund are currently \$39,500. This would be an appropriate reserve fund to contribute to annually to fund the Waterfront Trail development.

CONCLUSION

This report is provided for information.

BACKGROUND

Waterfront Trail R 178/2016 presented a summary of the proposed Waterfront Trail scope and alignment for Council's approval and indicated additional funding would be required to implement the plan.

Possible Waterfront Trail Implementation 2021 Memorandum – Dec 7, 2020 COW provided a list of sections of trail that could be completed in 2021.

Investing in Canada Infrastructure Program (ICIP) – COVID-19 Resilience Infrastructure Stream Memorandum – Dec 7, 2020 COW recommending this funding be applied to Waterfront Trail projects and other needed multi-use trail reconstruction.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:

Attachment A - Waterfront Trail Plan Update: Island Drive South and Mission Island Segments Attachment B - Waterfront Trail Plan Update: Sleeping Giant Parkway South and Intercity Segments Attachment C - Waterfront Trail Plan Update: Marina Park, North Water Street and Mouth of Current River Segments

Attachment D - Waterfront Trail Long Term Plan Scope and Cost Summary

PREPARED BY: Kayla Dixon, P.Eng., MBA - Director Engineering & Operations

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)	DATE:
Kerri Marshall, General Manager – Infrastructure & Operations	May 27, 2021

Waterfront Trail Plan Update June 7, 2021 Island Drive South and Mission Island Segments

> itturet 15 # CHARLES STREET

Tist:

Han I

PU DENER!

THE REPORT OF TH

The second secon

和社会

の、25m2代を一日日の

世界教育的

CONTRACTOR OF

SHIP

ALC: N

















e. di

1 RE

Jacknife Bridge Segment pending dicussions with the Railway 1km long

alternative McKellar **Bridge Segment**

STATE THE R. P. LEWIS CO., LEWIS

THE REAL

The Malan Bo

Saman and a state of the second state of the s

2110

a faith

C)

CTU-EL

alternative alignment pending private land owner discussions

Mission Island Segment (Mission Marsh CA to Island Drive) 2.5km long

Island Drive South Segment (103rd St. to Floodway) 3.3km long

Page 178 of 20




Attachment D Waterfront Trail Long Term Plan Scope and Cost Summary

The following provides proposed scope and cost breakdowns by timeline and section of trail for currently unfunded work on the Waterfront Trail.

Wayfinding signage is required throughout and will be installed as the trail sections are developed. The cost of signage has been estimated at \$8,000 per kilometre of trail. Seating/rest area locations will be established where possible and can range up to \$35,000 each depending on amenities provided.

Short-Term (1-5 years) [Total estimate: \$3,300,000]

Marina Park Segment

A multi-use trail is planned south of Prince Arthur's Landing to the Pool 6 building and cruise ship dock. The trail will be extended to the habitat pond with the construction of the Art Gallery. South of this the trail follows the shoreline and traverses near some of the historic artifacts on the site and then connects into the Sleeping Giant Parkway alignment near the proposed roundabout. The cost of this trail section around the Pool 6 lands is \$600,000. Significant site preparation and clearing of concrete rubble will be required as well that was estimated at \$1,550,000 in the Pool 6 Lands Waterfront Master Plan for the entire Pool 6 site. This is not included in the trail cost, but will be required to be completed before the trail can be constructed.

NOW Park Spur Segment

The 1.2 km multi-use spur trail from Pool 6 to NOW Park will bring trail users along the waterfront and finger piers that were constructed into Lake Superior as environmental mitigation measures to create fish and wildlife habitat in response to historical contaminants in the Thunder Bay Harbour at this site. Perimeter fencing will be required where the trail runs adjacent to industrial lands. This will require negotiations with third party property owners and is estimated at \$2,200,000.

Planning and Design

Environmental assessment and design work can be completed to get the McKellar River Bridge, Richardson Terminal Bridge, and Sleeping Giant Parkway new alignment projects shovel ready. This is estimated at \$500,000. As well discussions can be started with private property owners and property acquisitions completed where owners are willing.

Intermediate Term (6-10 years) [Total estimate: \$2,710,000]

Mission Island Segment

If CP Rail agrees to allow a pedestrian facility on the Jackknife Bridge, this would be prioritized as it would provide a direct connection from the City to the trail section to be developed on

Mission Island this year. Costs of the preferred preliminary design option in 2002 was \$800,000 which would be \$1,200,000 in 2021 dollars. Additional work would be required on the approaches and to tie this into the trail starting at Island Drive, including creation of shoulder facilities and safe rail crossings. The high level cost estimate for this work is \$2,000,000.

Island Drive South Segment

Island Drive from the McKellar River Bridge north to the floodway crossing will have the paved cross section widened to provide either bi-directional or uni-directional shoulder facilities. A new pedestrian crossover would be provided on the south side of the floodway bridge. The cost estimate for this pavement widening is \$250,000.

Intercity Segment

Main Street from Island Drive to the Main Street bridge will be provided with a 3 m wide paved shoulder to allow a bi-directional trail. A pedestrian crossover will be installed at Hammond Street to provide a safe crossing for users. The cost to complete this work is estimated at \$200,000.

Mouth of the Current River Segment

Shipyard Drive north of Richardson's Terminal is a low volume road with a bridge over the Current River. It is proposed to leave this section of road as is and sign the trail. This brings users to Lorne Allard Fisherman's Park. Wayfinding signage is estimated at \$10,000.

A significant connection that would join the Waterfront Trail with the City's Current River Greenway trails including the multi-use trail loop around Boulevard Lake is the widening of the sidewalk on Grenville Avenue under the rail bridge. The cost of this sidewalk, transition, paint marks and related signage is \$250,000.

Long Term (10+ years)[Total estimate: over \$14,300,000]

McKellar River Bridge

This structure is owned by CP Rail and is currently designed as a lift bridge due to the historic designation of the McKellar River as a navigable waterway. The City owns and maintains the road deck. In the short term it is proposed that trail users share this bridge with vehicular traffic, but in the long term it would be beneficial to provide a separate structure for trail users. The McKellar River Bridge is a single point of failure in the supply chain of fuel to the City and region. To mitigate this, it is proposed that the structure that is constructed for trail users be designed to pass one way tanker traffic if necessary to provide emergency redundancy in the transportation system. The cost of this enhanced multi-use bridge and approaches is estimated at \$6,500,000. This estimate assumes that McKellar River is not determined to be navigational going forward. Property acquisition may be required and would add to this estimate as well.

Hammond/Maureen Segment

The Waterfront Trail alignment along Hammond Avenue and Maureen Street is through the City's industrial operating waterfront. A bi-directional shoulder facility is proposed that will

require the widening of a drainage structure and the establishment of numerous safe crossings of railway spur lines. At this time no adjustment to the rail crossing protection has been contemplated. The cost to complete this work is estimated at \$950,000.

Sleeping Giant Parkway South Segment

South of Pool 6 to Maureen Street, Administration needs to obtain property for a Sleeping Giant Parkway alignment that would include both road and trail facilities. A conceptual alignment has been developed that provides another connection into the marina from the Central Avenue Overpass. A Municipal Class Environmental Assessment with public consultation is required as part of the planning for this project. Planning and design work can be completed in the short term for this project, with property acquisition to follow. Costs of this cannot be estimated until the consultation is completed and the alignment is finalized.

North Water Street Segment

North of Prince Arthur's Landing will be signed to approximately Richardson Terminal in 2021. Minor widening and shifting of the road alignment will be made in the future to allow for a bidirectional trail along the water side of Marina Park Drive to the lookout at MacDougall Street. This would be considered when redevelopment of the Great West Timber site commences. The cost of the minor widening work is \$350,000. Cost of developing a trail through the Great West Timber site cannot be estimated until the alignment and scope is negotiated with the property owner.

Bridge at Richardson Terminal

A significant barrier to the Waterfront Trail exists at the Richardson Terminal. A bridge is required to have trail users navigate safety over the spur lines into Richardson's that are often occupied by trains. A preliminary concept has been developed that includes significant fill sections and retaining walls for the approaches to meet accessibility requirements for the approach grades and also to maintain the structure on available City land. The cost estimate for this structure is \$6,500,000.



Memorandum

TO:	Krista Power City Clerk
FROM:	Kayla Dixon, P. Eng., MBA Director of Engineering & Operations
DATE:	June 2, 2021
SUBJECT:	Report No. R 75/2021, Waterfront Trail Long Term Plan Request to Present Information – June 14, 2021 COW Meeting

We request the opportunity to provide a presentation relative to Report No 75/2021, Waterfront Trail Long Term Plan, to the Committee of the Whole at the meeting on Monday, June 14, 2021. With the assistance of Werner Schwar, Supervisor-Parks & Open Space Planning and Guy Walter, Landscape Architect, we will provide a brief presentation in regards to the long term plan.

Sincerely,

Kayla Dixon Director of Engineering & Operations

cc: Dana Earle- Deputy City Clerk Gordon Stover- Committee & Meeting Management System Coordinator Werner Schwar- Supervisor-Parks & Open Space Planning Guy Walter-Landscape Architect



Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/	Infrastructure & Operations	REPORT NO.	R 90/2021
DIVISION	1		
DIVISION			
DATE PREPARED	06/03/2021	FILE NO.	
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
SUBJECT	Waterfront Development Committee	- Terms of Refere	nce

RECOMMENDATION

For information only.

LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN

Council's 2019-2022 Strategic Plan, *One City, Growing Together*, includes a focus on city building under the Grow pillar. More specifically, the Plan includes strategic actions to develop key city infrastructure such as the first phase of the Waterfront Trail and support for construction of a new Thunder Bay Art Gallery to "further the ongoing development of a vibrant cultural scene on the waterfront, with a strong economic base."

DISCUSSION

The Waterfront Development Committee was created in 2005 to respond to the City's strategic plan for the waterfront and the development of Prince Arthur's Landing.

Council's advisory committee provided for recommendations and ensured that the priorities of Council and the public were considered within this project which spanned over many years. In 2018, it was deemed that the Waterfront Development Committee was no longer required and that City Council would approve and make recommendations to future waterfront related work.

Council's 2019-2022 Strategic Plan has focus on city building including specific key infrastructure on the waterfront: Phase One of the Waterfront Trail and the new Thunder Bay Art Gallery. In keeping with Council's direction, Administration has a number of waterfront projects underway including three sections of the Waterfront Trail, efforts to secure funding for work to clean up (i.e. rubble removal), landscape and improve access, lighting and security at the Pool 6 lands in preparation for planned cruise ship arrivals over the next several years, and renewal of the Pedestrian Overpass. Funding has also been sought to make improvement to the festival area and there is an ongoing north core streetscape study to provide options and develop a more vibrant north core. Ongoing development of the waterfront requires significant resources and Administration advises additional capacity will be required if Council re-establishes the Waterfront Development Committee. Optimally, this would include re-establishing the Waterfront Development Office at an initial estimated cost of \$150,000 per year. Should Council provide direction to proceed, administration will consider how to offset this priority in development of the 2022 budget.

The key change proposed to the Terms of Reference is to focus the work of the Committee on Prince Arthur's Landing and Phase two of the Waterfront Development. This would extend from the Marina Park Overpass south to the Pool 6 lands. The Committee will also advise on continued development of the waterfront trail. The overall vision for the waterfront — connected, year-round and ours to celebrate - has been established by the previous Waterfront Development Committee in consultation with the community. The first phase of implementation was the creation of Prince Arthur's Landing and the next phase was to move out from the initial development to the adjacent lands to maximize the impact of further investments and to best use finite resources. A further change is to hold stakeholder consultation annually rather than biannually given that waterfront development work is now well advanced.

Administration recommends reducing Council representation on the Committee from five (5) members of Council to two (2) Members of Council. The City Clerk is currently undertaking a review of Council representation on Committees and will report back to Council in October. Should Council decide to re-establish the Waterfront Development Committee in 2022, it is recommended and that Office of the City Clerk consider further administrative implications in the report back this fall on Council Committees.

FINANCIAL IMPACT

Subject to Council's determination regarding re-establishing the Committee, the financial impact of adding this committee for administrative support through the Office of the City Clerk will be reported by the City Clerk in October. Further, administration would consider through the budget review how to offset the estimated to cost of \$150,000 annually to advance work on the waterfront in consultation with the committee.

CONCLUSION

Should Council decide to re-establish the Waterfront Development Committee, the attached Terms of Reference are provided for consideration. There is a financial and resource impact as described in this report and the recommendations of the City Clerk in October will provide further information in this regard.

BACKGROUND

At the March 29, 2021, Committee of the Whole, Administration was directed to report back to Council on or before June 21, 2021, with respect to any changes that would be necessary to the Terms of Reference for the Waterfront Development Committee to continue its work and the associated administrative impact and financial considerations.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:

Attachment A – Proposed Terms of Reference – Waterfront Development Committee Attachment B - 2012 Terms of Reference – Waterfront Development Committee (presented in Report No. 2012.171)

PREPARED BY: Karen Lewis, General Manager – Development & Emergency Services and Kerri Marshall, General Manager – Infrastructure & Operations

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)	DATE:
Kerri Marshall, General Manager – Infrastructure & Operations	June 4, 2021

WATERFRONT DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Presented to Committee of the Whole – June 14, 2021 Ratified by City Council – TBD

1. Name of Committee

The Committee shall be named the "Waterfront Development Committee". The accepted acronym will be WDC.

2. Background and Assumptions

Background:

By resolution in Committee of the Whole on (*insert date*), the Waterfront Development Committee (The Committee) was established to act in an advisory capacity to City Council on the development of the City of Thunder Bay waterfront – including Prince Arthur's Landing and Phase two of the Waterfront Development. This would extend from the Marina Park Overpass south to the Pool 6 lands. The Committee will also advise on continued development of the waterfront trail. *Assumptions:*

It is assumed that:

• It is in the best interests of the community at large and the City to have mixed use development of the waterfront lands that is deliberate, proactive and responsive to the needs of the community.

Objectives:

- To provide advice and recommendations to City Council concerning the visioning, long-term planning and development of the Thunder Bay Waterfront including Prince Arthur's Landing and Phase two of the Waterfront Development
- To provide advice and recommendations to City Council on waterfront service level standards.
- To analyze options of ongoing governance of the waterfront and to make recommendations to City Council on the same.
- To consult with specific user groups and interested parties in order to facilitate a coordinated flow of information between stakeholders and City Council.

- To provide City Council and City Administration with advice concerning public interest issues and approaches to keeping the public informed about the waterfront projects.
- To act as ambassadors for waterfront development with the general public.

3. Membership and Responsibilities

The Committee is comprised of two (2) Members of Council appointed by resolution of Council plus five (5) members of the community at large appointed by resolution of Council. Community members of the Committee will be appointed to staggered four year terms to ensure an overlap of terms and continuity of experience. Council representatives shall be appointed for their elected term at the discretion of City Council.

The General Manager – Infrastructure & Operations will provide direction as required regarding allocation of resources and adherence to strategic objectives. The General Manager of Infrastructure & Operations (or designate) will be the key administrative resource to the Committee.

Voting on motions and questions before the Committee and the general proceedings of the Committee is in accordance with the general procedural rules for City Council and its Committees. All appointed members have one vote each. The voting members of the Committee select a Chair and Vice Chair annually. Quorum for meetings requires more than half of the voting members to be present. Although the Mayor is an ex-officio member, he/she has exactly the same rights and privileges as do all other members, including the right to vote. The City Clerk's representative is the assigned Council & Committee Clerk, who provides administrative support including coordinating the distribution of agendas and minutes, correspondence to and on behalf of members, and booking of meeting rooms, etc.

4. Deliverables

Annually, The Committee will update and approve a two-year Work Plan with timelines and key priorities to guide Committee activities.

The Committee will review the accomplishments of the Deliverables on an annual basis.

The Committee will keep informed of development within scope and advise City Council as to any issues of potential public concern or potential deviations from the approved vision or plan for the waterfront.

On an annual basis, the Committee will host a roundtable of stakeholders to gather information about stakeholder projects, and to facilitate networking among stakeholders.

The Committee will actively recruit and recommend new members to City Council when vacancies arise, and will provide orientation for new appointments.

5. Term of the Committee

The term of the Committee will conclude with the term of Council and be subject to renewal under the terms of Policy 03-03-08.

The review process will be guided by Administration and involve the Committee as a whole.

6. Attendance

Members will attend all regularly scheduled meetings as is reasonably possible, advising the assigned Council & Committee Clerk in advance of any absence prior to the meeting.

If a community member misses three or more meetings per year without advising the assigned Council & Committee Clerk, their membership will be subject to review by the Chair.

7. Contact

The Administrative Contact for the Committee is the General Manager of Infrastructure & Operations (or designate).

Correspondence and agenda material are to be directed to the assigned Council & Committee Clerk in the Office of the City Clerk.

Each Committee member is asked to make sure that his or her contact information is kept current with the Council & Committee Clerk.

Page 191 of 201

.

WATERFRONT DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Presented to Committee of the Whole – December 10, 2012 Ratified by City Council – December 17, 2012

1. Name of Committee

The Committee shall be named the "Waterfront Development Committee".

2. Background and Assumptions

Background:

By resolution in Committee of the Whole on December 12, 2005, the Waterfront Development Committee (The Committee) was established to act in an advisory capacity to City Council on the development of the City of Thunder Bay waterfront. The'waterfront' is considered to be all lands abutting Lake Superior and its tributaries within the boundaries of the City of Thunder Bay.

Assumptions:

It is assumed that:

• It is in the best interests of the community at large and the City to have development of the waterfront lands that is deliberate and vigorous and responsive to the needs of the community.

Objectives:

- To provide advice and recommendations to Council concerning the planning and development of the Thunder Bay waterfront.
- To consult with specific user groups and interested parties in order to facilitate a coordinated flow of information with stakeholders.
- To recommend to City Council strategies that will enable the waterfront to be developed to its full mixed use potential.

- To provide City Council and City Administration with advice concerning public interest issues and approaches to keeping the public informed about the waterfront projects.
- To provide City Council and City Administration with advice concerning whether the approved vision and design principles are being met.
- To act as ambassadors for waterfront development in the general public.

2. Membership and Responsibilities

The Committee is comprised of four Members of Council plus the Mayor (exofficio), effective with the 2010 Council, appointed by resolution of Council plus five members of the community at large appointed by Council. Community members of The Committee will be appointed to staggered four year terms to ensure an overlap of terms and continuity of experience. Council representatives shall be appointed for their elected term or annually, at the discretion of City Council.

Reporting directly to City Council, the City Manager will have executive oversight responsibility for waterfront development projects and provide direction to the General Manager of Infrastructure & Operations (or designate) and others as required regarding allocation of resources and adherence to strategic objectives. The General Manager of Infrastructure & Operations (or designate) will be the key administrative resource to the Waterfront Development Committee. The City Manager or the General Manager of Infrastructure & Operations (or designate) will direct additional staff resources to support the Committee, as needed.

Voting on motions and questions before the Committee and the general proceedings of the Committee is in accordance with the general procedural rules for Council and its Committees. All appointed members have one vote each. The voting members of the Committee select a Chair and Vice Chair annually. Quorum for meetings requires more than half of the voting members to be present. Although the Mayor is an exofficio member, he/she has exactly the same rights and privileges as do all other members, including the right to vote. The City Clerk's representative is the Clerk to the Committee and provides administrative support including coordinating the distribution of agendas and minutes, correspondence to and on behalf of members, and booking of meeting rooms, etc.

3. Deliverables

- The Committee will meet with stakeholder groups to promote the vision, gather input, and make recommendations to City Council on priorities for projects and initiatives for the Thunder Bay waterfront.
- The Committee will make recommendations on public communication strategies.
- The Committee will review design and development proposals for Prince Arthur's Landing at key stages in the implementation plan and advise Council as to any issues of potential public concern or potential deviations from the approved vision.
- To evaluate potential uses of the Pool 6 lands and make recommendations to City Council.

4. Term of the Committee

The term of the Waterfront Development Committee will conclude with the term of Council and be subject to renewal under the terms of Policy 03-03-08.

Annually, the Waterfront Development Committee will review the accomplishment of the objectives set out in its Terms of Reference. The review process will be guided by Administration and involve the Committee as a whole.

5. Contact

The Administrative Contact for the Waterfront Development Committee is the General Manager of Infrastructure & Operations (or designate). Each Committee member is asked to make sure that his or her contact information is kept current with the Committee Coordinator.

ADDENDUM NO. 1

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

MEMBERS OF COUNCIL (4):	TERM EXPIRY	
Councillor Mark Bentz	Current Term of Council	November 30, 2014
Councillor Andrew Foulds	Current Term of Council	November 30, 2014
Councillor Brian McKinnon	Current Term of Council	November 30, 2014
Councillor Aldo Ruberto	Current Term of Council	November 30, 2014

Ex-Officio (1):	TERM EXPIRY	
Mayor Keith Hobbs	Current Term of Council	November 30, 2014

CITIZEN MEMBERS	(5)	:
------------------------	-----	---

Mr. Marcus Luft Ms. Anne Ostrom Ms. Cindy Crowe Mr. Wilfred King Mr. Norman Lavoie TERM EXPIRY

12
12
13
14
14

Resource/Administration:

City Manager General Manager – Infrastructure & Operations (or designate)

ADMINISTRATIVE RESOURCE:

Committee Coordinator, Office of the City Clerk (City Clerk's Representative)



Corporate Report

DEPARTMENT/	Infrastructure & Operations -	REPORT NO.	R 70/2021
DIVISION	Engineering & Operations		
DATE PREPARED	05/13/2021	FILE NO.	
MEETING DATE	06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)		
SUBJECT	Contract 9, 2021- Sewer and Watern	nain III	

RECOMMENDATION

WITH RESPECT to Report R 70/2021 (Infrastructure & Operations – Engineering & Operations), we recommend that Contract 9, 2021 - Sewer and Watermain III be awarded to Menei Brothers Contracting, which submitted the lowest tender in the amount of \$2,581,811.57 (inclusive of HST); it being noted that the amount shown is based on estimated quantities; final payment for this Contract will be based on measured quantities for the complete work;

AND THAT the General Manager of Infrastructure and Operations report significant variations in the Contract quantities to City Council;

AND THAT the Mayor and Clerk be authorized to sign all documentation related to this matter;

AND THAT any necessary by-laws be presented to City Council for ratification.

LINK TO STRATEGIC PLAN

This report directly supports the Renew pillar of the 2019-2022 Corporate Strategic Plan, focusing on essential infrastructure. This project includes the replacement of sewer and water infrastructure based on the Engineering Division's asset management plan.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The 2021 Capital Budget provides funds for rehabilitation of roads, watermains, sanitary sewers and new sidewalks on Hill Street and River Street. There were four (4) tenders received for this work. The low tender for this Contract is Menei Brothers Contracting. Administration is recommending award of this Contract to this company.

DISCUSSION

As a result of a call for Tender, four (4) responses as listed below were received for Contract 9, 2021 – Sewer and Water III.

Contractor	Opening Bid	Corrected Bid
Makkinga Contractors	\$2,596,311.41	
Bay City Contractors	\$2,609,770.03	
Nadin Contracting	\$2,625,625.20	\$2,652,625.28
Menei Brothers	\$2,807,427.37	\$2,581,811.57

The tendered costs include the applicable HST. Bids have been checked for mathematical errors and the corrections noted.

The pre-tender estimate for the work in this Contract was \$2,650,000.00 (inclusive of HST).

The 2021 Capital Budget includes funds to replace the existing 100 year old sanitary sewer and watermain on Hill St. between Inchiquin St. and Oliver Rd. The project also involves installing a new storm sewer at the Queen St. and Hill St. intersection and constructing additional new storm sewer on Queen St. to tie in to the existing storm sewer at Winnipeg Ave. All existing lead services will be renewed to the property line. The existing curbed areas will have new curb and gutter constructed and the road will be resurfaced over the limits of the project.

The second part of this project involves the rehabilitation of River St. from Cumberland St. to Algoma St. The watermain on the lower block between Cumberland St. and Court St. will have the watermain replaced and upsized from a 150mm diameter pipe to a 300mm diameter pipe. This is to provide better fire protection within the area. The work over the two blocks will be to strip the existing curb and gutter and all asphalt and replace it with new concrete curb and gutter and resurface. Street lighting will also be upgraded in the area.

The lowest tender received for this Contract was from Menei Brothers Contracting. They have completed numerous sewer, water and road projects for the City. Administration is recommending this company as being capable of carrying out all the work within this Contract. The work is expected to start in June 2021 and continue until scheduled completion at the end of October 2021.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATION

The 2021 Capital Budget along with carry forward accounts include sufficient funding for this work.

The following table breaks down the project costs:

PROJECTED COSTS	BREAKDOWN
Contract Tender Price	\$2,581,811.57

HST Rebate		\$256,810.28
	Subtotal	\$2,325,001.29
Engineering Costs		\$125,000.00
	TOTAL	\$2,450,001.29

This Contract includes a contingency allowance for work that is unforeseen and can only be expended with the approval of the General Manager of Infrastructure and Operations.

CONCLUSION

It is concluded that Contract 9, 2021 – Sewer and Water III should be awarded to the low tender Menei Brothers Contracting and that all work should proceed.

BACKGROUND

Report R1/2021, (Corporate Services and Long Term Care – Financial Services) proposed 2021 Operations and Capital Budget includes funding to carry out road, storm, sanitary sewer and watermain reconstruction projects. The 2021 Capital Budget includes rate based funding to carry out watermain and sanitary sewer reconstruction for aging infrastructure within the City of Thunder Bay. It also contains tax supported funding for resurfacing and storm sewer works.

REFERENCE MATERIAL ATTACHED:

None.

PREPARED BY: BRIAN NEWMAN, P.ENG., PROJECT ENGINEER

THIS REPORT SIGNED AND VERIFIED BY: (NAME OF GENERAL MANAGER)	DATE:
Kerri Marshall, General Manager – Infrastructure & Operations	June 4, 2021



MEETING DATE 06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)

SUBJECT Contract 12, 2021- Solid Waste and Recycling Facility-Phase II Leachate Collection System Extension

SUMMARY

Report R 86/2021 (Infrastructure & Operations - Engineering) relative to the above noted. (Distributed Separately)



MEETING DATE 06/14/2021 (mm/dd/yyyy)

SUBJECT Report on the Feasibility of Selling the Parkades

SUMMARY

Memorandum from Mr. J. DePeuter, Manager - Realty Services and Mr. J. Paske, Supervisor – Parking Authority, dated June 2, 2021 advising that the above noted report is being postponed to the July 26, 2021 Committee of the Whole meeting.

ATTACHMENTS

1 Memorandum from J. DePeuter

Development & Emergency Services

Victoriaville Civic Centre, 2nd Floor 111 Syndicate Avenue South Thunder Bay, ON P7C 5K4

TO: Dana Earle, Deputy City Clerk

- **FROM:** Joel DePeuter, Manager Realty Services Jonathan Paske, Supervisor – Parking Authority
- **DATE:** June 2, 2021
- **RE:** Report on the feasibility of selling the Parkades

On February 8, 2021, Council directed Administration to prepare a report on the feasibility of divesting ownership and proceeding with the sale of both the Waterfront and Victoriaville Parkades and that this report be received by June 14, 2021.

Due to scheduling difficulties, this report is being postponed to the July 26 meeting.